



1. Project Data:		Date Posted : 09/15/2004	
PROJ ID: P038687		Appraisal	Actual
Project Name: Lb - Vocational & Tech.ed	Project Costs (US\$M)	68.88	31.36
Country: Lebanon	Loan/Credit (US\$M)	63	29
Sector(s): Board: ED - Vocational training (77%), Central government administration (16%), Tertiary education (7%)	Cofinancing (US\$M)		
L/C Number: L4298			
	Board Approval (FY)		99
Partners involved :	Closing Date	12/31/2003	12/31/2003
Prepared by :	Reviewed by :	Group Manager :	Group:
Helen Abadzi	Ridley Nelson	Alain A. Barbu	OEDSG
2. Project Objectives and Components			
a. Objectives			
<p>The development objective of the Vocational and Technical Education Project was to improve the performance of the Vocational and Technical Education (VTE) system by making it more demand driven and responsive to market needs. Following restructuring in 2001, the development objective remained the same, but the revised design included the following specific objectives: (a) VTE policy environment improvement; (b) VTE system management and planning improvement, and (c) aligning the program profile, operating procedures and physical assets of the VTE system with labor market requirements. These correspond closely to project components.</p>			
b. Components			
<p>Components were: (a) Institutional strengthening and capacity building (appraisal US\$10.01 million, actual US\$2.62) through: (i) strengthening the Ministry of Vocational and Technical Education (MVTE)'s management, planning, financial control capabilities, marketing and research; (ii) developing VTE policies including defining public/private sector roles in training, improving cost recovery, and increasing women ' s participation in the labor market; (iii) campaigns to improve the image of VTE and public attitude towards it; and (iv) establishing and maintaining a Project Implementation Unit (PIU). (b) Improvement of relevance, responsiveness and quality of training (appraisal US\$17.14, actual US\$7.49 million) through: (i) addressing current and expected training demand, including development of training programs that would attract women into more productive jobs; (ii) developing quality standards; (iii) developing modern curricula; and (iv) improving pre- and in-service training of teachers. (c) Delivery mechanisms improvement (appraisal US\$41.74, actual US\$21 million) through: (i) improving the efficiency of existing VTE schools by rehabilitating, expanding and re-equipping them; and (ii) developing new fields (model schools) in sectors with growth potential in partnership with the private sector. Each subcomponent had multiple subcomponents.</p>			
c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates			
<p>The project's scope was reduced in 2001 and the loan was downsized from US\$63 to US\$29 million. At that time, many of the multiple sub-sub-components were eliminated or consolidated. Model schools, a campaign, and many technical assistance activities were eliminated. The project closed on the date expected, but some components were continued in consolidation with a general education project (subsequently called Education Development Project.)</p>			
3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives:			
<p>The overall objective of improving VTE performance by making it more demand-driven and responsive to market needs was not substantially achieved. Though a number of preparatory subcomponents were carried out, actual changes to improve the relevance and quality of training were not brought about. More specifically:</p>			
<p>- Improving policy environment - partly achieved. A strategic framework document was prepared, approved by the Minister and ratified by the Council of Ministers. (Its implementation, however, is uncertain.) A monitoring and evaluation unit was established, though its work has been limited. An information technology team was established and it planned a management information system, but its implementation will be carried out under the Education Development Project</p>			
<p>- Improving relevance and quality of training - partly achieved. Competencies were established for 40 occupational specializations in high demand. A trader study was undertaken, covering over 10,000 students and graduates, that was used to develop recommendations for program changes. Existing equipment was inventoried, and an equipment procurement framework was satisfactorily developed.</p>			

- **Improving delivery mechanisms** - partly achieved. Thirty schools were identified as requiring rehabilitations, and most of the work was completed; 25 others received electrical generators. However equipment procurement was found to have irregularities and is still pending to be completed under the Education Development Project. Technical assistance has successfully produced data gathering, curricular revisions, and pilot testing.

4. Significant Outcomes/Impacts:

Significant outcomes and impacts are few. The civil works needed in 30 training centers have been carried out, and a policy framework has been developed. The curricular and equipment activities are being implemented through the Education Development Project and have not yet been completed.

5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):

QAG rated quality at entry unsatisfactory. There was little linkage with the private sector to establish a supportive network for institutions and graduates. A large and confusing number of components was formulated that exceeded the implementation capacity of the country and the needs of a population emerging from a long war. Little progress was made in implementation until the mid-term review. At project closing, the ministerial department in charge of vocational education was seriously understaffed, with 83% of its positions vacant because of limited funding. Delays were experienced in obtaining technical assistance and other inputs. A teacher training program was not developed as expected. A rate of return was calculated for graduates (12%), but the calculations were based on unsound assumptions. The pay differential between trained and untrained persons was small, and fewer than 50% of the graduates found work in their specialty.

6. Ratings :	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
Outcome :	Unsatisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Although the development objective was not achieved, components necessary for its eventual achievement (buildings and policy framework) have been put in place.
Institutional Dev .:	Modest	Modest	
Sustainability :	Unlikely	Non-evaluable	The sustainability of the investments depends on the completion of relevant components of the Education Development Project. While this project is proceeding, the unsatisfactory performance of the completed project creates uncertainty about the sustainability of the remaining components at this stage.
Bank Performance :	Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	
Borrower Perf .:	Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	
Quality of ICR :		Satisfactory	

NOTE: ICR rating values flagged with '*' don't comply with OP/BP 13.55, but are listed for completeness.

7. Lessons of Broad Applicability:

- Publicly funded vocational education continues to play an important role in human resource training options. However, its policy and implementation are often complex and require considerable expertise and commitment. Unless there is suitable expertise and institutional capacity in government agencies, VTE projects have limited outcomes.

- VTE investments may be used best if in part they are dedicated to developing effective partnerships with the private sector. Without a commitment from the private-sector and supportive network for institutions and graduates VTE projects may not be implemented successfully.

- In post-conflict countries where institutions have a dire lack of material and human resource repairs, attempts to fix them through the lens of a single project are risky. Interventions might best be focused on prioritized strategic gaps in the system and making long-term, and progressive changes.

- Peer review comments during project preparation provide a valuable safeguard with respect to quality at entry. Taking them substantively into account when designing a project may improve development effectiveness.

8. Assessment Recommended? Yes No

9. Comments on Quality of ICR:

The ICR is candid and provides a critical and thoughtful view of sectoral investments and Bank performance. However, it is on the long side and some of the descriptive material could have been relegated to annexes. Also, the table of staff weeks and amounts in Annex 4 is empty.