Implementing Educational Policies in Tanzania

C. J. Galabawa
## Recent World Bank Discussion Papers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Tenancy in South Asia.</td>
<td>Inderjit Singh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Land and Labor in South Asia.</td>
<td>Inderjit Singh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Global Trends in Real Exchange Rates.</td>
<td>Adrian Wood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Income Distribution and Economic Development in Malawi: Some Historical Perspectives.</td>
<td>Frederic L. Pryor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>Income Distribution and Economic Development in Madagascar: Some Historical Perspectives.</td>
<td>Frederic L. Pryor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>Quality Controls of Traded Commodities and Services in Developing Countries.</td>
<td>Simon Rottenberg and Bruce Yandle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>Livestock Production in North Africa and the Middle East: Problems and Perspectives.</td>
<td>John C. Glenn [Also available in French (39F)]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>Nongovernmental Organizations and Local Development.</td>
<td>Michael M. Cernea [Also available in Spanish (40S)]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>Patterns of Development: 1950 to 1983.</td>
<td>Moises Syquín and Holis Chenery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>Voluntary Debt-Reduction Operations: Bolivia, Mexico, and Beyond...</td>
<td>Ruben Lamdany</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>Fertility in Sub-Saharan Africa: Analysis and Explanation.</td>
<td>Susan Cochrane and S. M. Farid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>Adjustment Programs and Social Welfare.</td>
<td>Elaine Zuckerman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>Primary School Teachers' Salaries in Sub-Saharan Africa.</td>
<td>Manuel Zymelman and Joseph DeStefano</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>Contract Plans and Public Enterprise Performance.</td>
<td>John Nellis [Also available in French (48F)]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>Improving Nutrition in India: Policies and Programs and Their Impact.</td>
<td>K. Subbarao</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>Lessons of Financial Liberalization in Asia: A Comparative Study.</td>
<td>Yoon-Je Cho and Deena Khatkhate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td>Vocational Education and Training: A Review of World Bank Investment.</td>
<td>John Middleton and Terry Densky</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td>Pathways to Change: Improving the Quality of Education in Developing Countries.</td>
<td>Adriaan Verspoor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54</td>
<td>Education Managers for Business and Government.</td>
<td>Samuel Paul, Jacob Levitsky, and John C. Ickis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td>Subsidies and Countervailing Measures: Critical Issues for the Uruguay Round.</td>
<td>Bela Balassa, editor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>57</td>
<td>The Management of Common Property Natural Resources.</td>
<td>Daniel W. Bromley and Michael M. Cernea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58</td>
<td>Making the Poor Creditworthy: A Case Study of the Integrated Rural Development Program in India.</td>
<td>Robert Pulley</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60</td>
<td>Fighting Malnutrition: Evaluation of Brazilian Food and Nutrition Programs.</td>
<td>Philip Musgrove</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*(Continued on the inside back cover.)*
Implementing Educational Policies in Tanzania
World Bank Discussion Papers
Africa Technical Department Series

Studies on Implementation of African Educational Policies

No. 82  Why Educational Policies Can Fail: An Overview of Selected African Experiences
No. 83  Comparative African Experiences in Implementing Educational Policies
No. 84  Implementing Educational Policies in Ethiopia
No. 85  Implementing Educational Policies in Kenya
No. 86  Implementing Educational Policies in Tanzania
No. 87  Implementing Educational Policies in Lesotho
No. 88  Implementing Educational Policies in Swaziland
No. 89  Implementing Educational Policies in Uganda
No. 90  Implementing Educational Policies in Zambia
No. 91  Implementing Educational Policies in Zimbabwe

The set of studies on implementation of African educational policies was edited by Mr. George Psacharopoulos. Mr. Psacharopoulos wishes to acknowledge the help of Professor G. Eshiwani, who beyond being the author of the case study on Kenya (see No. 85) has coordinated the production of the other case studies in the region.
FOREWORD

The decades of the 1960s and 1970s witnessed dramatic quantitative growth in African education systems. Beyond expanding educational places, many African countries pronounced intentions to "reform" their educational systems, by adjusting the length of education cycles, altering the terms of access to educational opportunity, changing the curriculum content, or otherwise attempting to link the provision of education and training more closely to perceived requirements for national socio-economic development. Strong economic growth performances of most African economies encouraged optimistic perceptions of the ability of governments to fulfill educational aspirations which were set forth in educational policy pronouncements.

Sadly, the adverse economic conditions of the 1980s, combined with population growth rates which are among the highest in the world meant that by the early 1980s, education enrollment growth stalled and the quality of education at all levels was widely regarded as having deteriorated. In recognition of the emerging crisis in African education, the World Bank undertook a major review to diagnose the problems of erosion of quality and stagnation of enrollments. Emerging from that work was a policy study, Education in Sub-Saharan Africa: Policies for Adjustment, Revitalization, and Expansion, which was issued in 1988. That study does not prescribe one set of education policies for all of Sub-Saharan Africa. Rather, it presents a framework within which countries may formulate strategies tailored to their own needs and circumstances. In fact, a central point which is stressed in the study is the need for each country to develop its own country-specific education strategy and policies, taking into account the country's unique circumstances, resource endowment and national cultural heritage.

The crucial role of national strategies and policies cannot be over-emphasized. In recognition of the centrality of sound policies as a basis for progress, in 1987 the Bank's Education and Training Department (the relevant unit responsible for the policy, planning and research function at that time) commissioned a set of papers by African analysts on the comparative experiences of eight Anglophone Eastern and Southern African countries, each of which had developed and issued major education policy reforms or pronouncements. The papers give special attention to deficiencies in the design and/or implementation processes that account for the often-yawning gaps between policy intentions and outcomes. The lessons afforded by the eight African case studies, along with a broader-perspective assessment of educational policy implementation, are presented in the papers by George Psacharopoulos (the overall manager of the set of studies) and John Craig. The eight country case studies are presented in companion reports.

By disseminating this set of studies on the implementation of African educational policies, it is hoped that the lessons of experience will be incorporated into the current efforts by African countries to design and implement national policies and programs to adjust, revitalize and selectively expand the education and training systems which prepare Africa's human resources, the true cornerstone of African development.

Hans Wyss
Director
Technical Department
Africa Region
ABSTRACT

Of the three East African British colonies (Kenya, Uganda, and Tanzania), Tanzania was the least well off at the time of independence in 1961. At that time, only 16,691 students were enrolled in secondary schools, and all general educational at higher levels was provided outside the country. Thus, the goals of post-independence educational policy were the distribution and equalization of educational opportunities and the expansion of the system at all levels, including the attainment of universal primary education. This report reviews the initial evolution and implementation of educational policies through government five-year development plans. From 1969-1978, the Education for Self-Reliance (ESR) program became the basis for all major educational policy changes. The final section of the report evaluates the implementation and success of educational policies and finds that the emphasis on achieving universal primary education has led to a system where there are secondary school places for only 4 percent of primary school graduates. The author reviews the financial and macroeconomic circumstances, educational theories and internal and external efficiency criteria that inform the debate about educational quality and ESR, which stressed that education should help to promote a socialist transformation of society, and which emphasized preparation for rural and community life over theoretical knowledge, particularly at the primary level. The report finds that some policy objectives were contradictory and that, in the short run, quantitative and efficiency objectives have been incompatible.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. EDUCATION AND THE ECONOMY ........................................... 1

2. HISTORICAL OBSERVATIONS ............................................. 3

3. EXPANSION AND EXTENSION OF FORMAL SCHOOLING POLICIES ........... 5

4. SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT POLICIES .......................... 7

5. POLITICAL AND QUALITATIVE CHANGE POLICIES .......................... 10

6. EVALUATION AND EFFECTIVENESS POLICIES ................................. 13

7. AN APPRAISAL OF THE POLICIES ........................................... 15
   - Expansion and Enrollment .............................................. 15
   - Quality of Education .................................................. 17
   - Education and Production ............................................. 18
   - Manpower and Self-sufficiency ....................................... 19
   - Financial Implications and Dependency ............................... 22
   - Employment and Rural Development .................................. 23

8. COST BENEFIT ISSUES ..................................................... 25

9. CONCLUSION ............................................................... 27

BIBLIOGRAPHY ........................................................................ 28
In economic terms, Tanzania is one of the poorest countries in the world. With a population of slightly more than 20 million, and a GNP at 1966 constant prices of around 10.5 million U.S. dollars in 1983, the per capita income is approximated as slightly lower than 300 U.S. dollars. In a country with so low an income per head, educational policies must be formulated with reference to their effect on the economy and the poor majority. However, since the capacity of the economy to provide resources for education is low, the educational policies must be judged not only according to their stated objectives, but also according to efficiency criteria.

### Table 1

**Typology of Tanzania Educational Policies**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristic Features</th>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Policy/Instrument(s)</th>
<th>Objectives/Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Expansion and extension of formal schooling</td>
<td>1961-1969</td>
<td>1) Education Ordinance of 1961</td>
<td>- Integration and equalizational opportunities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Free entry over and above remission of fees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Uniform primary curriculum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Expansion of enrollment especially at primary level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3) Nyerere's Address to Parliament, May 12, 1965</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4) Prime Minister's Directive on workers education (1973)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Characteristic Features</td>
<td>Period</td>
<td>Policy/Instrument(s)</td>
<td>Objectives/Remarks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political and Qualitative</td>
<td>1967-</td>
<td>1) Education for self-reliance</td>
<td>Nationalization and control of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>change</td>
<td></td>
<td>2) Education Act of 1969</td>
<td>education and control of schooling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3) Formation of Directorate of Curriculum and Examination(s) (1967-1970s)</td>
<td>and control of education and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4) Institute of Education</td>
<td>production</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5) Examinations Council (1975)</td>
<td>Curriculum structuring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluate and efficiency</td>
<td>1970s</td>
<td>1) Musoma Resolutions (1974)</td>
<td>Universal Primary Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2) Education Act (1978)</td>
<td>Education and production</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Changes in Examination system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Evaluation of ESR</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author’s research
2. HISTORICAL OBSERVATIONS

Of the three East African British colonies (Kenya, Uganda and Tanzania), Tanzania was the least favored in terms of broad industrial and social development. This was due to several interrelated factors (Rweyemamu, 1970). Firstly, foreign investment tended to flow to Kenya rather than to Tanzania. The British settlers in Kenya were a well established pressure group in London, while Tanzania's settlers were of mixed nationalities, without a cohesive force. Moreover, during the inter-war period and even during the depression, Tanzania was merely a conquered territory with less value to Britain since its economy had been partly molded to suit the needs of the German market. After Hitler came to power and threatened to reconquer Germany's lost colonies, the uncertain status of Tanzania worsened. The British administration's pessimism about the risk of investment opportunities and the neighboring "periphery-center" pressures favoring Kenya through a common market arrangement gave full play; industries and other infrastructural developments tended to be established in Kenya.

The above picture was also reflected in the education system. Colonial administrators blocked the expansion of secondary and higher education for Africans, despite the latter's growing demand for education "equal" to that of Europeans and Asians (Mbilinyi, 1979). In fact, very few Africans went beyond two years of basic education (reading, arithmetic, vocational training, catechism). The major objectives of education provision were to adapt the African to the colonial system of exploitation and the developing of a favored group comprising children of chiefs and wealthy individuals who could later administer the Africans at the local levels (Lawuo, 1984).

Colonial education was run on a racial basis. The European schools consumed the largest share of public funds (Meena, 1979). The African schools were allocated the smallest share of financial resources as compared to Europeans and Asians. The figures shown in Table 2 indicate that Europeans were favored in terms of enrollment, and unit costs.

At independence in 1961, only 16,691 students were enrolled in secondary schools, as compared with 9,883 in 1957 and 1,529 in 1947 (Muze, 1976). Few
courses were offered at high school levels. And for the forty years that the British had ruled Tanganyika, general education at higher levels was provided outside the country. The main institutions to which the few Tanganyikan Africans went were Makerere College in Uganda, the Royal Technical College in Nairobi, Kenya, and overseas British universities.
3. EXPANSION AND EXTENSION OF FORMAL SCHOOLING POLICIES

The major policies adopted after independence had the following objectives: First, were the policies whose major objectives were to distribute and equalize educational opportunities. Second, were the policies whose main objectives were expansion of educational institutions at all levels (primary, secondary and university schooling).

Table 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>School Enrollment</th>
<th>Representation in Percent</th>
<th>Per Student Costs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Africans</td>
<td>5,480,391</td>
<td>113,198</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>£ 2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asians</td>
<td>50,332</td>
<td>9,831</td>
<td>19.5</td>
<td>£ 5.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Europeans</td>
<td>14,727</td>
<td>958</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>37.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Estimates

The Education Ordinance of 1961 established the policy of a racially integrated school system controlled and managed by the government and voluntary agencies. To equalize access, school fees were controlled, although the majority of secondary students still came from high income families. English and Swahili became the sole medium of instruction in 1965. However, by 1968, Swahili was adopted as the medium for all primary schools, although some private "English" medium primary schools still serve the interests of foreigners and wealthy Tanzanians.

The Three Year Development Plan for Tanganyika, 1961-1964, and the First Five Year Plan (FFYP) of 1964-1969 emphasized expansion of secondary and higher education. In 1961, the University College of Dar-es-Salaam opened with a Faculty of Law. Later a crash program was started at the University College of Dar-es-Salaam, under the Department of Education, to produce Tanzanian graduate teachers for secondary schools and teacher training colleges.
So as to provide equal access to secondary education, school fees were abolished in 1964. However, primary school fees remained until 1973 as they were considered minimal compared to secondary school fees. However, as observed by Mbilinyi (1976), since primary school fees restricted primary school entry to children of rich rural peasants and traders, this unequal access to primary schooling led to unequal access to secondary schooling.

For this period, the curriculum remained essentially British in outlook, although some subjects such as history, geography and political education were introduced. However, to obtain a form IV certificate, one had to pass Kiswahili.

Throughout the educational system, selection to higher levels depended on passing nationally set (or East-African Examinations in the case of secondary schools) examinations which were modeled on the Cambridge Certification Examinations. Those who failed the examination(s) were labeled failures and since the educational system itself was pyramidal, the majority of the children who could not move up had "failed."

Generally, then, after independence in 1961, the policies focused on the integration of the educational system and the equalization of educational opportunities. All forms of discrimination in education were abolished. The primary and secondary schools, which previously were divided into different schools for Africans, Asians and Europeans, became open to all children irrespective of their race, religion, sex or social background. A uniform primary school curriculum was established in order to part with the colonial practice of differentiating between the educational content for the different racial groups.
4.  SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT POLICIES

It has been shown above that the policies formulated after independence supported the general expansion and extension of formal schooling. The period 1964 to 1969 saw the emergence of policies which viewed education as an instrument of social and economic development. Two policies in this category will be reviewed: The Adult Education Policy and The Manpower Policy.

The First Five Year Plan (FFYP) of 1964-1969, the Second Five Year Plan (SFYP) of 1969-1974, and former President Nyerere's speech to Parliament on May 12, 1965, first spelled out the content and strategies of implementing adult education in Tanzania. The F.F.Y.P. and the S.F.Y.P. emphasized the major aim of adult education to be rural development. Nyerere's address to Parliament in 1965 observed that:

The purpose of government expenditure on education in coming years must be to equip Tanganyika with the skills and the knowledge which is needed if the development of the country is to be achieved ... first we must educate adults. Our children will not have an impact on our economic development for five, ten or even twenty years.

Some of the specific objectives of adult education as given by Mlekwa (1975) included: to learn national plans for economic advance; to reject bad houses and preventable diseases; to learn how to increase productivity on the farms and in factories; and lastly, to learn about better food and balanced diet and how to obtain it by own efforts.

The enrollment of illiterates in adult classes rose steadily from 908,351 in 1971 to 5,184,982 in 1975, as shown in Table 3. Besides developing numeracy and literacy skills, the adult education policy emphasized functional literacy programs: simultaneous integration of literacy skills and vocational training in selected areas. The functional literacy program was based on the assumption that, since the subject matter of the primer is directly related to the occupation of the learners, the need to become literate takes on a meaning and a purpose (Kassam, 1979).
Table 3

Enrollment of Illiterates in Tanzania, 1971 - 1975

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Enrollment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1971</td>
<td>908,351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1972</td>
<td>1,508,204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1973</td>
<td>2,989,910</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1974</td>
<td>3,303,103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1975</td>
<td>5,184,982</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


The Tanzania Manpower Policy stemmed from the need for local manpower to fill the middle and high-level positions. The prime objective of the policy was higher education expansion after 1964 so as to fill the urgent need for skilled cadres in the various posts in government and industry. The policy's specific objectives, as given in both the F.F.Y.P. and the S.F.Y.P., were:

a) achievement of full sufficiency at all skill levels in the economy by 1980;

b) expanding secondary, technical and university education according to labor requirements; and

c) production of local science manpower for local industries with an emphasis on those sectors which had been overlooked, such as: technical and engineering, administration, business, commerce and the increasing of Category "A" personnel in agriculture and health.

Several manpower surveys were conducted to determine the requirements for skilled personnel. Among these were those surveys conducted by the World Bank (1960), UNICEF (1961) and Skorov (1966). The findings indicated that: there was a shortage of trained and qualified personnel in all sectors of the
economy, but particularly in the "A" Category jobs: senior management and civil service, doctors, engineers, teachers, etc.; and secondly, they indicated a lack of educational facilities -- staff, buildings and materials.

The overall impact of the above manpower policy was to increase enrollments at all levels of the education system, as shown in Table 4.
5. POLITICAL AND QUALITATIVE CHANGE POLICIES

Soon after the Arusha Declaration (A.D.) on socialism and self-reliance was announced in 1967 at Arusha town (hence Arusha Declaration), President Nyerere issued his paper on Education for Self-Reliance (ESR). This paper became the basis of all major educational changes in the country. Education for Self-Reliance outlines all the aims and objectives of education in Tanzania, a country which has been aspiring to build socialism.

In implementing ESR, the 1969 Education Act (now repealed by the Education Act of 1978) was introduced. At the time in 1972, the Decentralization Policy led to decentralization of schoolsvesting primary and adult education in the regional authorities, leaving the Ministry of Education to look after secondary, teacher training and higher education. The plans for education envisaged in Tanzania's Five Year Plans for economic and social development have charted out proposals, ways and means of implementing ESR.

Table 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Secondary (Public)</th>
<th>Secondary (Private)</th>
<th>University of Dar-es-Salaam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>62-63</td>
<td>581,663</td>
<td>14,175</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64-65</td>
<td>663,578</td>
<td>19,895</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70-71</td>
<td>402,413</td>
<td>31,217</td>
<td>9,961, 1,316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75-76</td>
<td>1,532,953</td>
<td>38,327</td>
<td>14,950, 2,030</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>77-78</td>
<td>2,968,773</td>
<td>41,965</td>
<td>19,213, 2,096</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80-81</td>
<td>3,271,000</td>
<td>30,162</td>
<td>3,357</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: 
2) Annual Manpower Reports to the President (several). 
The Arusha Declaration outlines the policy of education and self-reliance which became the basis of transformation of the entire socio-economic structure in Tanzania. In line with the A.D., ESR stressed that education, being part of the society, should promote a socialist transformation. It should be a preparation for the realities and needs of Tanzania and be directed toward overcoming exploitation. A clear summary of this policy is given by Sanyal (1977, pp. 76-79). He distinguishes the following four major issues:

a) The need to develop a curriculum which aims at meeting the needs of the majority to enable them to live in a predominantly rural society and also to enable them to contribute toward the improvement of life in the rural areas;

An implication of this statement for primary education was that it became a preparation for rural life in the community and not for entry to secondary schools. For secondary education, it had the same implications with regard to entering the university and both levels of education were to be complete in themselves.

b) The need to integrate education with life and with the community. The community should be involved in the school activities. Schools must be an integral part of the community to keep the students/pupils aware of their responsibilities;

c) The need to integrate theoretical knowledge with manual work and production;

According to the philosophy of ESR, every school must be engaged in productive activities, by growing their own food and having their own income from the products they sell. In this way, a contribution toward their own upkeep is made, as well as a contribution to the economy of the country.

d) The need to instill in the students attitudes of self-confidence, creativity, problem solving and scientific outlook and the need to encourage the development of an enquiring mind and ability to think for oneself.
As the document states: It must encourage the development of a basic confidence in his position as a free and equal member of the society who values and is valued by them for what he does and not for what he obtains" (Nyerere, 1968, p. 8).

Implementing ESR was not an easy task because it involved changing values and the status quo. However, the following recommendations were implemented:

a) Formation of a group of curriculum developers whose main duty was to review the curriculum and introduce relevant changes in line with the objectives of ESR. A special unit was formed in the Ministry of Education -- the Directorate for Curriculum Development and Examinations. This unit was involved in developing new curriculum and syllabi until 1975, when it was abolished and "replaced" by the present Institute of Education which became a parastatal of the Ministry of National Education with its main task being the development of curriculum for primary, secondary and teacher education. During the same period, the Examination Council was formed;

b) Establishment of the Tanzania UNICEF-UNESCO Educational Reform Project (MTUU), which started its activities in 1970 at the teacher training college. This project played a decisive role in innovating primary education through dissemination of new ideas to primary school teachers. Next to the reorientation of teachers, one of the major aims of MTUU was the integration of school and community through community school experiments which were attached to the colleges;

c) The introduction of agricultural farms and, later, broad productive activities in primary, secondary and teachers' colleges so as to give students and pupils opportunity to engage themselves in integrating theory and practice;

d) Assessment of practical work, and its relation to academic assessment and students/pupils' attitudes and values was introduced as part of a continuous assessment to compliment final and national examinations;

e) Nationalization and control of secondary schools and institutions of higher learning.
6. EVALUATION AND EFFECTIVENESS POLICIES

In November of 1974, the ruling party, Tanganyika African National Union (TANU) executive committee, meeting at the Lake Victoria town of Musoma, issued another directive known as the Musoma Resolution (MR). The document essentially evaluated the implementation and achievement of ESR.

Thus, it was mentioned that the nation had made substantial progress with, for instance, the syllabi which are used in the schools and colleges. However, it was recognized that the process of change takes a long time and that at this stage, most of the objectives had not been achieved. Although the ESR stressed the importance of a liberation from the inappropriate system of education which Tanzania had inherited, the thinking and actions were still influenced by "international standards."

Another problem was seen as the failure to transform schools so that they could become part of the economic system. Although, according to the directive, the production activities had expanded, "so far very few schools and colleges can actually show that such self-reliance activities have in fact greatly reduced the financial burden carried by the government in running their institutions" (TANU, 1974, p. 4).

The judgement of one's ability was still made on the basis of examinations only. Although ESR stressed the importance of, for instance, commitment, general behavior and other such qualities, employment policies were still directed toward the results of the examinations, which paid no attention to these attitudes. Certain steps had to be taken in order to achieve the objectives of ESR. In the M.R., the following policy statements were given:

a) Universal Primary Education (UPE) had to be achieved in 1977 instead of 1989 as was originally planned. Primary education should be universal, compulsory and free with a practical bias to mitigate rural-urban migration of school leavers. Increasing the number of teacher training colleges and primary schools was not the only way to achieve results. Alternative ways to achieve results were: teaching in turns, distance training of teachers and using secondary school students to teach in primary schools;
b) Since, by 1974, only 6% of the primary school leavers were able to obtain a place in Form I, the Executive Committee stressed the need for secondary school expansion;

c) Special technical courses for Standard 7 leavers who are not able to go to secondary schools, and technical education (being one of the specializations of secondary schools) ought to be realized. Technical education should be seen as a preparation to be self-reliant and useful to the nation as well as making men and women more reliant on themselves by getting the opportunity to increase their income;

d) The system of entry to the University had to be changed. Although the policy of ESR stated that secondary education should be self-sufficient by preparing the students for productive work, still this education was seen as a way to enter higher education. The resolution therefore required that, after secondary school and one year national service, the school leavers must work for at least two years before applying for higher education. The selection would be made not on the basis of passing examinations alone but also on the availability of positive reports and recommendations from the employer;

e) In line with the philosophy of ESR, the educational system had to be restructured so that work would become part of education in all educational institutions;

f) The integration of education and work asked for changes in the examination system. The issue of examinations was closely related to the objective of making primary and secondary education complete. The resolution required a new examination structure in which the emphasis on written examinations was to be reduced. Judgement was to be based on the combined result of the broad functions which are part of education.
7. AN APPRAISAL OF THE POLICIES

The above picture has highlighted the major educational policies advocated since independence. It is very difficult to make an evaluation of each and every policy as described because some of the policy objectives are not mutually exclusive while others are contradictory.

However, in the following pages, an attempt will be made to produce knowledge about the past value or worth of the policies. Unfortunately, we shall have to use macronegative information only. Macronegative information describes the broad causes and consequences of the policies and uses aggregate data to show why certain policies and programs do not work.

Expansion and Enrollment

Evidence as given in Table 5 indicates that the expansion policies have generated a disproportionate relationship between a fast-growing UPE enrollment and a slow post-primary institutional expansion. The transition rate between primary seven level to secondary Form I was a low four percent (4%) by 1982.

Table 5

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Primary Std. 1</td>
<td>121,386</td>
<td>140,340</td>
<td>171,500</td>
<td>208,300</td>
<td>542,977</td>
<td>576,347</td>
<td>499,516</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary Std. 7</td>
<td>11,732</td>
<td>20,348</td>
<td>60,545</td>
<td>119,350</td>
<td>156,114</td>
<td>212,446</td>
<td>356,905</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary Form I</td>
<td>4,196</td>
<td>5,302</td>
<td>7,149</td>
<td>8,165</td>
<td>8,620</td>
<td>8,907</td>
<td>9,116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residual (Unplaced)</td>
<td>7,536</td>
<td>15,046</td>
<td>53,396</td>
<td>111,185</td>
<td>147,494</td>
<td>203,539</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2) A. Ishumi (1986).
The above trends may seem to indicate that the Tanzania expansion efforts have created an elitist education system, since very few individuals receive higher education and the consequent monetary rewards that go with certification. But the policy was to make primary school terminal and therefore in the literal sense the objective has been attained. In any case, a higher number of Grade A teachers, high textbook-pupil ratios, low pupil-teacher ratios and good buildings (the major determinants of achievement) (Omari et al., 1983).

The enrollment of girls in both public and private secondary schools accounts for 38 percent of total enrollment by 1986. The government plans to increase the enrollment of girls by opening girls' boarding schools and by increasing their place at day schools.

However, no quota system exists to improve the educational opportunities for girls. Cooksey (1986) has given the following impressionistic observations regarding secondary education for girls in Tanzania:

a) Girls attending government schools are also from higher class backgrounds than boys, but they nevertheless underperform in the Form IV examination;

b) By Form V, the few remaining female students are from disproportionately white collar educated parents' backgrounds;

c) Class related advantages are not enough to outweigh sexual disadvantages manifested in above-average dropout rates.
Quality of Education

There is a school of thought in Tanzania that the quantitative achievements have been attained at the expense of qualitative changes (Ishumi, 1986; Pendaeli, 1986; Omari et al., 1983). The appointment of the Presidential Commission on Education (PCE) in October of 1980 was in large measure a response to the public outcry and discontent about "falling standards" in the education system.

The debate on Tanzania’s quality of education involves two groups. The first group looks at the face value objectives of ESR. This group argues that, essentially, ESR aims at changing the orientation of the education system from a capitalist to a socialist orientation so that the system can better serve the socialist society which Tanzania is aspiring to build (Mbilinyi and Mwobahe, 1975; Kweka, 1975; Sammoff, 1979). Since, by the 1980s, Tanzania is not yet socialist and there are still capitalist tendencies even in schools and among school graduates, then the educational system is failing, so the argument goes. On the other hand, there are authors who argue from a strong orthodox criterion of quality, namely: achievement based on examination results as an indicator of literacy and numeracy (Omari et al., 1983; Ishumi, 1986; Pendaeli, 1986).

The first group is always wrong in interpreting ESR. In fact, ESR stressed that, education being part of society, it should "promote" (not change) socialist transformation. Secondly, it appears that socialism is equated with not being a rich nation and having no capitalist tendencies. Thirdly, the 1967 base data are not usually taken into account; that is, are the Tanzanian schools the same as they were in 1967 before the introduction of ESR? In any case, how do they compare with schools in the poor capitalist neighbors?

Tanzania's educational quality cannot be determined on the basis of academic excellency alone. Recent writers on this issue (King and Court, 1986) have labored to show that the ideal quality in the Tanzanian case consists of knowledge and skills relevant to the immediate life of the terminating majority, rather than the future requirements of those going to secondary school. Quality in this case consists of a set of attitudes, values and commitments relevant to socialist citizenship.
In any case, during the expansionary policy periods, education quality will always go down. Universal primary education brought to schools a great number of pupils who could not have entered under strict competitive criteria of quality. Likewise, teaching and teacher training in general became a mass profession, more so after the famous village-based distance teacher training program, which produced 45,000 half-cooked primary school teachers. On the other hand, the economy of Tanzania has been steadily declining during the 1970s to 1980s; this decline has resulted in, among other things, cuts in government spending especially in the social services including education -- characterized by scarcity of textbooks, chalk, desks and buildings.

Production function and school effectiveness studies done in the United States indicate that background variables of pupils and school quality inputs are the major determinants of academic achievement. Therefore, on an a priori criteria, the Tanzania picture as given above reinforces the assumption that academic excellency as a measure of quality has been going down.

The debate on the quality of Tanzanian education will continue because it appears that the concept of "complete education" is often interpreted as "terminal education," which surely is not the idea. Primary education, for example, should provide a "basic education" which leaves room for some children to go to secondary schools, but should, however, offer complete packages in the sense that whoever leaves with this package should be able to live, work and earn his living. It seems very hard to transfer these thoughts to parents and teachers. An important reason for this is the fact that, in practice, teachers and parents still place a high prestige on pupils going to secondary education. To develop curricula and examinations which will make teachers teach and parents think according to the ideas of "complete education" is actually the main policy problem.

**Education and Production**

Since 1969, schools have been engaged in various agricultural, commercial and technical productive activities as part of integrating theory and practice.
Each school was required to meet 25 percent of its catering bill. A few schools had produced as much as 90 percent of their catering bills; but the national average in 1981 was about 16 percent. The total output for schools and teachers' colleges in 1981 was Tsh. 38,694,316.40, which represented six percent (6%) of the recurrent expenditure for the year 1980/81.

Generally, income from productive activities has been erratic in many institutions due to the unscientific nature of most productive activities. There seems to be no effort to integrate the school productive activities with the broad national development projects, which would have allowed the schools to acquire additional resources and equipment through a national credit system or other support.

At the higher institutional level, the Musoma Resolution (MR), whose major objective was the integration of education and work through mature entry into university, has been abandoned. The political and social conditions that did not favor the MR were related to the preservation of the status quo. Among the elites and the academic excellence group, the MR policy was seen as an attempt by society to equalize educational opportunity -- the opportunity to allow the mature entrants to escape the limitations of their social group -- and therefore it was opposed on the basis of its impact on academic efficiency. The high socio-economic status parents argued that the two-year field experience was a waste of time on the part of their children, and this group actually used its party and government connections to have the policy waved in the faculties of engineering and other sciences. In reality, the above views represented an overt political-social pressure against the policy.

**Manpower and Self-Sufficiency**

The plans and projections of Tanzanian manpower are usually based on the probable rates of economic growth. However, due to both internal and external factors, the performance of the Tanzanian economy has been sluggish. Evidence indicates that, in the First Five Year Plan (1964-1969), it was planned that the economy should grow at a rate of 6.7 percent, but the realized rate was 4.8 percent. During the Second Five Year Plan (1969-1974), Tanzania planned a
growth rate of 6.5 percent, but actually it turned out to be 4.5 percent. Finally, in the Third Five Year Plan (1976-1981), the growth rate turned out to be 5.3 percent when it had been projected at 6.0 percent.

On the other hand, it was difficult to determine proper rates of productivity growth by sector and, for this case (as shown in Table 6), rates of labor productivity for some sectors turned out to be negative.

Table 6

Tanzania Annual Rates of Sectoral GDP Growth and Corresponding Rates of Labor-Productivity (1969 - 1980)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Rate of GDP Growth</th>
<th>Rate of Labor Productivity Increase</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>-3.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining</td>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>-3.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>-3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Utilities</td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>-1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>+0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commerce &amp; Trade</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>-2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance Services</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>-5.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: For explanations on this table, see Galabawa, J.C., 1981.

The above observations on growth rates have negative implications on the use of the manpower policy and educational planning in general.

First, given the above trends, the projected future level and structure of economic production was wrong. Second, a wrong level and wrong structure of economic production led to an over-estimation of manpower needs which, in the last instance, implied that the required composition of education and skills derived in the labor force was wrong. This implies further that the high level manpower demand was determined more by social and political considerations than by economic ones, as the high growth rate in employment
was not associated with a corresponding increase in gross domestic product or goods and services.

The preoccupation with high level manpower planning through the Manpower Approach (M.A.) has also resulted in various imbalances in the skill-mix ratios required in the labor market. This can be seen through the skills-mix ratios which have developed since 1964 to 1980, shown in Table 7. When the ratios in Table 7 are compared with the recommendations of ILO, which suggest a ratio of 1:5:25, it is seen that Tanzania is nowhere near these levels. As expected, the largest shortfalls occur in categories C and B, while the smallest shortfall is in category A. In fact, the figure for category C has been going down since 1974.

Table 7
Tanzania's 1964-1980 Skill-Mix Ratios

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>3.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>11.6</td>
<td>10.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


The skill categories are defined by the T.F.Y.P. as:

Category A: Requiring a University or equivalent education.
Category B: Requiring 1-3 years of formal post-secondary education.
Category C: Requiring a form 4- level of secondary education.

However, also because of the strict controlling of the post-primary schooling, even the narrowly defined manpower posts could not be filled by Tanzania nationals, especially in category A. By 1980, for example, the
formal education system supplied only 0.6 of category A, 0.7 of category B, and 0.4 of category C requirements.

The above shortfalls in job categories help to highlight the limitations of planning higher education in a strict manpower planning procedure in a country where there is incomplete public control over the whole economy, and where a large private sector is not captured in the development plans. In fact, the whole output of private secondary schools was not captured in the M.A.

Financial Implications and Dependency

To attain the expansion objectives, the Tanzania government has concentrated on the construction of completely new institutions instead of expanding or utilizing to capacity the existing ones, a strategy which might have reduced both development and recurrent costs. These new institutions have also had a history of creating other unproductive administrative structures which generate recurrent costs. Partly due to this expansion, a large part of the development expenditure has come from foreign sources, as most new education projects are tied to foreign donors. Figures indicate that approximately 60 percent of the Ministry of Education development costs for education expansion is covered by foreign aid. Certainly there is always the good side of foreign aid, because the process of development itself requires some form of assistance depending on the bidding constraint.

However, the more a country depends on external funds the more difficult it will be to control its development plans and their implementation. For the Tanzania case, most of the foreign aid has come from different sources with divergent policies and, as most of it has been tied to specific educational projects, coordination at the macro-level has been very difficult. This situation has made the process of educational planning difficult and meaningless; because, the training of people without approved funding plans leads to unemployment or cost-generating over-employment.
Employment and Rural Development

The mechanics of planning education through the manpower approach in Tanzania have tended to favor the training, allocation and utilization of post-secondary and university graduates. As a result, there is little planning of the use of the manpower at lower levels of education and skills. The utilization of the entire output of primary school leavers, post-primary craft centers, and trade schools does not seem to be regarded as the proper objectives of manpower planning. This trend leads to a series of interlocking issues.

Firstly, at the macro level, there is a vacuum in terms of planning to provide a sound economic environment to encourage the school leavers to earn a living by taking advantage of the rural resource potential.

Secondly, as shown in Table 8, the wage employment growth trends do not appear to favor agriculture and directly productive sectors of the economy. As a consequence, the majority of the jobs in the modern sector, which are mainly located in urban areas, correspond to occupations related to service activities or the areas which are, in the long run, not employment generating.

Thirdly, as towns have become "growth centers" and "focal points of expansion," the expectation of obtaining jobs in towns among the school leavers has been on the increase. This has led to rural-urban migration. However, given the low credentials of the migrating individuals, they inevitably end up in the informal sector or urban employment.

Generally, then, while Tanzania has changed its development policy to one of intensified rural development, this shift does not seem to be reflected in the manpower development policy. The rural sector has been denied the vital middle- and lower-level skilled workers. Unfortunately, the necessary steps in the direction of producing manpower at the lower levels, instead of adhering to a manpower development policy designed to fill middle- and higher-level administrative posts in the bureaucracy, can not be taken within the manpower approach to educational planning as adopted in Tanzania.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Services</th>
<th>Agriculture</th>
<th>Manufacturing</th>
<th>Construction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1958-60</td>
<td>-8.88</td>
<td>4.02</td>
<td>-12.47</td>
<td>-6.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1962-66</td>
<td>2.27</td>
<td>-11.30</td>
<td>6.32</td>
<td>3.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1969-78</td>
<td>12.97</td>
<td>-2.50</td>
<td>7.94</td>
<td>-1.70</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8. COST BENEFIT ISSUES

The policy of investing in higher education has been supported financially as shown in Table 9. In terms of funds allocated per unit, university schooling ranked first, followed by secondary, and primary education maintained ranks.

Table 9

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Years</th>
<th>Primary</th>
<th>Secondary</th>
<th>University</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1962/63</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>2,182</td>
<td>228,294</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1964/65</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>1,838</td>
<td>221,236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1970/71</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>2,817</td>
<td>34,800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1975/76</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>2,760</td>
<td>55,570</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1977/78</td>
<td>193</td>
<td>4,860</td>
<td>63,062</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1979/80</td>
<td>207</td>
<td>4,608</td>
<td>57,056</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Although it was a deliberate effort by the Tanzania government to invest more of the educational resources in higher education than the lower ones, there are other reasons which make university education costly when compared to other levels, namely:

a) University teachers are better qualified and therefore are usually highly paid;

b) The university has more clerical, administrative and support staff as compared to the lower levels;
c) University education is exclusively residential and, as such, the major items contributing to high costs are usually boarding and catering; and
d) There is a very high teacher-student ratio at the university, indicating that the class sizes are smaller while there are more teachers per class.

But historical and research evidence indicate that the most profitable educational level in most countries is the primary one, while university level education shows a modest payoff. It appears, then, that high investment in university education is not supported by common sense or economic analysis. Policies which have supported university education at the expense of lower levels have been inefficient in a sense of resource allocation choices.

On the other hand, work rewards are not distributed primarily on the basis of ascribed characteristics such as parental education or sex. The influence of schooling and academic achievement on earnings is higher than that of status variables. The marginal average earnings between the university level and other levels are so high that the difference cannot be attributed to education alone. This private economic payoff cannot be explained by higher education labor scarcity supply and demand theories because, if this were the case, then the most scarce graduate skills such as medicine and engineering would be earning higher than other skills.

Recent evidence indicate that social rates of return to education levels in Tanzania suggest that investments in primary education have greater payoffs than investments in other levels, at least for the period of 1963 to 1979. In particular, the unadjusted social rates of return were 0.55 (primary), 0.18 (secondary) and -0.35 (university) for the period 1963 to 1979 (Galabawa, 1987).

The Tanzania government has been more generous to its university and secondary graduates vis-a-vis its primary pupils in terms of private returns and national costs. This is to suggest that it might in fact be able to provide even more and better primary or other basic education if the efficiency of its investments in secondary and university education were greater.
This paper has described the major educational policies adopted in Tanzania since 1961. The characteristic features of these policies were: general expansion and extension of formal schooling; economic development; social change; efficiency and qualitative improvement of education.

Some of the policy objectives were contradictory and tradeoffs and, thus, not all policy objectives could be attained at the same time. The Tanzania experience shows that, in the short run, quantitative policy objectives are incompatible with efficiency ones. This is especially true for a country like Tanzania with a poor resource base.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>King, K.</td>
<td>The interaction of quantity and quality in Tanzanian primary education. Papers in education and development.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Omari, I.M. et. al. - University primary education in Tanzania. Ottawa: IDRC, 1983


Tanganyika African National Union (TANU) - Directive on the implementation of education for self-reliance, November 1974
Tanzania, United Republic of
- First five year plan for economic and social development, July 1964-1969.
  Dar-es-Salaam: United Republic of Tanzania

- Second five year plan for economic and social development, 1969-1974. Dar-es-
  Salaam: United Republic of Tanzania

- Third five year plan for social and economic development, 1976-1981. Dar-
  es-Salaam: United Republic of Tanzania

The World Bank
- Report of Tanganyika manpower.
Distributors of World Bank Publications

ARGENTINA
Carles Hirsch, SRL
Gallegos Guimarães, 1345, 4°
Rio de Janeiro, Rio de Janeiro

AUSTRALIA, PAPUA NEW GUINEA,
FIJI, SOLOMON ISLANDS,
VANUATU, AND NEW ZEALAND
D.A. Books & Trade
648 Whitemore Road
Midland 3152
Victoria

AUSTRIA
Goblet and Co.
Gartenstr. 31
A-1011 Wien

BAHRAIN
Royal Research and Consultancy
Association Ltd.
P.O. Box 21103
Manama Town 317

BANGLADESH
Micro Industrial Development
Society Ltd.
P.O. Box 22103
Lahore Private Bag

BELGIUM
Publications des Nations Unies
Av. de la Rue 22
1000 Brussels

BRAZIL
Publicacoes Técnicas Internacionais
Ltda.
Rua Presidente Vargas, 209
04090-000 São Paulo, SP

BRITISH INDIA
Hare & Sons
76, K.I.A, Avenue
Kolkata

BULGARIA
Publications des Nations Unies
Av. de la Rue 22
1000 Brussels

CAIRO
Libri Judio, S.A.
Calle Judio, 45
Cairo

CAMBODIA
Sihanoukville, Quebec
148 158

CHINA FINANCIAL & ECONOMIC PUBLISHING HOUSE
No. 8, Daxing Dajie
Beijing

COLOMBIA
Enlace Ltda.
Apartado Aereo 34270
Bogota D.E.

COTE D’IVOIRE
Centre d’Édition et de Diffusion
Afrique (CEDA)
12 B.P. 341
Abidjan 04

DENMARK
Samtiden’s Forlag
Rosenborg Alle 11
DK-1970 Frederiksberg C

DOMINICAN REPUBLIC
Editora Taller, C. por A.
Restauración e Iibela del Catolic X9
Apartado Postal 1350
Santo Domingo

EL SALVADOR
Wildbooks
Avenida Manuel Eugenio Arce 5200
Edificio IDEA, Inc. Piso 8
San Salvador

EGYPT, ARAB REPUBLIC OF
At Alain
Al Caka Street
Cairo

The Middle East Observer
8 Chavetta Street
Cairo

FINLAND
Akateeminen Kirjakauppa
P.O. Box 138
SF-00101
Helsinki 10

FRANCE
World Bank Publications
66, avenue d’Ambas
75016 Paris

GERMANY, FEDERAL REPUBLIC OF
UNO-Verlag
Pappelallee A1
D-3300 Bonn 1

GREECE
KEMS
54, Ippodamou Street Plataeas
Athens-11635

GUATEMALA
Libros Norte Santa
Centro Cultural Piedra Santa
11 of 6-90 zone 1
Guatemala City

HONG KONG, MACAO
Asia Ltd.
Mangoki Post Office
State Street No. 37
Mong kok, Kowloon
Hong Kong

HUNGARY
Kalotar
P.O. Box 149
1389 Budapest 42

INDIA
Allied Publishers Private Ltd.
751 Mount Road
Madras - 600021

INDONESIA
Pt. Seda Limited
Jl. Sam Ratulangi 37
P.O. Box 198
Jakarta Pusat

IRELAND
TDC Publishers
17 North Frederick Street
Dublin 1

ITALY
Libri Internationali Internazionali
Via Benedetto Ferrero, 120/30
20123 Milano

JAPAN
Eastern Book Service
2-3, Hongo 3-Chome, Bunkyo-ku 113
Tokyo

KOREA, REPUBLIC OF
Pan Korean Book Corporation
P.O. Box 120, Koryugwanguam Seoul

KUWAIT
Middle East Information Services
P.O. Box 2465

MALAYSIA
University of Malaya Cooperative
Bookshop, Limited
P.O. Box 117, Laluan Pantai Baru
Kuala Lumpur

MEXICO
INFOPAR
Apartado Postal 22-460
14000 Tlajomulco, Mexico D.F.

MOROCCO
Société d’Édition du Maroc et de l’Afrique
DesertJSImport

NETHERLANDS
BoS-Publications b.v.
P.O. Box 7140
2140 BA Lochem

NEW ZEALAND
Villa Library and Information Service
Private Bag
New Market
Auckland

NIGERIA
University Press Limited
Three Courtyard Building, Isoko
Private Mail Bag 5095
Ibadan

NORWAY
Norsens Information Center
Bernturd Norsens vei 2
P.O. Box 6251 Blindern
N-0302 Oslo 6

OMAN
Middle East Information Services
P.O. Box 1433, Salmah Airport
Muscat

PAKISTAN
Mena Book Agency
65, Shaheen-Quaid-e-Azam
P.O. Box No. 729
Lahore 3

PERU
Editorial Desembllo SA
Apartado Aereo 1001
Lima

PHILIPPINES
National Book Store
791 Road Avenue
P.O. Box 529
Metro Manila

POLAND
ORAN
Polska Sucha Rzeka
P.O. Box 313

PORTUGAL
Livraria Portugal
Rua Do Corro, 70-74
1200 Lisbon

SAUDI ARABIA
Middle East Information Services
P.O. Box 3894

SOUTH AFRICA, BOTSWANA
For single titles:
Oxford University Press Southern
Africa
P.O. Box 1143
Cape Town 8000

For subscription orders:
International Subscription Service
P.O. Box 41995
Cranhill
Johannesburg 2024

SPAIN
Madrid-Presas Libros, S.A.
Calle 37
28001 Madrid
Libreria Internacional AEIOS
Consejo de Com., 391
DB0091 Barcelona

SRI LANKA AND THE MALDIVES
Lake House Bookshop
P.O. Box 244
105, St. Christophae A. Cardinal Mervatha
Colombo

SWEDEN
For single titles:
Prinses Fruksensnotat
Ragnar Ingemar, 12, Box 1496
S-103 27 Stockholm

For subscription orders:
Vintages, No.4-11458
P.O. Box 2024
S-104 25 Stockholm

SWITZERLAND
For single titles:
Libraire Payot
Campus postal 3122
CH 1211 Geneva 11

For subscription orders:
Libraire Payot Service des Abonnements
Case postal 3152
CH 1002 Lausanne

TANZANIA
Oxford University Press
P.O. Box 2559
Dar es Salaam

THAILAND
Central Department Store
201 Silom Road
Bangkok

TUNISIA & TOGO, ANTIGUA
CARAIBES, BARRADOS,
DOMINICA, GRENADE, GUYANA,
JAMAICA, MONTEBART, ST.
KINTER & NEVILLE, ST.
KUTTEN & CURTINES,
ST. VINCENT & GRENADINES
Systematica Suset Unit
4-Warren Street
Curepe

TRINIDAD & TOBAGO
PORTO RICO

MIDDLE EAST
Distribution Services
P.O. Box 45245
BRUNEI VENEZUELA

UBERLANDS
Solexim Productions
14, Rue James Dandieu
1060 Bruxelles, Belgium

UDEN KINGDOM
Mirador Books
P.O. Box 3
Alton, Hampshire GU34 2PG

UGANDA
Uganda Bookshop
P.O. Box 745
Kampala

UNITED ARAB EMIRATES
MEMRS Gulf Co.
P.O. Box 4087
Sharjah

UNITED KINGDOM
Mirador Books
P.O. Box 3
Alton, Hampshire GU34 2PG

UNITED KINGDOM
Libreria Internacional AEIOS
Consejo de Com., 391
DB0091 Barcelona

URUGUAY
Instituto Nacional del Libro
San Isidro 1116
Montevideo

VENEZUELA
Libreria del Este
Apartado 5503
Caracas 100-A

YUGOSLAVIA
Jugoslovenska Zalaz
P.O. Box 36
Tajn Republica
Ul-11000 Belgrade
Recent World Bank Discussion Papers (continued)

No. 61  Staying in the Loop: International Alliances for Sharing Technology. Ashoka Mody
No. 62  Do Caribbean Exporters Pay Higher Freight Costs? Alexander J. Yeats
No. 63  Developing Economies in Transition. Volume I: General Topics. F. Desmond McCarthy, editor
No. 64  Developing Economies in Transition. Volume II: Country Studies. F. Desmond McCarthy, editor
No. 66  Illustrative Effects of Voluntary Debt and Debt Service Reduction Operations. Ruben Lamdany and John M. Underwood
No. 67  Deregulation of Shipping: What Is to Be Learned from Chile. Esra Bennathan with Luis Escobar and George Panagakos
No. 68  Public Sector Pay and Employment Reform: A Review of World Bank Experience. Barbara Nunberg
No. 69  A Multilevel Model of School Effectiveness in a Developing Country. Marlaine E. Lockheed and Nicholas T. Longford
No. 70  User Groups as Producers in Participatory Afforestation Strategies. Michael M. Cernea
No. 71  How Adjustment Programs Can Help the Poor: The World Bank’s Experience. Helena Ribe, Soniya Carvalho, Robert Liebenthal, Peter Nicholas, and Elaine Zuckerman
No. 72  Export Catalysts in Low-Income Countries: A Review of Eleven Success Stories. Yung Whee Rhee and Therese Belot
No. 73  Information Systems and Basic Statistics in Sub-Saharan Africa: A Review and Strategy for Improvement. Ramesh Chander
No. 74  Costs and Benefits of Rent Control in Kumasi, Ghana. Stephen Malpezzi, A. Graham Tipple, and Kenneth G. Willis
No. 75  Ecuador’s Amazon Region: Development Issues and Options. James F. Hicks, Herman E. Daly, Shelton H. Davis, and Maria de Lourdes de Freitas [Also available in Spanish (75S)]
No. 76  Debt-Equity Conversion Analysis: A Case Study of the Philippine Program. John D. Shilling, Anthony Toft, and Woonki Sung
No. 77  Higher Education in Latin America: Issues of Efficiency and Equity. Donald R. Winkler
No. 78  The Greenhouse Effect: Implications for Economic Development. Erik Arrhenius and Thomas W. Waltz
No. 79  Analyzing Taxes on Business Income with the Marginal Effective Tax Rate Model. David Dunn and Anthony Pellechio
No. 80  Environmental Management in Development: The Evolution of Paradigms. Michael E. Colby
No. 81  Latin America’s Banking Systems in the 1980s: A Cross Country Comparison. Felipe Morris, Mark Dorfman, Jose Pedro Ortiz, and others.
No. 82  Why Educational Policies Can Fail: An Overview of Selected African Experiences. George Psacharopoulos
No. 83  Comparative African Experiences in Implementing Educational Policies. John Craig
No. 84  Implementing Educational Policies in Ethiopia. Fassil R. Kiros
No. 85  Implementing Educational Policies in Kenya. G. S. Eshiwani
The World Bank

Headquarters
1818 H Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20433, U.S.A.

Telephone: (202) 477-1234
Facsimile: (202) 477-6391
Telex: WUI 64145 WORLD BANK
Cable Address: INTBAFRAD

European Office
66, avenue d'lena
75116 Paris, France

Telephone: (1) 40.69.30.00
Facsimile: (1) 47.20.19.66
Telex: 842-620628

Tokyo Office
Kokusai Building
1-1 Marunouchi 3-chome
Chiyoda-ku, Tokyo 100, Japan

Telephone: (3) 214-5001
Facsimile: (3) 214-3657
Telex: 781-26838

ISBN 0-8213-1583-8