Public Disclosure Authorized

Satisfactory

States Fiscal Transparency, Accountability and Sustainability PforR (P162009)

### States Fiscal Transparency, Accountability and Sustainability PforR (P162009)

AFRICA | Nigeria | Governance Global Practice | Requesting Unit: AFCW2 | Responsible Unit: GGOAS IBRD/IDA | Program-for-Results | FY 2018 | Team Leader(s): Yue Man Lee, Saeeda Sabah Rashid

Seg No: 1 | ARCHIVED on 09-Oct-2018 | ISR33639 | Created by: Aleksandar Kocevski on 26-Jul-2018 | Modified by: Aleksandar Kocevski on 26-Sep-2018

### **Program Development Objectives**

Program Development Objective (from Program Appraisal Document)

The Program Development Objective (PDO) is to strengthen the fiscal transparency, accountability and sustainability in the participating states.

#### **Overall Ratings** Previous Rating **Current Rating** Name Progress towards achievement of PDO Satisfactory Overall Implementation Progress (IP)

### Implementation Status and Key Decisions

The Nigeria States Fiscal Transparency, Accountability and Sustainability Program for Results (SFTAS PforR) was approved by the World Bank Board of Executive Directors on June 27, 2018.

While the Program is yet to be declared effective, subject to the National Assembly's approval of the external borrowing plan, solid progress is underway to meet the negotiated legal covenants and effectiveness conditions, prepare implementation agencies and partners for implementation of the Technical Assistance (TA) component so that disbursements can commence as soon as possible after the Program becomes effective, and sensitize participating states with the necessary information to implement the PforR component and prepare for the first annual performance assessment...

The appointment of the Auditor-General for the Federation (AuGF) as the Independent Verification Agent (IVA) has been completed, and the detailed DLI verification protocols including data to be collected by the IVA and procedures to be used have been developed. The hiring of the external audit firm to work with the IVA is in progress and should be completed by December. In addition, the following key milestones are expected to be completed by end November 2018:

- Establishment of the Program Coordination Unit (PCU) with core staff (including Program Manager, Financial Management Specialist, Procurement Specialist, and Program Assistant);
- Completion of the drafting of the Program Operations Manual (POM);
- Detailed annual work plans for the PCU, the IVA and each of the TA implementation agencies and partners (Nigeria Governors Forum (NGF), Pubic Service Institute of Nigeria (PSIN), Debt Management Office (DMO) and Open Government Partnership (OGP) Secretariat), and updated procurement plan for the PCU.

While the implementing agencies and partners cannot commence capacity building activities for the states before the program is effective, NGF and DMO have started developing guidelines and templates related to the DLIs for states as per the Program Action Plan.

To prepare participating states to implement the PforR component and be ready for the first annual performance assessment by the IVA, key stakeholder engagement and sensitization activities are taking place:

- Presentation by the Country Director (CD) and the Task team Leader (TTL) to all the State Governors on SFTAS during the July NGF meeting with resolution made by the Governors to support the implementation of SFTAS.
- Federal Ministry of Finance (FMOF) Home Finance Department (HFD) as the PCU organized a sensitization meeting with Commissioners of Finance and Accountant Generals from all states on 28 August 2018 with joint presentation by the PCU, IVA, implementing partners, and the Bank. The Commissioners of Finance were requested to set up the institutional structures at the state-level (steering committee, focal points for the PforR and TA component).
- Six regional sensitization workshops will be conducted end-September to mid-October by a joint GoN (HFD/PCU, AuGF as the IVA, DMO) Bank team. The objectives of the sensitization workshops are to:
  - Sensitize officials from all the key state-level institutions involved in implementing SFTAS on the overall operation;
  - Disseminate and ensure the states understand in-depth the eligibility criteria (EC), DLI matrix and the DLI verification protocols ahead of the IVA assessment of 2018 performance;

10/9/2018 Page 1 of 17

• Guide the states to develop internal action plans for achieving the EC and DLIs in 2018 and 2019.

Each state will send a delegation of ten officials from the ministries/departments/agencies responsible for the achieving the eligibility criteria and DLIs and providing data to the IVA: State Budget Office; State Ministry of Finance; State Treasury Office; State (Board of) Internal Revenue Services (SBIR); State Public Procurement Agency; State Debt Management Department; State Accountant General's Office; State Auditor General's Office, as well as the two assigned focal points for SFTAS.

Once completed, key messages from these consultations will be recorded in a Management Letter which the Bank will transmit to the FMOF and the States Government.

## **Data on Financial Performance**

#### **Disbursements (by loan)**

Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Currency	Original	Revised	Cancelled	Disbursed	Undisbursed	% Disbursed
P162009	IDA-62960	Not Effective	USD	750.00	750.00	0.00	0.00	734.60	0%
Key Dates	s (by Ioan)								
Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Approval D	ate Sign	ing Date	Effectiveness	Date Orig	. Closing Date	Rev. Closing Date
P162009	IDA-62960	Not Effective	27-Jun-201	3			30-E	ec-2022	30-Dec-2022

### **Program Action Plan**

Action Description	Provision of templates and		s for DLI#2 to increase	e citizens' engagement in the	e budget process:
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
Nigeria OGP Secretariat; FMOF as HFD/PCU	No		31-Dec-2019	Increased openness and citizens' engagement in the budget process	Not Yet Due
Comments	<ul><li>Citizens Budget -</li><li>Accountability Re</li></ul>	- by Jan 2019 port – by Dec 2019			

Action Description	Provision of guidelines to	States for developing	a consolidated state re	venue code under DLI#4	to strengthen IGR
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
NGF with inputs from JTB	No		31-Jan-2019	Strengthened Internally Generated Revenue (IGR) collection	Not Yet Due
Comments					

10/9/2018 Page 2 of 17

Action Description	Provision of guidelines to S procurement	States for strengthen	ing the public procuren	nent legal framework under	DLI#6 on
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
NGF with Bureau of Public Procurement	No		31-Jan-2019	Improved procurement practices for increased transparency and value for money	Not Yet Due
Comments					

Action Description		curement audit conducted ctions for States achieving	•	at least 5 percent of state go	vernment capital
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
FMoF HFD/PCU will hire the audit firm	No		31-Dec-2021	Improved procurement practices for increased transparency and value for money	Not Yet Due
Comments					

Action Description	<ul><li>State quart</li><li>Fiscal Resp</li><li>Debt Susta</li></ul>	es and guidelines to State erly debt report consibility Law inability Analysis rm debt management stra	Ū	nen debt management, moni	itoring and analysis:
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
DMO	No		31-Dec-2020	Strengthened public debt management and fiscal responsibility framework	Not Yet Due
	State quart sensitization workshop	, , , ,	tember 2018 – comple	ted, to be disseminated thro	ough the regional
Comments	Fiscal Resp.	oonsibility Law – by Janu	ary 2019		
	• DSA – by E	December 2019			
	• MTDS – by	December 2020			

Action Description	AuGF shares letter of acce	ptance of the role of A	uGF as the IVA for the	Program to FMoF	
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
FMoF HFD	No		31-Jul-2018		Completed

10/9/2018 Page 3 of 17

Applies to all DLIs				
•				
Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
No		30-Sep-2018		In Progress
Applies to all DLIs and	d will be done through th	e regional sensitization	workshops and cor	mpleted by mid-October 201
Hiring of the third part	y external audit firm to w	ork with the AuGF as t	he IVA	
Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
No		30-Nov-2018		In Progress
''		ommittee – joint HFD/F	CU and AuGF as IV	/A – established to review
	rogram state-level surve			
	Recurrent  No  Applies to all DLIs and  Hiring of the third part  Recurrent  No  Applies to all DLIs. RE	DLI verification protocol contained in the POM leading the implementation of the Program in Recurrent Frequency  No  Applies to all DLIs and will be done through the Hiring of the third party external audit firm to water Recurrent Frequency  No	DLI verification protocol contained in the POM is distributed and sens leading the implementation of the Program in participating States by Recurrent Frequency Due Date  No 30-Sep-2018  Applies to all DLIs and will be done through the regional sensitization Hiring of the third party external audit firm to work with the AuGF as to Recurrent Frequency Due Date  No 30-Nov-2018  Applies to all DLIs. REOI issued. Evaluation committee – joint HFD/F	DLI verification protocol contained in the POM is distributed and sensitized with technica leading the implementation of the Program in participating States by the PCU and IVA in Recurrent Frequency Due Date DLI#  No 30-Sep-2018  Applies to all DLIs and will be done through the regional sensitization workshops and cord Hiring of the third party external audit firm to work with the AuGF as the IVA  Recurrent Frequency Due Date DLI#  No 30-Nov-2018  Applies to all DLIs. REOI issued. Evaluation committee — joint HFD/PCU and AuGF as IVA

Action Description	·	orogram state-level survery by to verify DLI#6 on prod	,	public access to procurement	data and
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
FMoF HFD/PCU to procure survey firm	No		31-Dec-2021	Improved procurement practices for increased transparency and value for money	Not Yet Due
Comments	By December 2019 (E	,			

Action Description	· ·	=	-	hensiveness of quarterly sta will be reviewed and update	· ·
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
IVA	No		31-Oct-2018	Strengthened public debt management and fiscal responsibility framework	Completed
Comments		ed the state quarterly debt completeness which will		d established a strengthene 18 debt reporting	d internal procedure to

10/9/2018 Page 4 of 17

Action Description		reports for full year state e ence for verification of DL		ue from the State Au	ditor Generals and other
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
State COF or State COBP	No		28-Feb-2022		Not Yet Due
Comments	By end February 20	19, February 2020, Febru	ary 2021, and Februar	y 2022, as part of the	e APA
Action Description	Development of the	draft of the POM for clear	ance		
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
FMoF HFD/PCU	No		30-Nov-2018		In Progress
Comments	Revised date end-N	lovember 2018			
Action Description		personnel for the Program alist and Procurement spe		CU) housed in the FN	MoF's HFD: Program
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
FMoF HFD and IERD	No		30-Sep-2018		In Progress
Comments					
Action Description		as a project management States under the TA (IPF		U to implement spec	cific capacity building and
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
FMoF HFD /PCU and NGF	No		30-Nov-2018		Not Yet Due
Comments	Revised date end-N	lovember 2018			
Action Description		quately staffed throughout alist, Capacity Building spe			ager, FM specialist, cialist, and M&E specialist
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
FMoF HFD /PCU	Yes	YEARLY			In Progress
Comments	By end December 2	2018 and continuous			
Action Description	Establish souther OF	TAS atopring asitte			
Action Description		TAS steering committee			
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status

10/9/2018 Page 5 of 17

FMoF HFD/PCU	No		30-Nov-2018		In Progress
Comments	Revised date end-Novemb	er 2018			
Action Description	Development of 2018-2019 Communication activities	work plan for PCU	l, including its support t	o the IVA, including	support to the IVA,
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
FMoF HFD /PCU	No		30-Nov-2018		In Progress
Comments	Revised date end-Novemb	er 2018			
Action Description	Development of the detaile Monitoring and Evaluation	•	apacity building to State	es, the Communicat	ions and Outreach Plan and
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
FMoF HFD /PCU	No		28-Feb-2019		Not Yet Due
Comments	Capacity Building Plan by	end August 2018 - I	Revised date end-Nove	ember 2018	
Comments	Communications and Outre	each and Monitorin	g and Evaluation Plans	by end February 20	019
	Fook state about satablish t	ha atata lawal OFT	10 ata anima a annocitta a	anaine tha Obain an	ad analysis that for all a sinta for
Action Description	the Program implementation		= -	_	nd assign the focal points for
	and regram impromonitation	in and coordination	of capacity building ac	livilles to the States	
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	of capacity building ac	DLI#	Status
States' Ministries of					
States' Ministries of Finance	Recurrent	Frequency have been requeste	Due Date  30-Sep-2018  ed to assign and send t	DLI#  the focal points for S	Status In Progress
States' Ministries of Finance	Recurrent  No  Applies to all DLIs. States	Frequency have been requeste	Due Date  30-Sep-2018  ed to assign and send t	DLI#  the focal points for S	Status In Progress
States' Ministries of Finance  Comments	Recurrent  No  Applies to all DLIs. States is sensitization workshops be	Frequency have been requested in end-Septing held in end-Septing	Due Date  30-Sep-2018  ed to assign and send to tember to mid-October	DLI# he focal points for S	Status In Progress FTAS to the regional
States' Ministries of Finance  Comments  Action Description	Recurrent  No  Applies to all DLIs. States sensitization workshops be	Frequency have been requested in end-Septing held in end-Septing	Due Date  30-Sep-2018  ed to assign and send to tember to mid-October	DLI# he focal points for S	Status In Progress FTAS to the regional
States' Ministries of Finance  Comments  Action Description  Responsibility  States' Ministries of	Recurrent  No  Applies to all DLIs. States sensitization workshops be  Develop state SFTAS annuactivities	Frequency have been requested ing held in end-Septial action plans achieved	Due Date  30-Sep-2018  ed to assign and send to tember to mid-October dievement of the Eligibil	DLI# he focal points for S r. ity Criteria and DLR	In Progress FTAS to the regional
States' Ministries of Finance  Comments  Action Description  Responsibility  States' Ministries of	Recurrent  No  Applies to all DLIs. States I sensitization workshops be  Develop state SFTAS annuactivities  Recurrent	Frequency have been requested ing held in end-Septial action plans achieved	Due Date  30-Sep-2018  ed to assign and send to be the better to mid-October dievement of the Eligibil Due Date	DLI# he focal points for S r. ity Criteria and DLR	Status In Progress FTAS to the regional s, including capacity buildin Status
Responsibility States' Ministries of Finance Comments  Action Description Responsibility States' Ministries of Finance Comments	Recurrent  No  Applies to all DLIs. States I sensitization workshops be Develop state SFTAS annuactivities  Recurrent  No	have been requested being held in end-Septial action plans ach	Due Date  30-Sep-2018  ed to assign and send to be the better to mid-October dievement of the Eligibil Due Date	DLI# he focal points for S r. ity Criteria and DLR	Status In Progress FTAS to the regional s, including capacity buildin Status

10/9/2018 Page 6 of 17

Action Description	' '	Formal policy and procedural guidance note accepted by participating States on fraud and corruption /complaints redress mechanism under the Program				
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status	
FMoF HFD/PCU	No		31-Dec-2019		Not Yet Due	
Comments						

Action Description	Ensure existing state-level fraud and corruption/complaints redress mechanism incorporate the Program				
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
States' Ministries of Finance	No		30-Jun-2020		Not Yet Due
Comments					

Action Description	Introduction of risk-based internal audit function outside the expenditure processing cycle						
Responsibility	Recurrent	Recurrent Frequency Due Date DLI# Status					
States Accountant General	No		30-Jun-2020		Not Yet Due		
Comments							

Action Description	Include environmental and social management rules in the operation (in compliance with PforR core principles)						
Responsibility	Recurrent	Recurrent Frequency Due Date DLI# Status					
FMEnv with States' ministries of envir.	No		30-Jun-2019		Not Yet Due		
Comments							

Action Description	Create awareness f the SFTAS	Create awareness for the use of the States' ombudsman to protect basic human rights of people potentially affected by the SFTAS				
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status	
States SFTAS focal person	No		30-Jun-2019		Not Yet Due	
Comments						

# **Risks**

10/9/2018 Page 7 of 17



# **Systematic Operations Risk-rating Tool**

Risk Category	Rating at Approval	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Political and Governance	Substantial		Substantial
Macroeconomic	●High		High
Sector Strategies and Policies	Moderate		Moderate
Technical Design of Project or Program	Substantial		Substantial
Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability	<ul><li>Substantial</li></ul>		<ul><li>Substantial</li></ul>
Fiduciary	Substantial		Substantial
Environment and Social	Low		Low
Stakeholders	Moderate		Moderate
Other			
Overall	<ul><li>Substantial</li></ul>		<ul><li>Substantial</li></ul>

## Results

# **PDO Indicators by Objectives / Outcomes**

Increased Fiscal Trans	parency and Accountability			
►Open Budget Index	score between 2018 and 202	1 - average for States part	icipating in the PforR (Text	, Custom)
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	To be measured in OE survey for 2018	BI	To be measured in OBI survey for 2018	25 percent improvement in average OBI score 2021 compared to 2018
Date	27-Jun-2018		14-Sep-2018	30-Dec-2022
Comments				
Strengthened Domest	ic Revenue Mobilization			
►States that increase Custom)	d internally generated revenu	e collection by more than 2	20 percent annually (in nom	ninal terms) (Number,
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	15.00		15.00	22.00
Date	27-Jun-2018		14-Sep-2018	30-Dec-2022
Comments				

10/9/2018 Page 8 of 17

►Average citizens : Custom)	access to procurement information in	n States publishing cor	tract award data online in	OCDS format (Text,
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
/alue	To be measured for 2019 in procurement survey		To be measured for 2019 in procurement survey	More than 25 percer increase
Date	27-Jun-2018		14-Sep-2018	30-Dec-2022
Comments				
Average time take	en for procurement processes in Sta	ites that implemented e	e-procurement in at least 4	MDAs (Text, Custon
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
/alue	To be measured for 2019 in procurement survey	<u></u>	To be measured for 2019 in procurement survey	Reduction of more than 20 percent
			44.0 2040	30-Dec-2022
Date	27-Jun-2018		14-Sep-2018	30-Dec-2022
	27-Jun-2018		14-Sep-2018	30-Dec-2022
Comments		-	14-Sep-2018	30-Dec-2022
Comments rengthened Debt States with total of		e for the preceding 12 i		
Comments rengthened Debt States with total of	Sustainability	e for the preceding 12 i		
Comments rengthened Debt States with total of	Sustainability debt stock as a share of total revenue		months being less than 10	00 percent (Number,

## **Intermediate Results Indicators by Results Areas**

Increased Fiscal Tran	nsparency and Accountabilit	у			
▶States preparing annual state budgets using the national Chart of Accounts (GFS compliant) and publishing online by end January of that FY (Number, Custom)					
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target	
Value	13.00		13.00	30.00	
Date	27-Jun-2018		14-Sep-2018	30-Dec-2022	
Comments					
► States preparing annual audited financial statements in accordance with IPSAS (cash or accrual) and publishing online by July of the following FY (Number, Custom)					
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target	

10/9/2018 Page 9 of 17

Value	9.00		9.00	30.00
Date	27-Jun-2018		14-Sep-2018	30-Dec-2022
Comments				
►States publishing Custom)	in-year quarterly budget imple	mentation reports online with	nin four weeks from qua	rter-end (Number,
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	9.00		9.00	25.00
Date	27-Jun-2018		14-Sep-2018	30-Dec-2022
Comments				
►States with exper Custom)	diture outturn deviation (from o	original approved budget) les	ss than 15 percent (PEF	A threshold) (Number
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	4.00		4.00	12.00
Date	27-Jun-2018		14-Sep-2018	30-Dec-2022
Comments				
►States that publis Custom)	h online citizens' inputs from fo			- '
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	10.00	<del></del>	10.00	25.00
Date	27-Jun-2018		14-Sep-2018	30-Dec-2022
Comments				
▶Female participat	ion in the budget consultation μ	process (Percentage, Custor	m)	
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	20.00		20.00	40.00
Date	27-Jun-2018		14-Sep-2018	30-Dec-2022
Comments				
	ns' budget, based on the States edback mechanisms (Number,		oublished online by April	of that FY and with
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	5.00		5.00	20.00
Dete	27-Jun-2018		14-Sep-2018	30-Dec-2022
Date	27-3011-2010		14 GGP 2010	00 000 2022

10/9/2018 Page 10 of 17



▶ States with citizens' accountability reports, based on the States' audited financial statements, published online by Sept of the following FY (Number, Custom)					
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target	
Value	3.00	<del></del>	3.00	18.00	
Date	27-Jun-2018		14-Sep-2018	30-Dec-2022	
Comments					

trengthened Dom	nestic Revenue Mobilization			
	ional Treasury Single Account ( im of 80 percent of state govern			anagement strategy, and
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	6.00		6.00	25.00
Date	27-Jun-2018		14-Sep-2018	30-Dec-2022
Comments				
►States with appro	oved and published consolidate )	d and updated revenue code	e covering all local and s	state IGR sources
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	8.00		8.00	18.00
Date	27-Jun-2018		14-Sep-2018	30-Dec-2022
Comments				

J J	,			
	mpleted biometric capture of entify and remove ghost work			sioners and used the
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	10.00		10.00	20.00
Date	27-Jun-2018		14-Sep-2018	30-Dec-2022

#### Comments

Strengthened Efficiency in Public Expenditure

▶States that have linked BVN data to at least 90 percent of current civil servants and pensioners on payroll to identify and address payroll fraud (Number, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	5.00		5.00	15.00
Date	27-Jun-2018		14-Sep-2018	30-Dec-2022
Comments				

10/9/2018 Page 11 of 17

	Dooding	A atual (Draviana)	A atual (Commant)	End Tarest
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
'alue	11.00		11.00	20.00
Pate	27-Jun-2018		14-Sep-2018	30-Dec-2022
Comments				
States that have imp Custom)	plemented e-procurement in	at least four MDAs, including	g health, education and	public works (Number
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00		0.00	15.00
Date	27-Jun-2018		14-Sep-2018	30-Dec-2022
Comments				
	contract award information o	n a monthly basis in Open C	ontracting Data Standar	d format online (Numb
	contract award information o	n a monthly basis in Open C  Actual (Previous)	ontracting Data Standar  Actual (Current)	d format online (Numb
Custom)		· ·	•	·
Custom)	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value Date	Baseline 0.00	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current) 0.00	End Target 15.00
Value Date Comments	Baseline 0.00 27-Jun-2018	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current) 0.00	End Target
Custom)  Value  Date  Comments  rengthened Debt Su  States with approve	Baseline 0.00 27-Jun-2018	Actual (Previous) slation, which stipulates: 1) r	Actual (Current) 0.00 14-Sep-2018 esponsibilities for contra	End Target 15.00 30-Dec-2022
Custom)  /alue  Date  Comments  rengthened Debt Su	Baseline 0.00 27-Jun-2018  ustainability ed state-level public debt legi	Actual (Previous) slation, which stipulates: 1) r	Actual (Current) 0.00 14-Sep-2018 esponsibilities for contra	End Target 15.00 30-Dec-2022
Custom)  Value  Date  Comments  rengthened Debt Su  States with approve	Baseline 0.00 27-Jun-2018  ustainability ed state-level public debt legicording/reporting state debt;	Actual (Previous) slation, which stipulates: 1) rand 3) fiscal and de (Numbe	Actual (Current) 0.00 14-Sep-2018 esponsibilities for contract, Custom)	End Target 15.00 30-Dec-2022 acting state debt; 2)

▶States with quarterly debt reports accepted by the Debt Management Office (DMO) on average two months after the end of the quarter (Number, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	10.00		10.00	25.00
Date	27-Jun-2018		14-Sep-2018	30-Dec-2022
Comments				

Comments

Comments

▶States with annual state debt sustainability analysis results published by end of the year (Number, Custom)

10/9/2018 Page 12 of 17

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target	
Value	0.00		0.00	15.00	
Date	27-Jun-2018		14-Sep-2018	30-Dec-2022	
Comments					
▶States with domestic	arrears reported in a public	cly available database with v	erification process in pla	ace (Number, Custom)	
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target	
Value	0.00		0.00	15.00	
Date	27-Jun-2018		14-Sep-2018	30-Dec-2022	
Comments					
		ominal stock of domestic exp s of less than 5 billion naira,			
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target	
Value	14.00		14.00	15.00	
Date	27-Jun-2018	<del></del>	14-Sep-2018	30-Dec-2022	
Comments	14 states in the baseline is based on unverified domestic expenditure arrears data. The target of 15 states is based on verified domestic expenditure arrears data.				

## **Disbursement Linked Indicators**

▶DLI 1 Improved financial reporting and budget reliability (Output, 59,600,000.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	December 31, 2021
Value	In-year quarterly budget reports not published online, or published > 4 weeks after quarter end in many States. Deviation for total expenditure is 30-55% across States		In-year quarterly budget reports not published online, or published > 4 weeks after quarter end in many States. Deviation for total expenditure is 30-55% across States	1.1 FY21 quarterly budget implementation reports published on average within 4 weeks of quarter end to enable timely budget management 1.2 FY21 deviation for total budget expenditure is < 15%
Date			14-Sep-2018	
Comments				

▶DLI 2 Increased openness and citizens' engagement in the budget process (Output, 37,900,000.00, 0%)

10/9/2018 Page 13 of 17

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	December 31, 2021
Value	While some States are consulting with citizens during the budget process, it is not a formal; systematic process and feedback to citizens is not assured. Less than 5 State publish citizens' budget or citizens accountability reports		While some States are consulting with citizens during the budget process, it is not a formal; systematic process and feedback to citizens is not assured. Less than 5 State publish citizens' budget or citizens accountability reports	2.1 Citizens' inputs from formal public consultations are published online, along with the proposed FY22 budget AND Citizens' budget based on approved FY21 state budget published online by end April 2021 with functional online feedback mechanisms 2.2 Citizens accountability report based on audited financial statements/reports published online for FY20 no later than Sept 2021
Date			14-Sep-2018	
Comments				

▶DLI 3 Improved cash management and reduced revenue leakages through implementation of State TSA (Outcome, 105,000,000.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	December 31, 2021
Value	More than 50 percent of States report having implemented TSA but most TSA not anchored on a formal cash mgmt. strategy		More than 50 percent of States report having implemented TSA but most TSA not anchored on a formal cash mgmt. strategy	TSA, based on a formally approved cash management strategy, established and functional, and covering a minimum of 80 percent of state government finances
Date			14-Sep-2018	
Comments				

▶DLI 4 Strengthened Internally Generated Revenue (IGR) collection (Outcome, 160,000,000.00, 0%)					
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	December 31, 2021	
Value	Approx. 8 States have updated and consolidated IGR sources in a law. 2017/2016 IGR growth: 15 States achieved > 20%		Approx. 8 States have updated and consolidated IGR sources in a law. 2017/2016 IGR growth: 15 States achieved > 20%	4.1 Consolidated state revenue code covering all state IGR sources and stipulating that the state bureau of	

10/9/2018 Page 14 of 17

	growth, of which 10 States achieved >40% growth	growth, of which 10 States achieved >40% growth	internal revenue is the sole agency responsible for state revenue collection and accounting approved by the state legislature and published; 4.2 2021- 2020 annual nominal IGR growth rate meets target: - Basic target: 20%- 39% -Stretch target: 40% or more
Date		14-Sep-2018	
Comments			

▶DLI 5 Biometric registration and bank verification number (BVN) used to reduce payroll fraud (Outcome, 73,100,000.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	December 31, 2021
Value	An estimated 10-5 States have done biometric capture and linked to payroll to address payroll fraud		An estimated 10-5 States have done biometric capture and linked to payroll to address payroll fraud	5.1 Biometric capture of at least 90 percent of current civil servants and pensioners completed and linked to payroll, and identified ghost workers taken off the payroll 5.2 Link BVN data to at least 90 percent of current civil servants and pensioners on the payroll and payroll fraud addressed
Date			14-Sep-2018	
Comments				

▶DLI 6 Improved procurement practices for increased transparency and value for money (Outcome, 79,500,000.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	December 31, 2021
Value	26 States have legal framework but 15 frameworks require strengthening. Procurement systems are performing sub-optimally, lacking efficiency and transparency	_	26 States have legal framework but 15 frameworks require strengthening. Procurement systems are performing sub-optimally, lacking efficiency and transparency	6.1 Existence of public procurement legal framework and procurement regulatory agency. Said legal framework should conform with the UNCITRAL Model Law and provide for: 1) eProcurement; 2)

10/9/2018 Page 15 of 17



Date 14-Sep-2018			
Date 14-Sep-2018	establishment of an independent procurement board and 3) cover all MDAs receiving funds from the state budget; 6.2 More than 25% increase in citizens' access to procurement information AND Time savings by more than 20% for each procurement process conducted in the MDAs implementing e-procurement		
		14-Sep-2018	Date
Comments			Comments

▶DLI 7 Strengthened public debt management and fiscal responsibility framework (Output, 67,500,000.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	December 31, 2021
Value	22 States have FRL or a PDML, but some laws do not contain key provisions. All States submitting quarterly debt reports but many submit late. No state conducts DSA or develop MTDS		22 States have FRL or a PDML, but some laws do not contain key provisions. All States submitting quarterly debt reports but many submit late. No state conducts DSA or develop MTDS	7.1 Approval of state-level legislation, which stipulates: 1) responsibilities for contracting state debt; 2) responsibilities for recording/reporting state debt; and 3) fiscal and debt rules/limits; 7.2 Quarterly state debt reports accepted by the DMO on average two months or less after the end of the quarter in 2021
Date			14-Sep-2018	
Comments				

▶DLI 8 Improved clearance/reduction of stock of domestic expenditure arrears (Outcome, 50,000,000.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	December 31, 2021
Value	In 2017, 14 States reduced their stock of arrears or maintained arrears of less than 5 billion naira. No		In 2017, 14 States reduced their stock of arrears or maintained arrears of less than 5	Domestic arrears as of end 2020 and end 2021 reported in an online publicly-

10/9/2018 Page 16 of 17

	state reports domestic arrears in a publicly-accessible database.	billion naira. No state reports domestic arrears in a publicly-accessible database.	accessible database, with verification process in place. AND Percentage decline in the verified stock of domestic arrears at end 2021 compared to end 2020 meets target and is consistent with the state's arrears clearance frameworkBasic target: At least a 5 percent decline or maintain stock below 5 billion naira -Stretch target: More
Date		14-Sep-2018	<del></del>
Comments			

▶DLI 9 Improved debt sustainability (Outcome, 67,500,000.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	December 31, 2021
Value	All but 3-4 States are complying with the monthly debt service threshold per FSP. Total debt-to-revenue ratio for the median state was 172% end 2017. 15 States < 150%, 11 States < 125% and 5 States < 100%		All but 3-4 States are complying with the monthly debt service threshold per FSP. Total debt-to-revenue ratio for the median state was 172% end 2017. 15 States < 150%, 11 States < 125% and 5 States < 100%	Average monthly debt service deduction is < 40% of gross FAAC allocation for FY2021 AND Total debt stock at end Dec 2021 as a share of total revenue for FY 2021 meets target: -Basic target: < 120% -Stretch target: < 95%
Date	<del></del>		14-Sep-2018	
Comments				

10/9/2018 Page 17 of 17