



1. Project Data:		Date Posted : 12/05/2012	
Country:	Cambodia		
Project ID:	P070668	Appraisal	Actual
Project Name:	Kh-cambodia Education Sector Support	Project Costs (US\$M):	30.1 28.9
L/C Number:	C4055; CH161	Loan/Credit (US\$M):	28.0 27.0
Sector Board :	Education	Cofinancing (US\$M):	
Cofinanciers :		Board Approval Date :	05/12/2005
		Closing Date :	12/31/2010 09/30/2011
Sector(s):	Secondary education (45%); Other social services (25%); Primary education (14%); General public administration sector (9%); Tertiary education (7%)		
Theme(s):	Education for all (33% - P); Indigenous peoples (17% - S); Gender (17% - S); Social safety nets (17% - S); Decentralization (16% - S)		
Prepared by :	Reviewed by :	ICR Review Coordinator :	Group :
Susan Ann Caceres	George T. K. Pitman	Navin Girishankar	IEGPS2

2. Project Objectives and Components:

a. Objectives:

The Education Sector Support Program (ESSP) provided the overarching framework for the development and implementation of the Cambodia Education Sector Support Project under Review . The Program is a sector-wide approach to education planning and development, which identifies specific actions to achieve the sector objectives. This program is reviewed jointly by all education partners (Government, non-governmental organizations, and international organizations).

According to the Project Appraisal Document (PAD) (p. ii and 2) the objective of the project is to assist the Borrower to implement its Education Sector Support Program goals : "to expand access to education services by addressing supply, demand, quality and efficiency constraints, with special focus on the poor and underserved communes."

The Financing Agreement (p. 16) states the objective is "to enhance access to education services, with special focus on the poor and underserved communes ."

This Review uses the objective given in Project Appraisal Document, since it is clear and monitorable .

b. Were the project objectives/key associated outcome targets revised during implementation?

No

c. Components:

There are three components:

1. **Enabling Equitable Access to Education** (appraisal US\$18.95 million; actual US\$17.1 million) was composed of two sub-components:

- *Expanding educational facilities in poor and underserved areas* to provide lower secondary schools in communes without them, prioritizing areas with the highest poverty incidence level . Where needed and cost-effective, it was to finish incomplete primary schools including construction of latrines and wells, and provide school furniture, a basic set of educational materials, library books, and relevant instructional equipment.
- *Reducing access barriers for disadvantaged children* . This was to foster universal basic education, especially for poor girls and ethnic minority children . Children in each school were to be selected on the basis of an index developed to identify students at risk of dropping out, with a greater weighting for girls . Scholarships were to be provided for children who score higher on a Drop -out-Risk index and those with higher scores were to receive a larger scholarship . A rigorous ex ante evaluation was to be conducted to compare the differential impact of scholarships across groups of students .

2. **Supporting Education Quality Improvements** (appraisal US\$ 5.27 million; actual US\$5.1 million) was composed of two sub-components:

- *Strengthening decentralized quality education service delivery* to focus on decentralized quality improvement to encourage right-age enrollment, foster promotion of students in lower primary, increase retention of students in upper primary, foster transition to lower secondary education and ultimately enhance student learning. Activities included (a) development, implementation, and monitoring of school improvement plans; (b) providing in-service training to improve the effectiveness of teaching and learning in the classroom through "child friendly" methodologies; (c) recruiting lower/upper secondary graduates from disadvantaged provinces to Teacher Training Colleges and upgrading under qualified teachers during vacation periods for teachers in rural and remote area schools; (d) developing national teachers' professional standards which set clear learning-focused behavioral goals for teacher training programs and teachers; (e) mobilizing communities to participate in school governance . A baseline and final project impact evaluation survey was to be conducted over the implementation period to appraise changes in school effectiveness conditions .
- *Establishing a national assessment monitoring system* to appraise student competencies, uncover variables associated with student achievement, inform policy development and provide pedagogical inputs for enhancing teaching and learning practices . The assessment was to be implemented in Khmer language and mathematics on a nationwide sample of grades 3, 6, and 9 students.

3. **Assistance to the Education Sector Support Program** (appraisal US\$ 3.00 million; actual US\$ 3.7 million). This was to provide for the implementation of additional selected interventions under the ESSP, based on approval and presentation of an implementation plan for the proposed activity to be determined during project implementation.

During the first year of implementation, Component 3 was refined to include three subcomponents :

- *Strengthening the institutional capacity of the Department of Higher Education within the Ministry of Education Youth and Sports* to implement civil works to expand the office accommodations, develop Ministry of Higher Education capacity, and establish a vision of higher education and design a prototype of Higher Education Management Information System.
- *Strengthening the Accreditation Committee of Cambodia* to establish a set of quality standards against which Higher Education Institutions could be measured and accredited .
- *Constructing an extension of the library at the Royal University of Phnom Penh* .

d. Comments on Project Cost, Financing, Borrower Contribution, and Dates:

Project Cost : With the agreement of the Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sports and the Ministry of Economy and Finance, underspent funds were reallocated for the construction of seven primary schools destroyed by Typhoon Ketsana (ICR, p. 8). The spending on the scholarships was lower than estimate because the costs to conduct the impact evaluation and train and mobilize the Local Management Committee were lower than anticipated (ICR, p. 28). Actual spending on component 3 was US\$ 0.7 million higher as a result of the construction of the library extension of the University, as well as the higher cost for the library book package (ICR, p. 38).

Financing : The Project was financed by IDA Credit of US\$ 8.0 million and IDA Grant for Poorest Countries of US\$20.0 million. The IDA Credit increased in US\$ terms to US\$8.14 million due to depreciation against the SDR, the currency of the Credit. At closing, US\$0.13 million was cancelled. Similarly, the Grant increased in value to US\$20.11 million and US\$1.11 million was cancelled at closing. Overall the Bank disbursed US\$27.01 million and cancelled US\$1.23 million.

Borrower Contribution : The Government contributed US\$ 1.9 million, which was US\$ 0.2 million less than amount anticipated at appraisal (ICR, p. 25).

Dates: On October 6, 2010 the original planned closing date of December 31, 2010 was extended to September 30, 2011. The extension was granted to finance the reconstruction of seven schools destroyed by the Ketsana typhoon and to complete the delayed construction of the Library extension at the Royal University of Phnom Penh.

3. Relevance of Objectives & Design:

a. Relevance of Objectives:

Objective: High

The project's objectives were highly relevant to the Bank's Country Assistance Strategy (2005-2008), that remained current at closure, which included the strategic goal of supporting the Government's Education Sector Support Program. At appraisal, net primary school enrolment rate had increased to 89% in 2005 from 76% in 1997. However, due to a combination of children who enroll but drop out and those who never enroll, Cambodia looked unlikely to meet its goal of universal primary completion. Similarly, while the quality and affordability of education had improved, further progress was needed. Gender inequality in education was significant - girls accounted for only 39% of lower secondary school enrolment and experienced higher drop-out rates. The objectives of the project were also highly relevant to the Government's Education Sector Support Program (2001-2005) that aimed to increase access to basic education (grade 1-9) for all school-age children; improve the quality and relevance of schooling; and enhance the management and efficiency of educational services. The objectives were highly relevant to mitigating key challenges in the sector including: gender disparities in education participation rates across different income groups, poor efficiency rates at the primary and lower secondary education levels and low quality of education service delivery. The Country Assistance Strategy also stresses the development of higher education capacity.

b. Relevance of Design:

Design: Modest

The PAD contains a detailed Results Framework, with objectives and outcomes for the two components logically linked to inputs and activities. A detailed Theory of Change underpinned the project design (PAD, p. 3). The project design focused on addressing in a comprehensive manner the challenges in the education sector. It sought to address the enrollment disparities by building/constructing schools in rural and remote areas, as well as reducing the cost of schooling for families by providing scholarships for disadvantaged children. The project addressed education quality through a combination of activities: training teachers, recruiting teachers for rural/remote areas, developing a National Strategy on Teacher Professional Standards, conducting standardized assessments of students' performance, developing school improvement plans, and community participation in school governance. These components/activities were logically related to the objective. Moreover, the project promoted equity by targeting poor children and provinces which had received either no or very limited overseas development aid in the past years (PAD, p. 6).

However, there were some weaknesses in the design and the Results Framework. First, the project did not have activities to encourage the right-age enrollment of children and make changes in student-teacher ratio, yet there were outcome measures for these aspects. Second, the third component was not defined. When it was revised it did not relate to the project objectives, but instead focused on higher education, relating to a pipeline project. The ICR (p.6) pointed out another design flaw - that the implementing agency for this project did not have responsibility for setting higher education policy and ensuring consensus among key players.

4. Achievement of Objectives (Efficacy):

The outcomes discussed below cannot be solely attributed to the Bank's inputs because there was significant external support for the sector from other development partners. While the project did not include co-financing, implementation required effective and consistent interaction with other partners, including: the Asian Development Bank support for school construction activities; the Japan International Co-operation Agency support for scholarship activities; and the British-financed Voluntary Service Overseas for the leadership capacity-building related to

Provincial Office of Education and the District Education Office and Child - Friendly School interventions . In addition, UNICEF, Save the Children Norway, the Australian CARE program, and the Kampuchean Action Primary Education also supported Child-Friendly Schools; and USAID financed the impact evaluation of the leadership activities under the program (ICR, p. 26).

To expand access to education services by addressing supply, demand, quality and efficiency constraints, with special focus on the poor and underserved communes : Substantial

Outputs:

Supply constraints were addressed :

- Constructed 18 primary and 236 lower-secondary schools including toilets and school furniture, not meeting the target (300 schools). Increased building costs were the reason the target could not be attained . The project team indicated that all lower secondary schools constructed by the project were in rural /remote areas. In addition 7 more primary schools were reconstructed in the area damaged by Typhoon Ketsana and satisfactorily completed by May 2011. It was estimated that the project-funded schools extended access to at least 45,000 students (ICR p.40).
- Trained 7,804 teachers in Basic Education course, which exceeded the target (4,000 teachers) and this covered 32.5% of all Cambodia's lower-secondary school teachers.
- Trained 908 School Directors in 13 provinces and 1,165 Provincial and District staff, which exceeded the target (training to be provided in 3 provinces).
- Constructed the extension to the Royal University of Phonm Penh .

Demand constraints were addressed :

- Awarded 73,644 three-year scholarships for students in all 23 provinces of the country to continue their lower secondary education in grades 7, 8 and 9, which exceeded the target (70,000 scholarships). The ICR (p. 5) reports that 67% of the scholarships were provided to girls . Impact evaluation found that "the application process had 70% likelihood of selecting students from the poor or poorest households; however despite the scholarship targeting to poor applicants it did not reach the poorest of the poor, since these students had already dropped-out from primary school" (ICR, p. 28).

Education quality constraints were addressed :

- Supported 139 schools in 12 provinces to work within the Ministry's Child Friendly School Policy, which met the target. The ICR (p. v and p. 33) states that the 2009 independent evaluation indicates that these schools performed better than comparison schools, based on Child Friendly School criteria (i.e., criteria included: universal coverage, gender equity, effective teaching and learning, healthy and safe environment, community participation, and enabling conditions for good school management). The Task Team reported that all of the lower secondary schools targeted to receive Child Friendly School training were located in rural /remote areas.
- Developed Teacher Standards, which were then field tested, revised and approved by Ministry .
- The ICR (p. 14) indicates that Basic Education courses provided accredited training to upgrade primary school teachers to be qualified to teach Grades 1-9.
- Established a national assessment monitoring system . Two rounds of assessments were carried out for grade 3 and 9 students and one round for grade 6 students.
- Developed a Higher Education Vision, but it has not been approved by Ministry .
- Established a Higher Education Accreditation system and standards were approved and disseminated .

Some efficiency constraints were addressed :

- Completed prototype for Higher Education Management Information system .

Outcomes:

Attainments related to demand :

- There was a 10% increase in Grade 7 enrollment at scholarship schools compared with the same cohort at other schools in comparable areas of Cambodia with no scholarships (ICR, p. 29).
- The impact evaluation of the scholarship program found that scholarships raised the school participation of recipients by about 20% as compared with those schools/students without the program. Thus, the ICR estimated that 12, 574 students would have been unable to finish Grade 9 without this program (i.e. 20% of 62,869 students funded by this project and the Ministry budget in 2009 and 2010) (ICR, p. 51).
- There was increased spending on girls' schooling by approximately US\$7/year to US\$9/year for scholarship recipients and US\$3/year to US\$4/year for their sisters. The study concluded that the Scholarship Program appeared to have removed about one-half of the difference in expenditures between boys and girls among applicants, and about one-fifth of this difference among siblings (ICR, p. 29).
- The percentage of six year-olds entering first grade increased from 79% in 2004 to 92% in 2012. No target established. ICR (p. iii) indicates that this is not attributable to the project, since it did not include activities to

impact this indicator.

- The total primary enrollment rate increased from 90% in 2004 to 95% in 2012, just missing the target (96%).
- The female primary enrollment rate increased from 88% in 2004 to 95% in 2012, just missing the target (96%).
- The total lower secondary enrollment rate modestly increased from 30% in 2004 to 33% in 2012, which did not meet the target of 50%.
- The female lower secondary enrollment rate increased from 28% in 2004 to 35% in 2012, which did not meet the target (50%).
- The attendance rate among students in lower secondary school increased among the poorest quintile from 20.7% in 2004 to 38.0% in 2009, as reported by the project team. Chart 1 summarizes the changes for each quintile.

Chart 1

	2004 CSES			2009 CSES		
	target population	LS attendance	attendance rate	target population	LS attendance	attendance rate
Poorest	1138	235	20.7%	930	353	38.0%
2nd Q	1106	388	35.1%	823	473	57.5%
3rd Q	1059	456	43.1%	816	565	69.2%
4th Q	999	675	67.6%	712	624	87.6%
Richest	933	861	92.3%	670	668	99.7%

Data source : Cambodia Socio Economic Survey 2004 and 2009

Attainments related to supply:

- 7, 804 teachers (who qualified as Basic Education Teacher) would be able to add extra teaching hours by being able to teach at least two grade levels in primary schools (ICR, p. 31).
- The 2009 independent qualitative evaluation found that the training program made a contribution to meeting the shortage of qualified teachers at the lower secondary level and improved the retention of teachers in rural and isolated schools (ICR, p. 31).

Attainments related to quality:

- While the scholarship program increased access, it had little or no impact at all on learning (ICR, p. 29). However, the scholarship program was an intervention that improved access by reducing the constraints and opportunity costs to enrollment, which would not have been expected to lead to improvements in quality .
- In 2007 the Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sports formally recognized the Basic Education Teacher Training Program. Teachers who successfully passed the 2 year program were renamed Basic Education Teachers, which provided an increase in status, salary and pensionable rights (ICR, p. 31).
- The total transition rate from primary to lower-secondary decreased from 90% in 2004 to 80% in 2012, which did not meet the target (97%).
- The female transition rate from primary to lower-secondary decreased from 88% in 2004 to 81% in 2012, which did not meet the target (95%).
- The dropout rate in Grade 9 decreased from 26.2% in 2003-04 to 19.8% in 2009-10.
- The student-teacher ratio decreased from 52:1 in primary in 2004 to 50:1 in 2012, which met the target.
- The primary completion rate increased from 59% in 2004 to 85% in 2012. No target established. The ICR did not discuss the role promotion policies had in increasing the completion rate .
- There was improved learning in Khmer and Mathematics with grade three students, while the results remained constant for grade 9 students in Khmer and slight improvement in Mathematics .

	2005-06	2009-10
Gr. 3 Khmer	40.4%	54.1%
Gr. 3 Math	37.5%	48.0%
Gr. 9 Khmer	68.0%	68.3%
Gr. 9 Math	41.2%	43.8%

Attainments related to efficiency:

- No change in student-teacher ratio at lower-secondary from 23:1 in 2004 to 23:1 in 2012, which did not meet the target of increasing student-teacher ratio (45). Since the project did not have activities to impact the student-teacher ratio, results (or lack of results) are not attributable to the project.
- The repetition rate in lower secondary decreased from 4.2% in 2003-04 to 2.4% in 2009-10. The ICR (p. 42) reported that while the project did not support all lower secondary schools, it increased 27.5% of lower secondary school buildings and trained 31.1% of lower secondary teachers and 98.5% of school directors.

5. Efficiency:

Efficiency: Substantial

An economic analysis was not carried out at appraisal. The project interventions were justified on the basis that education is the key determinant of current poverty, inequality, and vulnerability in Cambodia, given the significant differences in labor incomes. Providing it was appropriately targeted, improved access to education was expected to break the intergenerational transmission of poverty and reduce inequality (PAD, p. 59).

The ICR (p. 15 and 40) estimated the Net Present Value to be US\$ 53 million at a five percent discount rate, and the Internal Economic Rates of Return varied between 11.5% to 13.1%, based on the lowest and highest scenario. This rate suggests the project had and will continue to generate benefits.

The ICR did not describe how efficiently the project utilized funds. However, what was accomplished with the civil works, despite the escalating cost of materials, suggests substantial efficiency. In the period 2006-2008, the average cost of a five-classroom school increased from US\$ 35,000 to US\$ 65,000 due to the higher price of a ton of steel from US\$ 650 to US\$ 1,100 and increased cost of other raw materials in the same period. Despite the near doubling of the unit cost, the project was able to construct 254 primary and lower-secondary schools, which amounted to 85% of the target.

The results of the impact evaluation (Schady & Filmer, 2009b) showed that the enrollment and retention effect for students in lower secondary students who received the higher stipend (US\$ 60) was not much greater than those with the lower one (US\$ 45). Consequently the higher value stipend was dropped, increasing efficiency (ICR, p. 29).

The cost of project management was only 3% higher than the appraised estimate, even though there was an extension of the project duration by 13% (9 months) (ICR, p. 38). Therefore project administration appear to be cost-effective.

a. If available, enter the Economic Rate of Return (ERR)/Financial Rate of Return (FRR) at appraisal and the re-estimated value at evaluation :

	Rate Available?	Point Value	Coverage/Scope*
Appraisal	No		
ICR estimate	Yes	11.5%	100%

* Refers to percent of total project cost for which ERR/FRR was calculated.

6. Outcome:

The relevance of the objective was high, while relevance of design was modest. There was substantial efficacy and efficiency. The project increased access and strengthened the lower secondary school scholarship scheme which targeted poor students, assisted the Ministry's capacity to conduct standardized learning assessment, developed a qualification framework for Basic Education Teacher Training and established a Higher Education Institutional accreditation system, and constructed the largest academic library in the country.

a. Outcome Rating : Satisfactory

7. Rationale for Risk to Development Outcome Rating:

The government has institutionalized many of the project interventions such as lower secondary scholarships, Basic Education Teacher Training, national learning assessment, and scaling up the Child-friendly Schools. These activities are being financially, and institutionally and technically sustained by the government after the closing of this project (ICR p. 16). Other interventions such as leadership training and higher education reform are continued with subsequent projects. The Government has exhibited great commitment and leadership to attain and maintain the development objectives.

a. Risk to Development Outcome Rating : Moderate

8. Assessment of Bank Performance:

a. Quality at entry:

Extensive sector work (e.g. comprehensive education review, public expenditure tracking, poverty map and index of education disadvantage, etc.) informed project design. Project preparation was thorough and inclusive of staff from Ministry of Education Youth and Sports, other Ministries, academia, NGOs, school stakeholders and communities. The Japanese preparation grant was effectively used by the team to explore alternative project designs and develop a means-test for the scholarship scheme. Effectiveness conditions negotiated in the agreement helped to support timely implementation, since manuals for Community Contracting and Scholarship Scheme were prepared before project implementation. Appropriate assessment of risks was conducted. The Bank conducted four procurement capacity assessments of the Ministry during the preparation cycle to assess readiness to conduct procurement following IDA procedures. A Quality Enhancement Review was conducted.

Quality-at-Entry Rating : Satisfactory

b. Quality of supervision:

Bank staff maintained good working relations with other donors and the implementing agency. There was continuity in Bank's supervision of the project by two Task Team Leaders. Supervision mission included procurement and financial management specialists. Procurement specialists conducted spot-checks of ongoing contracts. The Bank team provided adequate supervisory missions to closely monitor implementation including quality of school construction, quality of the scholarship program, and delay in the construction of the University library. The Borrower reported that the key factors which contributed to the success of the project were excellent planning, leadership and management in the project management and the World Bank.

The weaknesses in supervision were not correcting problems in the Results Framework (See Section 10a) and the inclusion of higher education into the project to consolidate other country management pipeline priorities. (See Section 3b.)

Quality of Supervision Rating : Satisfactory

Overall Bank Performance Rating : Satisfactory

9. Assessment of Borrower Performance:

a. Government Performance:

The Government showed a clear commitment to education, and developed a clear strategic plan and framework to monitor achievements. Prior to effectiveness, the Government staffed the implementing agency with qualified personnel who had previous financial management and procurement expertise in IDA -financed operations and provided an appropriate organizational structure. The Government maintained continuity of staff in the Ministry and Project Coordination Office. The Government effectively utilized recipient-executed trust funds (US\$315,432) to support effective project preparation activities and the Executive Branch of the Government, including the Ministry of Economy and Finance provided effective support throughout implementation.

An inter-ministerial Steering Committee was established to guide policy direction and project oversight. Formal and regular Steering Committee meetings were held until 2009, when the Chairman became the new Minister. After this point, informal and more sporadic Steering Committee meetings were held. The Government provided timely counterpart funding.

Government Performance Rating Satisfactory

b. Implementing Agency Performance:

The project was implemented by the Project Coordination Office within the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports. Professional staff in the implementing agency were present throughout the project. Staff was mainly comprised of civil servants with a small number of consultant. The Ministry provided strong commitment and oversight placing a strong focus on transparency, accountability, and local capacity -building and promoting and integrated approach to project implementation. To this end it adopted a computerized accounting system and provided training to financial and accounting officers, established a system for gathering progress reports from sub-components and introduced annual performance appraisal of government staff participating in the project. The Project Coordination Office led the preparation of the mid-term review data collection and supervision of the mid-term qualitative evaluation. While the Ministry did not have authority for Higher Education, the Project Coordination Office was able to establish coordination and collaboration with the Accreditation Committee to implement the Higher Education activities in the project.

Implementing Agency Performance Rating : Satisfactory

Overall Borrower Performance Rating : Satisfactory

10. M&E Design, Implementation, & Utilization:

a. M&E Design:

The Results Framework was detailed and in addition to output and outcome indicators contained plans for impact evaluations of key interventions such as scholarship scheme and teacher training. M&E data were obtained from the Ministry's Management Information System and a project database. Baseline data and targets specified in the PAD provided a good foundation for M&E efforts. However, some of the targets (e.g. lower secondary enrollment rate, transition rate from primary to lower -secondary) were unrealistically high and thus unattainable. Some of the indicators were only weakly related to what the project inputs could produce. The ICR (p. 9) also indicates that the Results Framework contained too many intermediate output indicators.

b. M&E Implementation:

M&E data and achievements of the project were reported to the Bank every six months. In addition to collecting M&E data, the project conducted three impact evaluations of the scholarship program and qualitative study examining the project's capacity building efforts in relation to teaching and learning (ICR p. 9). The change made to the Result Framework during implementation was to add output indicators related to the revised activities in component three (e.g. Higher Education), but the weaknesses noted in this Review were not corrected.

c. M&E Utilization:

The ICR (p. 9) reported that the evaluations and surveys conducted during the project were used during the midterm review and were also used to update the Results Framework. The ICR also indicated that the Ministry utilized the results of the student assessment to inform decision-making and resource allocation, as well as were disseminated at the provincial, department, and school level. The teacher training activities were informed by the student assessment data. The Scholarship Impact Evaluations undertaken by the World Bank's Development Economics team found that "the project had reached its intended scholarship beneficiaries in terms of gender, poverty and underserved communities and that a marginal increase in the amount of the scholarship would not necessarily increase enrollment" (ICR p. 10). This informed the future design of the scholarship program.

M&E Quality Rating : Substantial

11. Other Issues

a. Safeguards:

The project was categorized 'C' for likely environmental impacts under OP4.01 Environmental Assessment, since most of the civil works were on existing school sites . A minority of (25%) classroom construction was built in new sites in which the land was either vacant or idle and owned by the government (ICR, p. 12). An Environmental Management Plan was prepared . The ICR (p. 12) reports that an environmental specialist carried out spot checks and found satisfactory compliance with environmental safeguards .

b. Fiduciary Compliance:

With the Ministry's prior experience from implementing the Education Quality Improvement Project, there were staff with the skills in accounting, financial management monitoring and reporting . Bank supervision missions rated financial management performance either satisfactory or moderately satisfactory . After initial support provided by the Bank, quarterly Financial Management Reports were properly prepared and timely submitted . Audit reports were unqualified. The Project Coordinating Office held meetings with each sub -component to improve the accuracy of the forecasted projected expenditures (ICR, p. 11). The ICR reported that financial management issues (e.g. internal financial management controls between central, district, and school levels; reduction of documentation, inconsistencies in allowances paid to government staff, delayed reconciliation of advances) were satisfactorily addressed .

The procurement assessment conducted during project preparation found that the organizational structure and process were acceptable . During the early stage of the project, the Project Coordinating Office handled procurement activities. Supervision missions found the Project Coordinating Office undertook procurement duties well. In 2008 an Independent Procurement Agent took over procurement duties, as agreed by the Government and the Bank. This new arrangement caused serious delays in procurement processing, but this was resolved when a new team leader was appointed . Even so, procurement overall was rated satisfactory during the entire project. However, the ICR did report a few problems such as some defaulted civil works contracts, as well issues with bidders . The latter included a consortium of government entities or military-affiliated contractors and suppliers and contractors offering incentives for favorable treatment, which were disqualified by the Project Coordinating Office (ICR, p. 12).

c. Unintended Impacts (positive or negative):

None known

d. Other:

None known.

12. Ratings :	ICR	IEG Review	Reason for Disagreement / Comments
Outcome:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Risk to Development Outcome:	Moderate	Moderate	
Bank Performance :	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Borrower Performance :	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Quality of ICR :		Satisfactory	

NOTES:

- When insufficient information is provided by the Bank for IEG to arrive at a clear rating, IEG will downgrade the relevant ratings as warranted beginning July 1, 2006.
- The "Reason for Disagreement/Comments" column could cross-reference other sections of the ICR Review, as appropriate.

13. Lessons:

A synthesis of the overarching lessons contained in the ICR is :

- **Project monitoring and evaluation activities can provide timely, reliable, and relevant information for the Government.** In this project, the results of the impact evaluations were used to improve the cost-effectiveness of the program. The preliminary findings of the learning assessments were used to revise Grade 3 literacy and numeracy standards. The Ministry made decisions and implemented corrective and /or preventive information because the data were timely and relevant.
- **Mainstreaming project implementation into a Ministry sustains capacity** . This project avoided a parallel unit whose capacity tends to disappear at the closing of a project . As a result, the scholarship program and learning assessment are now fully managed and financed by the Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sports . A critical factor in the implementation was the effective leadership and the highly qualified personnel in the Project Coordination Office.

Another lesson which also emerges from conducting the review of the ICR is :

- **Quality design and preparation takes time, but in the end it may lead to more successful implementation** . During preparation the Bank team developed a solid project design for components one and two and secured recipient-executed trust funds to support the effective project preparation activities of the government. The Government was able to complete the effectiveness conditions in less than three months after Board approval. The conditions were well designed, since they subsequently facilitated project implementation.

14. Assessment Recommended? Yes No

Why?

Other projects could benefit from the lessons of this project in relation to Government efforts that enhanced project success through community participation, developing student assessment system etc . This project had synergies with the Education Sector Support Scale up Action Program funded by Global Partnership for Education, which will close in 2012 and so examining both of those projects together could yield additional lessons.

15. Comments on Quality of ICR:

The ICR provide a concise description of project implementation and was well written . It contained good quality of evidence and analysis. Annex 2 provided a rich discussion of all of the evidence available related to attainment of the objectives, not just indicators . The ICR analyzed and critiqued the Bank and Borrower performance, noting areas of weakness . The lessons presented were important for other projects and were based on evidence. The comments provided by the Borrower were very useful with its reflections on the effectiveness of the project.

a. Quality of ICR Rating : Satisfactory