

Document of  
**The World Bank**

**FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY**

Report No. 15748

**IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION REPORT**

**REPUBLIC OF NIGER**

**PRIMARY EDUCATION DEVELOPMENT PROJECT  
(Cr. 1740-NIR)**

**June 14, 1996**

**Population and Human Resources Operations Division  
West Central Africa Department  
Africa Region**

**This document has a restricted distribution and may be used by recipients only in the performance of their official duties. Its contents may not otherwise be disclosed without World Bank authorization.**

## CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS

(June 5, 1996)

Currency Unit	=	CFA franc
US\$1.00	=	CFA franc 516
CFA franc 1 million	=	US\$1,937.38
SDR 1	=	US\$1.44
US\$1	=	SDR .69

## WEIGHTS AND MEASURES

Metric System

### FISCAL YEAR OF BORROWER

January 1 - December 31

### SCHOOL YEAR OF BORROWER

October - June

## ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

AfDB	African Development Bank
BIES	<i>Bureau des Infrastructures et des Equipements Scolaires/School Construction Bureau</i>
DEP	Directorate of Planning and Programming
EERP	Emergency Education Rehabilitation Plan
ICR	Implementation Completion Report
IDA	International Development Association
IN	<i>Instituteurs</i>
INA	<i>Instituteurs adjoints</i>
INDRAP	<i>Institut National de documentation, de recherche et d'animation pédagogiques/National Institute for Pedagogical Documentation, Research and Promotion</i>
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GNP	Gross National Product
MOE	Ministry of Education
PCU	Project Coordination Unit
PROSEF	<i>Projet sectoriel d'enseignement fondamental/Basic Education Sector Project/Hybrid</i>
SAL	Structural Adjustment Loan
TTC	Teacher Training College

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### PREFACE

### EVALUATION SUMMARY ..... i

### INTRODUCTION..... 1

- A. Macroeconomic Setting ..... 1
- B. Bank's role in the Sector ..... 1

### PROJECT OBJECTIVES ..... 2

- A. Original Project Objectives ..... 2
- B. Project Description and Components ..... 2
- C. Credit covenants and Special Agreements ..... 3
- D. Evaluation of Project Objectives ..... 3

### IMPLEMENTATION EXPERIENCE AND RESULTS ..... 4

- A. Assessment of Project's Success and Sustainability ..... 4
- B. Summary of costs and Financing Arrangements ..... 7
- C. Implementation Schedule ..... 7
- D. Analysis of Key Factors Affecting Major Objectives ..... 8
- E. Assessment of the Bank's and the Borrower's Performance ..... 8
- F. Assessment of Project's Outcome ..... 9

### SUMMARY OF FINDINGS, FUTURE OPERATIONS AND KEY LESSONS

### LEARNED ..... 9

- A. Important Findings of Project Implementation Experience ..... 9
- B. Future Operations and Sustainability ..... 10
- C. Lessons for Future Projects in the sector ..... 11

### STATISTICAL ANNEXES

Table 1:	Summary of Assessments
Table 2:	Related Bank Loans/Credits
Table 3:	Project Timetable
Table 4:	Loan/Credit Disbursements: Cumulative Estimated and Actual
Table 5:	Key Indicators for Project Implementation
Table 6:	Studies Included in the Project
Table 7A:	Project Costs
Table 7B:	Project Financing
Table 8:	Status of Legal Covenants
Table 9:	Bank Resources: Staff Inputs
Table 10:	Bank Resources: Missions

- Appendices:
- A. Mission's aide-mémoire
  - B. Summary of Borrower's contribution to the ICR

This document has a restricted distribution and may be used by recipients only in the performance of their official duties. Its contents may not otherwise be disclosed without World Bank authorization.



**IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION REPORT  
REPUBLIC OF NIGER  
PRIMARY EDUCATION DEVELOPMENT PROJECT  
(Cr. 1740-NIR)**

**PREFACE**

This is the Implementation Completion Report (ICR) for the Primary Education Development Project in Niger for which Credit 1740-NIR was approved on November 18, 1986 in the amount of SDR 15.3 million (US\$18.4 million equivalent) and which was made effective on May 11, 1987.

The credit was closed on December 31, 1995 following two extensions from the original closing date of June 30, 1994. It was disbursed up to the amount of SDR 15 million (US\$20.8 million equivalent in 1996), with the final disbursement on April 30, 1996. The undisbursed amount of SDR 0.25 million (US\$0.36 million equivalent in 1996) was canceled. Cofinancing for the project was provided by the Kingdom of Norway (US\$4.7 million, fully disbursed); and Germany (US\$1.7 million, fully disbursed).

The ICR was prepared by Mr. Makha Ndao (AF4PH), assisted by Messrs. Ross Pfile (AF4PH), and Pierre Nignon (Resident mission, Niger); and reviewed by Irene Xenakis, Portfolio Manager (AF4PH), Ian Porter, Division Chief (AF4PH), and Franz Kaps, Operations Advisor (AF4DR). The Borrower provided comments that are included as an appendix to the ICR.

Preparation of this ICR was begun during the Bank's final supervision/completion mission of October 1995. It is based on material in the project file. The Borrower contributed to preparation of the ICR by preparing its own evaluation of the project's execution, contributing views reflected in the mission's aide-mémoire, and commenting on the draft ICR.



**IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION REPORT  
REPUBLIC OF NIGER  
PRIMARY EDUCATION DEVELOPMENT PROJECT  
(Cr. 1740-NIR)**

**EVALUATION SUMMARY**

1. **Bank's Role in the Sector.** The Primary Education Development Project (Cr. 1740-NIR) for US\$18.4 million was the Bank's Second Education Project in Niger. It follows one preceding Bank operation in education since 1981 (Cr. 1151-NIR) for US\$21.5 million. While the preceding project focused on training of middle-level technicians and extension workers in agriculture and animal production, the project under review focused on primary education, and the subsequent project, the Basic Education Sector Project/Hybrid (PROSEF) (Cr. 2618-NIR), approved in June 1994, and effective September 26, 1995, focuses on the education sector as a whole (para. 1.4).

2. Social indicators paint a grim picture of the country's poverty, placing it among the bottom five countries in the world for all social indicators. The Government's social adjustment program, aimed at increasing resource use and strengthening the country's resource base, received assistance from the Bank in the amount of a US\$20 million loan, approved in February 1986. It was Niger's policy to move away from a small, elitist system (with a literacy rate of about 14 percent and primary school enrollment of 25 percent in the mid-1980s) to a broader and more equitable system, with secondary and higher education in line with the economy's need and capacity (para. 1.5).

3. **Project Objectives and Components.** The main objectives and components of the Primary Education Development Project were the following: (a) *reduce recurrent unit costs and improve quality and relevance of primary education* including: (i) restructuring the teaching force by limiting the need for recruiting high-cost *instituteurs*, by improving the quality of existing teachers and of the pre-service training of *instituteurs adjoints*; (ii) expanding multigrade teaching in rural areas and introducing the use of double-shift schooling in forty urban classes; and (iii) establishing a national capacity to develop, adapt, procure and distribute about one million low-cost textbooks and teachers' guides; (b) *reduce unit capital costs and improve access to primary education* including: (i) developing low-cost construction techniques for primary schools and building 750 classrooms (thus increasing primary school enrollment by about 34,000 pupils); (ii) renovating 3,000 existing classrooms; and (iii) promoting the development of a community-based school maintenance system; and (c) *promote more cost-effective resource utilization* including: (i) strengthening the Ministry of Education's (MOE) capacity to manage and control the use of human, physical and financial resources at central and local levels; (ii) reinforcing the planning and monitoring capabilities of the Directorate of Planning and Programming (DEP) within the MOE; and (iii) establishing a capacity within MOE to prepare and implement education projects (para. 2.2).

4. Given the exceptionally low and decreasing primary school enrollment ratio and declining quality, the project's policy objectives and associated investments program were timely, appropriate, and in line with the Bank's education sector policies. The project objectives were in harmony with the Government's own education sector strategy which were based on the national consensus building that had taken place in order to lay the foundation for sustainability.

5. **Credit Covenants and Special Agreements.** In addition to the agreements reached during negotiations, the following condition of Credit effectiveness was also agreed upon: effectiveness of the cofinancing by the Federal Republic of Germany. This condition of Credit effectiveness was complied with by Niger to the satisfaction of the Bank and the Credit was declared effective on May 11, 1987 (paras. 2.3 and 2.4).

6. The Development Credit Agreement was amended as follows over the course of project implementation: (a) to double the amount of the IDA credit Special Account and the authorized allocation specified in the Norwegian Grant Agreement due to rapid disbursement; (b) to increase the amounts allocated under Category 1 (School Rehabilitation) and under Category 2 (Furniture and Materials) specified in Paragraph 1 of the Schedule to the Norwegian Grant Agreement; (c) a reallocation of Credit funds; and (d) extension of the closing date (para. 2.5).

7. **Evaluation of Project Objectives.** The main objectives of the project were to reduce unit recurrent cost, improve quality and relevance of primary education, reduce the cost of classroom construction, increase access to primary education, and promote more cost-effective use of existing education resources. Given the declining primary school ratio from 27 percent in 1980/81 to 25 percent in 1984/85, it was necessary to reverse the trend and to put more emphasis on primary school expansion. The Government realized that if the stagnation and deterioration of the education sector were allowed to continue, the low level of human resources development would have serious detrimental effects on the country's long-term economic growth prospects. Within the context of the overall structural adjustment program, the Government's adjustment strategy for the education sector had the dual objective of (a) preventing further decline in primary education enrollment, and (b) laying the foundation for future development as seen from a macroeconomic perspective. The Government and Project objectives were consistent and fell directly under the country's own macroeconomic framework and structural adjustment program and were in harmony with the Bank's country assistance strategy (paras. 2.6-2.8).

#### **IMPLEMENTATION EXPERIENCE AND RESULTS.**

8. **Assessment of the Project's Success and Sustainability.** Success in achieving the project's main objective of assisting the Government in reversing the decline in the primary school enrollment ratio is evidenced by the fact that this ratio increased to about 30 percent in 1994, in spite of a 15 percent increase in the primary school age population during the same period. The efficiency gains implemented under the project were instrumental in reducing the unit recurrent cost per primary school student from US\$77 to US\$62. Unit recurrent costs were reduced by (a) limiting the need of recruiting high cost *instituteurs* (IN) in the teaching



force, while the remaining being *instituteurs adjoints* (INA)--the starting salary of the former exceeds that of the latter by 50 percent; and (b) introducing the use of double-shift teaching in urban areas--one teacher teaches one group of pupils in the morning and another in the afternoon; and expanding multigrade teaching in rural areas--one teacher teaches two grades in the same classroom. Efficiency measures were implemented without impairing educational quality improvement. At project appraisal, only 20 percent of those who sat for the primary school leaving examination in 1985, passed. This percentage increased from 25 percent in 1989 to 33 percent in 1994. Unit capital costs were reduced through the development of low-cost primary school construction techniques. Before the January 1994 devaluation of the CFA franc, the average cost per classroom of CFA franc 2,178,000 under self-help construction was lower than classrooms built in 1985 (under the supervision of the Ministry of Public Works) by the private sector for the administration, and those constructed under the Education I project, the average cost was lower by 50 percent and 31 percent (in nominal terms), respectively. After the devaluation, the unit cost per classroom increased to CFA franc 3 million. The adjustment measures which initially met considerable resistance from students and teachers' unions when initiated have matured and are now well internalized by ministry staff and the teachers' unions (paras. 3.1-3.9).

9. **Summary of Costs and Financing Arrangements.** The total cost of the project (Table 7A) was estimated at appraisal to be US\$26.2 million equivalent with the Government contributing US\$1.4 million equivalent. Financing was provided by the following: (a) IDA, US\$18.4 million equivalent; (b) a grant from the Kingdom of Norway of US\$4.7 million equivalent; (c) a grant from the Federal Republic of Germany--through KfW--of US\$1.7 million equivalent. Total disbursements of IDA's Credit at ICR preparation (US\$20.8 million) were higher than projected at appraisal due to changes in the US\$/SDR exchange rate (para. 3.10).

10. **Implementation Schedule.** Preparation, Negotiations, Signing, Credit Effectiveness, and Implementation followed normal time schedules experienced in the country. The Closing Date was extended twice for a total of 18 months (para. 4.1). Disbursements against commitments were made until April 30, 1996. An outstanding balance of SDR 0.25 (about US\$0.36 million equivalent in 1996) under the IDA Credit, was canceled at Credit closing. The Norwegian and KfW Grants were fully disbursed.

11. **Analysis of Key Factors Affecting Major Objectives.** The project achieved all its major objectives. At appraisal stage, there were at least two main risks: first, the MOE had no previous experience in implementing IDA-financed projects and had limited or inadequate technical expertise in certain fields; and second, the goal of reducing education unit costs through a cost-saving measure of recruiting *instituteurs adjoints* (INA) rather than *instituteurs* (IN) was a more difficult and risky goal due to pressure for status quo from within the educational establishment. To overcome the first risk, the Ministry of National Education, Higher Education and Research (MOE) was equipped with a project coordinating unit (PCU) and a school construction bureau (BIES) to implement the construction and rehabilitation program. To facilitate the implementation of the second goal, several consultations with the teachers' union were conducted. In addition, targeted measures such as teacher training, and provision of sufficient textbooks helped overcome the initial handicaps. The delays regarding

the computerization of the MOE were mainly due to unforeseeable factors (para. 3.8). The issue was addressed to both the Bank's and the Government's satisfaction (para. 3.12).

12. **Assessment of the Bank's and Borrower's Performance.** The Bank's performance was satisfactory, and contributed to the achievement of most of the objectives. Project supervision focused on overall support, encouragement, and priority issues to be addressed. The Resident Mission provided guidance to the MOE, followed-up on issues which arose, and held regular discussions with the MOE on project implementation. Despite delays at project start-up in the school construction and textbook programs, the Borrower's performance in project implementation was generally satisfactory. In some areas, the Borrower performed particularly well, notably in implementing the efficiency measures. However, the Borrower's performance could have been improved in carrying out the technical studies envisaged in the SAR (para. 3.13).

13. **Assessment of Project's Outcome.** The Primary Education Development Project can be classified as satisfactory in reversing the trend of the declining enrollment ratio between 1980 and 1984, and in its effort to expand primary education through the efficient use of education resources. The project made considerable progress in helping the Borrower to achieve major efficiency gains by reducing unit recurrent and capital costs, and laying the foundation for better quality of education through efficient teacher training and provision of textbooks (paras. 3.14 and 3.15). The outcome was less satisfactory in entirely reforming the management of the education sector.

#### **SUMMARY OF FINDINGS, FUTURE OPERATIONS, AND KEY LESSONS LEARNED**

14. For the most part, execution of this project and disbursement were on schedule throughout the life of the project and covenants were in compliance. Disbursement procedures were regularly followed resulting in no rejections from the Bank and no negative comments from the auditors. Further, regular supervision took place and despite a change in Task Manager, no negative impact was experienced. A reallocation of the IDA Credit and the Norwegian grant took place which allowed for the completion of the construction of 750 classrooms. A further one-year extension was given which allowed for additional classroom construction. Being the first project entirely executed by the Ministry of Education, there were some lags (in the construction and textbook program) at project launch which were made up throughout the course of project implementation.

15. Future operations will be developed in accordance with the Country Assistance Strategy. Because of the low primary school enrollment ratio, emphasis will continue to be placed upon expanding access to, and improving the quality of, primary education to raise the general education level of the population. Moreover, measures aiming at further increasing the communities' involvement in the provision of education will be provided for with a view to further improving girls' access and expanding access to rural areas. The new Basic Education Sector Project/Hybrid (PROSEF--Cr. 2618-NIR, effective on September 26, 1995) builds directly on, and seeks to further, the positive results of the project under review (para. 4.4).

16. Future operations will also strengthen the links between the education system, the labor market, and national development needs. To meet basic technical skills requirements, while continuing the expansion of primary education, it will be necessary to support post-primary education by improving the overall quality of general secondary, technical and vocational training, and higher education (para. 4.5).

17. Although the project met its goal, the public sector is not yet equipped to provide sufficient educational services because of its limited resources and the rapid population growth. A major lesson learned from this project is that new complementary ways of delivering educational services (without placing a burden on the Government's recurrent cost budget) will have to be employed such as community-based and private schools.

18. A second lesson learned is that flexibility is required to address unforeseen circumstances during implementation. The Bank and the Borrower demonstrated flexibility which helped address issues arising during implementation such as initial delays in the construction program and textbook provision.

19. A third lesson to be drawn from this project is the importance of consensus-building to gain wide acceptance for reforms among the various groups affected at the national level. Restrictive reforms and changes which affect the concerned urban groups--teachers' union and University students--are invariably resisted by those groups. Thus, the rationale behind foreseen outcomes and improvements, must be explained and discussed before implementation.

20. The fourth lesson concerns the long-term process of improving the national capacity to develop manuscripts and produce textbooks. The textbook production program was delayed due to an over-ambitious assessment at appraisal of the capacity of the National Institute for Pedagogical Documentation, Research and Promotion (INDRAP) (composed of civil servants) to develop and test manuscripts for new textbooks and teachers' guides. To avoid delays, manuscript preparation should be entrusted to private authors who have the capacity to deliver. The ongoing project is supporting the development of quality control at INDRAP.

21. The lessons learned from this project, as well as the First Education Project, have been built into the new Basic Education Project and will be further elaborated in future operations (para. 4.10).



**IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION REPORT  
REPUBLIC OF NIGER  
PRIMARY EDUCATION DEVELOPMENT PROJECT  
(Cr. 1740-NIR)**

**PART I: PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION ASSESSMENT**

**INTRODUCTION**

**A. MACROECONOMIC SETTING**

1.1 Niger is one of the poorest countries in the world (US\$270 per capita GNP). Social indicators paint a grim picture of the country's poverty, placing it among the bottom five countries in the world. Most of Niger's land is arid and semi-arid and vulnerable to weather conditions. The majority of Niger's population of 8.5 million (about 85 percent rural) earns its living in the rural sector, through agriculture and animal production. Livestock and uranium account for the major exports.

1.2 Over the past decade, Niger's economic performance has been weak despite the adoption of several adjustments programs. Real GDP declined by approximately one-half of one percent per annum over the period 1993-94, and poverty increased significantly over the same period. This very weak performance has been attributable not only to exogenous shocks such as the deterioration of the terms of trade and chronic drought, but also inefficiency of economic management, low levels of domestic saving and investment, and weak human resources. Furthermore, until the 1994 change in parity, the real appreciation of the CFA franc, particularly vis-à-vis the Nigerien naira, significantly impaired Niger's international competitiveness.

1.3 Subsequently, the Government of Niger adopted an economic program designed to capitalize on the benefits from the devaluation, while cushioning some of the adverse effects of the change in parity on the most vulnerable social groups. Niger's 1994 economic program was supported by the International Monetary Fund and the World Bank. Despite the difficult fiscal situation, the devaluation of the CFA franc and favorable weather conditions allowed real GDP growth in 1994 to reach four percent, and real per capita to increase for the first time in years. Still, much remains to be done in order to make further progress in stabilizing the economy and to foster an economic environment conducive to sustainable, labor-intensive growth and poverty reduction.

**B. BANK'S ROLE IN THE SECTOR**

1.4 The Bank's involvement in Niger's education sector started with the First Education Project (Cr. 1151-NIR of US\$21.5 million, effective in July 1982, and which closed on June 30, 1990, two and one-half years behind schedule). The project was designed to improve and

expand the output of middle-level technicians and extension workers in agriculture and animal production through the development of two agricultural schools. While physical implementation of this project faced no serious problems, the project's development impact was reduced by low capacity utilization at the two schools and high recurrent costs. The former resulted from the Government's financial inability to recruit new graduates into the civil service at the rate foreseen at appraisal, combined with too slow action on the part of the schools to develop programs which addressed training needs in the private sector. The high unit cost was largely caused by the low capacity utilization and reflected the failure to reduce staffing in step with the enrollment decline.

1.5 In 1986, Niger launched a structural adjustment program--SAL I--(US\$60 million including \$20 million from IDA) aimed at increasing the efficiency of resource use and strengthening the country's resource base, as well as improving the balance of payments and public finance position. This program included an education strategy with a dual objective of preventing the Government's tight financial constraints from causing further decline in the already low enrollment ratio in primary education (paras. 2.6 and 2.7). Recognizing that a broader effort in education is an essential condition for sustained economic development in Niger, the Bank Group supported the high priority given to primary education in the Government's strategy. Thus, the Primary Education Development Project (Education II) became the first to focus broadly on primary education.

## **PROJECT OBJECTIVES**

### **A. ORIGINAL PROJECT OBJECTIVES**

2.1 The main objectives of the Primary Education Development Project (CR. 1740-NIR, signed in December 1986, for US\$18.4 million) were to: (a) reduce unit recurrent cost and improve quality and relevance of primary education; (b) reduce the cost of classroom construction, and increase access to primary education; and (c) promote more cost-effective use of existing education resources. Given the declining primary school ratio from 27 percent in 1980/81 to 25 percent in 1984/85, it was necessary to reverse the trend and to put more emphasis on primary school expansion.

### **B. PROJECT DESCRIPTION AND COMPONENTS**

2.2 The project components consisted of the following: (a) *reduction in recurrent unit costs and improvements in quality and relevance of primary education* including: (i) restructuring the teaching force by limiting the need for recruiting high-cost *instituteurs*, by improving the quality of existing teachers and of the pre-service training of *instituteurs adjoints*; (ii) expanding multigrade teaching in rural areas and introducing the use of double-shift schooling in forty urban classes; and (iii) establishing a national capacity to develop, adapt, procure and distribute about one million low-cost textbooks and teachers' guides; (b) *reduction in unit capital costs and improvement in access to primary education* including: (i) developing low-cost construction techniques for primary schools and building 750 classrooms (thus increasing primary school enrollment by about 34,000 pupils); (ii) renovating 3,000

existing classrooms; and (iii) promoting the development of a community-based school maintenance system; and (c) *promotion of more cost-effective resource utilization* including: (i) strengthening the Ministry of Education's capacity to manage and control the use of human, physical and financial resources at central and local levels; (ii) reinforcing the planning and monitoring capabilities of the Directorate of Planning and Programming (DEP) within the MOE; and (iii) establishing a capacity within MOE to prepare and implement education projects.

### C. CREDIT COVENANTS AND SPECIAL AGREEMENTS

2.3 During Credit negotiations, the following agreements were reached, namely, that the Borrower will: (a) recruit and promote teachers in a manner guaranteeing that the percentage of *instituteurs* teaching in primary schools does not exceed 14 percent of total teaching staff in such schools throughout the execution of the project; (b) reduce the nominal scholarship budget for higher education by 3.7 percent per year from FY1988 through FY1991, and will not grant other subsidies for non-academic services to students to compensate for this reduction; (c) prepare school maintenance procedures and manuals, discuss them with IDA and introduce them not later than September 30, 1988 and cause the inspectorates to provide adequate maintenance supervision thereafter; (d) cause the project accounts to be audited annually and disbursement against statements of expenditures to be audited semi-annually by an independent auditor, acceptable to IDA, and forward the audit reports to IDA for review within six months of the end of the Government's fiscal year, starting in 1987; and (e) submit to IDA semi-annual project reports starting by the period ending December 31, 1987, and, within six months of the project closing date, a final report summarizing the project achievements.

2.4 In addition to the above agreements, the following condition of Credit effectiveness was also agreed upon: effectiveness of the cofinancing by the Federal Republic of Germany. This condition of Credit effectiveness was complied with by Niger to the satisfaction of the Bank and the Credit was declared effective on May 11, 1987.

### D. EVALUATION OF PROJECT OBJECTIVES

2.5 During the early 1980's, the country's extremely low literacy rate of about 14 percent remained stagnant, and the primary school enrollment decreased (para. 2.1). Despite Niger's low enrollment ratios, the share of the Government budget devoted to education (21 percent) was above average for Sub-Saharan Africa. Simulations have shown that if policies had remained unchanged, the primary school enrollment ratio would have declined (from 25 percent in 1984 to 14 percent in year 2000) even under an optimistic assumption of a two percent real annual growth in the education budget. Thus, the Government realized that if the stagnation and deterioration of the education sector were allowed to continue, the low level of human resources development would have had serious detrimental effects on the country's long-term economic growth prospects.

2.6 A concerted effort had been made to promote a dialogue on education policy and to improve the Bank Group's understanding of the sector as well as the Government's appreciation of the Bank Group's criteria for education financing. The mains elements of the

strategy were formulated in the summer of 1985 by an Interministeriel Committee for Structural Reform, and discussed with IDA in connection with the Structural Adjustment Credit No. 1660-NIR. These elements were further clarified at the beginning of the 1985/86 school year when the Government took measures of major importance for positive adjustment and reform in the education sector. Within the context of the overall structural adjustment program, the formulation of the Government's adjustment strategy for the education sector had the dual objective of (a) preventing further decline in primary education enrollment and (b) laying the foundation for future development as seen from a macroeconomic perspective.

2.7 In assessing the objectives, it should be noted that they have a general clarity. Goals fall directly under the country's own macroeconomic framework and structural adjustment program and are in harmony with the Bank's country assistance strategy. Overall, the project was successful in meeting its principal goals (paras. 3.1-3.8).

## IMPLEMENTATION EXPERIENCE AND RESULTS

### A. ASSESSMENT OF PROJECT'S SUCCESS AND SUSTAINABILITY

3.1 Success in achieving the project's main objective of assisting the Government in reversing the decline in the primary school enrollment ratio, is evidenced by the fact that this ratio--which declined from 27 percent in 1980 to 25 percent in 1984--increased to about 30 percent in 1994, in spite of a 15 percent increase in the primary school-age population during that period. The share of girls in total enrollment increased slightly by one percent. The high rate of growth in the school-age population, constituted a serious obstacle to rapid expansion in the coverage of primary education. Although primary school enrollment increased from 251,400 students to 445,500, or by some 77 percent between 1984 and 1994, more than three-fourths of this increase was required just to retrieve the 1980 coverage level and to keep pace with population growth.

3.2 *Reducing recurrent unit costs.* The efficiency gains implemented under the project were instrumental in reducing the unit recurrent cost per primary school student from US\$77 to US\$62. Unit recurrent costs were reduced by (a) limiting the need of recruiting high cost *instituteurs* (IN) in the teaching force, the remaining being *instituteurs adjoints* (INA)--the starting salary of the former exceeds that of the latter by 50 percent; and (b) introducing the use of double-shift teaching in urban areas--one teacher teaches one group of pupils in the morning and another in the afternoon using the same facilities; and expanding multigrade teaching in rural areas--one teacher teaches two grades in the same classroom. Until 1989, the proportion of *instituteurs adjoints* was limited to 14 percent, and then increased to 19 percent. Because the output of the teachers' training colleges (TTC) consisted of 46 percent *instituteurs* (between 1990 and 1993) started to jeopardize the project's objective, the Government, as of October 1994, began recruitment into TTC on the basis of 85 percent INA and 15 percent IN. This change in recruitment will help contain the future growth in the teacher salary budget. In 1989/90, the primary education system accounted for 139 classes using double-shift teaching (largely above the 40 urban experimental classes provided for in the project) when, due to growing political instability in Niger, the student and teachers' union



rejected double-shift teaching along with the scholarship reduction policy. Despite this halt, IDA continued the sector dialogue with the Government and teachers' unions. This intensified dialogue led to the continued implementation of double shift-teaching which increased to 207 classes in SY1993/94, and to 680 classes in SY1995/96 with an enrollment of 69,596 students. Because of the increased use of multigrade and double-shift teaching, the pupil/teacher ratio, which declined from 41 in 1980 to 36 in 1984, increased to 40 in 1994.

3.3 *Improving the quality and relevance of primary education.* The efficiency measures described above were implemented without impairing educational quality improvement. At project appraisal, only 20 percent of those who sat for the primary school leaving examination in 1985, passed. This percentage increased from 25 percent in 1989 to 33 percent in 1994. The transition rate from primary to lower secondary education also increased from 23 percent to 30 percent. Although the repetition rates of 3 to 16 percent in grades one through five constituted an improvement, the rate in grade six of 42 percent is due to the lack of places in lower secondary. This high repetition rate in grade six is being addressed under the follow-up project. The pre-service and in-service training was modified and enhanced for quality improvement. The ineffective and costly four-year pre-service teacher training was abandoned. Graduates from lower secondary schools undergo two years of training to become *instituteurs adjoints*, and those graduates from the upper-cycle complete a one-year training program to become *instituteurs*. In addition, the organizational structure as well as the training program content were reformed to allow students enrolled in pre-service training to gain practical experience and to develop synergy and interaction between pre-service and in-service training.

3.4 As regards the in-service training, it has been run through about 500 teachers' study groups established in networks of closely located schools, and under the supervision of senior teachers and/or pedagogic advisors, and school inspectors. This method has proven to be more cost-effective than a large, centrally organized seminar which implied long distance travel for teachers and payment of per diems. Through the in-service training programs: (a) 420 unqualified teachers (*moniteurs auxiliaires*) have been upgraded to semi-qualified teachers (*moniteurs*); and (b) 2,963 semi-qualified or qualified teachers and primary school directors have been retrained. To further ensure quality of education, the project provided about one million textbooks and 12,000 teachers' guides including: (a) one book per two pupils in reading for grades two through four, in mathematics for grade three, in social sciences for grades three and four; and (b) one mathematics workbook per pupil for grades one and two.

3.5 *Reducing unit capital costs and improving access to primary education.* Unit capital costs were reduced through the development of low-cost primary school construction techniques. The average cost per classroom of CFA franc 2,178,000 (before the devaluation of that currency) under self-help construction was lower than was estimated. After the devaluation of the CFA franc, the unit cost per classroom increased to CFA franc 3 million. As compared to classrooms built in 1985 (under the supervision of the Ministry of Public Works) by the private sector for the administration and those constructed under the Education I project, the average cost was lower, by 50 percent and 31 percent (in nominal terms), respectively.

3.6 To increase access, the project supported the construction and rehabilitation of classrooms. A total of 982 classrooms (including 82 classrooms for the experimental phase) were built and equipped; thus increasing enrollment by about 45,100 pupils as compared to the SAR target of building 750 classrooms and creating 34,000 additional places. This was achieved through the reduction in unit capital costs; and through reallocation of credit funds of SDR 700,000 derived from the following savings: (a) SDR 500,000, through the decentralization of the in-service training of approximately 3,500 teachers and directors (para. 3.4); (b) SDR 100,000, through the early replacement of 5 long-term foreign technical assistants with local staff and short-term technical assistance; and (c) SDR 100,000 through unrealized contingencies covered by the "unallocated" disbursement category. The project rehabilitated 1,913 existing classrooms or 63 and 95 percent of the initial and revised SAR targets respectively. Due to cost-underestimation at appraisal and to the ambitious target of rehabilitating 46 percent of the existing classrooms, the number of classrooms to be rehabilitated was brought down to 2,000. The project provided 2,300 tool kits for school maintenance as well as school maintenance manuals for teachers and school directors. Although, several workshops were organized to train teachers in maintenance procedures, the strategy of promoting maintenance by school users was not effective because of a lack of incentives for teachers and weak supervision from school inspectors in that area.

3.7 *Promoting more cost-effective resource utilization.* The amount allocated to the higher education scholarships budget was to be reduced by 3.7 percent per year from FY1988 until the end of FY1991. Although the condition was met in 1988, the scholarship budget increased from CFA franc 2.1 to CFA franc 2.4 billion from FY1989 to FY1991 which showed an effort to contain the scholarship budget during those years. Unfortunately, this effort was not maintained after 1991. Following the National Conference in 1992, from which students (who led the pro-democratic movement) extracted dramatic advantages, the scholarships budget reached CFA franc 4.5 billion. A new policy for higher education scholarships is being implemented under the follow-up project which aims at bringing the scholarship budget down to CFA franc 3.5 billion by 1998/99. Additional adjustment measures were also implemented. In addition to limiting the proportion of IN (para. 3.2), the teaching indemnities for persons trained as teachers but occupying administrative posts were abolished as well as the automatic recruitment of graduates into the civil service; and boarding facilities were closed at *lycées*. Despite the increase in the scholarship budget, the implementation of the combined efficiency measures helped in reallocating education resources to favor primary education: the share of primary education in the Government's total recurrent education budget increased from 40 percent in 1986 to 45 percent in 1994. The Government investment budget provided CFA franc 600 million annually for primary school classroom construction.

3.8 *Strengthening educational planning and management.* The project supported the computerization of the Ministry of Education for: (a) personnel management; (b) budget preparation and control; (c) scholarship allocation and monitoring; and (d) administration of examinations and school guidance. This computerization had been held up until July 1992 due to an internal country dispute over the exoneration of project-financed goods and services from duties and taxes. All concerned directorates were equipped, and the staff trained. Although the system is in place, it is not yet fully operational. Thus, it is premature to assess if there is a significant improvement in the management of human, physical, and financial

resources. Regarding education planning, the support given by the project has allowed for an increased capacity in the collection and analysis of data and in the development of school mapping. However, the Planning Directorate was unable to realize all the studies foreseen under the project due, in part, to the insufficient number of personnel capable of undertaking them. Being a developing country, Niger is generally weak in areas such as management, planning, and monitoring of resource use. The education sector employs the single largest group in the civil service--more than one-third. Its capacity to manage change has been successful under the project under review, but it remains to be seen if this will also be the case in further education development.

3.9 During the project's implementation period, development of primary education was made with a view toward future sustainability. Major components contributed directly to sustainability i.e., (a) budget reallocations in favor of primary education; (b) more efficient resource use; and (c) increased community participation. A particularly promising achievement was made in classroom construction, in which unit costs decreased. The adjustment measures which met considerable resistance from students and teachers' unions, when initiated, have matured and are now well internalized by ministry staff and the teachers' unions. To deepen and sustain the education reforms, the Government developed an Emergency Education Rehabilitation Plan (EERP) in which absolute priority is given to expansion and quality improvements of primary education. The EERP (supported by the Basic Education Sector Project/Hybrid--CR. 2618-NIR) includes a set of policy measures designed to further promote more cost-effective use of public education resources. Thus, the project's sustainability can be ranked as "likely".

## **B. SUMMARY OF COSTS AND FINANCING ARRANGEMENTS**

3.10 The total cost of the project (Table 7A) was estimated at appraisal to be US\$26.2 million equivalent with the Government contributing US\$1.4 million equivalent to finance local construction material--laterite and sand--and part of the operating costs. Financing was provided by the following: (a) IDA, US\$18.4 million equivalent; (b) a grant from the Kingdom of Norway of US\$4.7 million equivalent financed procurement of textbooks and rehabilitation of primary schools including school furniture; and (c) a grant from the Federal Republic of Germany--through KfW--of US\$1.7 million equivalent financed a part of the primary school construction program. Total disbursements of IDA's Credit at ICR preparation (US\$20.8 million) were higher than projected at appraisal due to changes in the US\$/SDR exchange rate. The grants from Norway and Germany were fully disbursed. The Government experienced difficulties in mobilizing the counterpart funds foreseen. A grant from the Netherlands signed on May 10, 1994, assisted the Government in absorbing arrears. The estimated and actual disbursements are given in Table 4.

## **C. IMPLEMENTATION SCHEDULE**

3.11 The project was adequately prepared. To further the education sector dialogue between Niger and the Bank Group, in November 1984 IDA organized a seminar in Niamey to review, together with Government officials, alternative policies designed to accelerate the development of primary education. The discussions were supported by findings derived from

an education simulation model used to study the effects on primary school enrollment of alternatives policies. The discussions continued during IDA missions to Niamey in February, June, and September 1985, and especially, during a three-week visit to Washington in August 1985 by three high-level officials from the Ministry of Education. In the course of this visit, new and more comprehensive simulations were prepared by the Nigerien officials, assisted by IDA staff. These analyses and exchanges of views between IDA and the Government constituted an important input into the formulation of the Government's Education Strategy and served, in turn, as background material for the preparation of the Project as well as for the element of the Structural Adjustment Credit dealing with the education sector (para. 2.7). The IDA appraisal mission visited Niger in November/December 1985, Board approval was given on November 18, 1986, and signing of the Development Credit Agreement took place on December 15, 1986. The Credit effectiveness date was May 11, 1987. The project was executed over a period of eight and a half years, compared with an original execution period of seven years. The original closing date of June 30, 1994 was first extended to December 31, 1994 and further extended to December 31, 1995 (para. 4.1). Disbursements against commitments were made until April 30, 1996. An outstanding balances of SDR 0.25 million (about US\$0.36 million equivalent in 1996) under the IDA Credit was canceled at Credit closing. The Norwegian and KfW Grants were fully disbursed.

#### **D. ANALYSIS OF KEY FACTORS AFFECTING MAJOR OBJECTIVES**

3.12 At appraisal stage, there were at least two main risks: first, the MOE had no previous experience in implementing IDA-financed projects and had limited or inadequate technical expertise in certain fields, particularly in low-cost classroom construction; and second, the goal of reducing education unit costs through a cost-saving measure of recruiting *instituteurs adjoints* (INA) rather than *instituteurs* (IN) was a more difficult and risky goal due to pressure for status quo from within the educational establishment. To overcome the first risk, the MOE was equipped with a project coordinating unit (PCU) and a school construction bureau (BIES) to implement the construction and rehabilitation program. A sizable staff training program for the PCU and BIES and the provision of specialist services helped address this risk. The BIES and the PCU are now fully operational and totally composed of national technicians. The PCU was transformed into a permanent directorate of the MOE under a new name (Education Projects Directorate) and with a responsibility of managing all education projects regardless of sources of funding. To facilitate the implementation of the second goal, several consultations with the teachers' union were conducted. In addition, targeted measures such as teacher training, and provision of sufficient textbooks helped overcome the initial handicaps. The severe delays regarding the computerization of the MOE were mainly due to unforeseeable factors (para. 3.8). The issue was addressed to both the Bank's and the Government's satisfaction.

#### **E. ASSESSMENT OF THE BANK'S AND THE BORROWER'S PERFORMANCE**

3.13 The *Bank's performance* was satisfactory, and contributed to the achievement of most of the objectives initially established for the project. The Resident Mission provided guidance to the MOE, followed-up on issues which arose, and held regular discussions with the MOE on project implementation. Despite delays at project start-up in the school construction and

textbook programs (paras. 4.2 and 4.3), the *Borrower's performance* in project implementation was generally satisfactory. In some areas, the Borrower performed particularly well, notably, in implementing the efficiency measures. However, the Borrower's performance could have been better if the technical studies provided for in the SAR had been carried out. The project, throughout its supervision, was given a performance rating of "2" on overall status as well as on achievement of project development objectives. During the first two years of implementation, project management performance was also rated "2", but was then given a "1" for the remaining four years.

## **F. ASSESSMENT OF PROJECT'S OUTCOME**

3.14 The Primary Education Development Project can be classified as satisfactory in reversing the trend of the declining enrollment ratio between 1980 and 1984, and in its effort to expand primary education through efficient use of education resources. The project made considerable progress in helping the Borrower to achieve major efficiency gains by reducing unit recurrent and capital costs, and laying the foundation for better quality of education through efficient teacher training and provision of textbooks.

## **SUMMARY OF FINDINGS, FUTURE OPERATIONS AND KEY LESSONS LEARNED**

### **A. IMPORTANT FINDINGS OF PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION EXPERIENCE**

4.1 For the most part, execution of this project and disbursement were on schedule throughout the life of the project and covenants were in compliance. Disbursement procedures were regularly followed resulting in no rejections from the Bank and no negative comments from the auditors. Further, regular supervision took place and despite a change in Task Manager, no negative impact was experienced. However, a reallocation of the IDA Credit and the Norwegian grant took place which allowed for the completion of the construction of 750 classrooms. A further one-year extension was given which allowed for further classroom construction. Being the first project entirely executed by the Ministry of Education (the First Education Project was under the direction of the Ministry of Rural Development), there were some lags (in the construction and textbook program ) at project launch which were made up throughout the course of the of project implementation.

4.2 Of the 750 initial classrooms program, about 500 were to be built by the *travaux communautaires* (TC--a force account organization under the Office of the President of the Republic); and about 250 by the *ateliers scolaires* (ASC--the workshops of the inspectorates). The most important reason for the delay in project start-up was the Government resistance within the Ministry of Public Works (*Travaux Publics* - TP) to give up its monopoly vis-à-vis the Government's construction activities. The experience with the TP under the First Education Project with a pilot program of 60 classrooms was not conclusive. It took three and one-half years for the TP to build uncompleted classrooms with very high unit cost. For school rehabilitation, the price demanded by the TC was about ten times that foreseen in the SAR. As regards construction, the TC proposed a unit cost 33 percent above the price

achieved by BIES. In addition, the TC requested 40 percent of the total amount of the three-year contract to be paid in advance with no bank guarantee. Clearly, neither of these conditions were acceptable. As regards the ASC, it seemed as though during the project's first-year, their capacity to build 250 classrooms was overestimated. Thus, IDA, supported by Germany and Norway who cofinanced the project, requested that the entire construction and rehabilitation program be transferred under the total responsibility of BIES. The transfer was a success due to a change in strategy which was essentially based upon the use of local materials (in order to avoid importing materials). Construction of the two prototypes from local materials and having vaulted ceilings did not give the expected results as the technique was not perfected and construction time was long. Achieving the vaulted ceilings was fastidious work and necessitated skilled laborers; large-scale construction would be nearly impossible in rural areas. Thus, the prototype was abandoned and others were constructed, one of which was adopted by BIES. The technique used, which is very simple, was mastered by local builders, and construction time was 45 days. BIES, through the use of local masons, constructed more than 100 classrooms in less than one year. In addition to reducing construction costs (para. 3.5), the approach used was very popular as it generated work at the village level.

4.3 With regard to textbooks, the project supported the creation of a national capacity to develop textbooks and teachers' guides for primary education, and the printing and distribution of these materials. The main weakness was to rely on civil servants at the National Pedagogical Institute (INDRAP) for preparation of the manuscripts rather than on the private sector. It took Niger about five years to produce and provide to schools the first book under the project, because the staff needed to be trained and the national capacity to be developed. However the shortage that occurred during that time could have been avoided had the Government been more willing to import textbooks from abroad as a stop-gap measure until national manuscripts could be developed and tested. The Government even resisted acquiring textbooks which were developed for francophone West African countries, and which existed on the international market in subject areas such as mathematics, science, and reading. Given the important delays that occurred, the Government agreed to: use the private sector for editorial assistance and co-editing arrangements with foreign publishers; print the books abroad; and import existing textbooks from the international market. This agreement helped speed up the provision of textbooks to students (para. 3.4).

## **B. FUTURE OPERATIONS AND SUSTAINABILITY**

4.4 Future operations will be developed in accordance with the Country Assistance Strategy which is designed to (a) address long-term human capital including reduction of poverty; (b) promote private sector development; (c) increase efficiency of public resource management; and (d) support actions to facilitate supply response. Because of the low primary school enrollment ratio, emphasis will continue to be placed upon expanding access to, and improving the quality of, primary education to raise the general education level of the population. Moreover, measures aiming at further increasing the communities' involvement in the provision of education will be provided for with a view to further improving girls' access and expanding access to rural areas. The new Basic Education Sector Project/Hybrid (PROSEF--Cr. 2618-NIR, effective on September 26, 1995) which aims at reaching a gross enrollment ratio of 35 percent by 1999, builds directly on, and seeks to further, the positive

results of the project under review. The practical and operational character of the instruments developed during project preparation are expected to be of great help in implementation.

4.5 Future operations will also strengthen the links between the education system, the labor market, and national development needs. To meet basic technical skills requirements, while continuing the expansion of primary education, it will be necessary to support post-primary education by improving the overall quality of general secondary, technical and vocational training, and higher education.

### **C. LESSONS FOR FUTURE PROJECTS IN THE SECTOR**

4.6 Although the project met its goal, the public sector is not yet equipped to provide sufficient educational services because of its limited resources and the rapid population growth. A major lesson learned from this project is that new complementary ways of delivering educational services (without placing a burden on the Government's recurrent cost budget) will have to be employed such as community-based and private schools.

4.7 A second lesson learned is that flexibility is required to address unforeseen circumstances during implementation. The Bank and the Borrower demonstrated flexibility during project implementation which helped address issues arising during implementation such as initial delays in the construction program and textbook provision.

4.8 A third lesson to be drawn from this project is the importance of consensus-building to gain wide acceptance for reforms among the various groups affected at the national level. Restrictive reforms and changes which affect the concerned urban groups--teachers' union and University students--are invariably resisted by those groups. Thus, the rationale behind foreseen outcomes and improvements, must be explained and discussed before implementation.

4.9 The fourth lesson concerns the long-term process of improving the national capacity to develop manuscripts and produce textbooks. The textbook production program was delayed due to an over-ambitious assessment at appraisal of the capacity of the National Institute for Pedagogical Documentation, Research and Promotion (INDRAP) (composed of civil servants) to develop and test manuscripts for new textbooks and teachers' guides. To avoid delays, manuscript preparation should be entrusted to private authors who have the capacity to deliver. The ongoing project is supporting the development of quality control at INDRAP.

4.10 The lessons learned from this project, as well as the First Education Project, have been built into the new Basic Education Project and will be further elaborated in future operations.





## **PART II: STATISTICAL TABLES**

Table 1:	Summary of Assessments
Table 2:	Related Bank Loans/Credits
Table 3:	Project Timetable
Table 4:	Loan/Credit Disbursements: Cumulative Estimated and Actual
Table 5:	Key Indicators for Project Implementation
Table 6:	Studies Included in the Project
Table 7A:	Project Costs
Table 7B:	Project Financing
Table 8:	Status of Legal Covenants
Table 9:	Bank Resources: Staff Inputs
Table 10:	Bank Resources: Missions



**Table 1: Summary of Assessments**

A. <u>Achievement of objectives</u>	<u>Substantial</u>	<u>Partial</u>	<u>Negligible</u>	<u>Not applicable</u>
Macro policies	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sector policies	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Financial objectives	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Institutional development	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Physical objectives	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Poverty reduction	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Gender Issues	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Other social objectives	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Environmental objectives	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Public sector management	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Private sector development	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
B. <u>Project sustainability</u>	<u>Likely</u>	<u>Unlikely</u>	<u>Uncertain</u>	
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
C. <u>Bank Performance</u>	<u>Highly Satisfactory</u>	<u>Satisfactory</u>	<u>Deficient</u>	
Identification	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Preparation assistance	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Appraisal	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Supervision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
D. <u>Borrower Performance</u>	<u>Highly Satisfactory</u>	<u>Satisfactory</u>	<u>Deficient</u>	
Identification	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Preparation assistance	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Appraisal	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Supervision	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
E. <u>Assessment of Outcome</u>	<u>Highly Satisfactory</u>	<u>Satisfactory</u>	<u>Highly Unsatisfactory</u>	<u>Unsatisfactory</u>
	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Table 2: Related Bank Loans/Credits

Loan/credit title	Purpose	Year of approval	Status
<i>Preceding operations</i>			
1. Education I (Cr. 1151-NIR)	Assist the government to: (a) improve educational planning and prepare future education projects; (b) formulate policies and programs for upgrading key civil service personnel; and (c) upgrade the quality and expand the output of middle-level technicians and extension workers in agriculture and animal production.	1981	Closed
<i>Following operations</i>			
1. Basic Education Sector Project/Hybrid (CR. 2618-NIR)	Support the implementation of the Government Emergency Education Rehabilitation Plan (EERP). The project is a hybrid comprised of (a) a Sectoral Reform Program supported by general budgetary assistance released in two tranches, and designed to promote more cost-effective use of public education resources; and (b) a Sector Investment Program designed to increase access to and quality of primary education and to improve the Government's capacity to plan and manage resource use in the sector.	1994	Ongoing

**Table 3: Project Timetable**

Steps in project cycle	Date planned	Date actual/ latest estimate
Identification	November 1984	November 1984
Preparation	Feb., June, Sept. 1985	Feb., June, Sept. 1985
Appraisal	Nov.-Dec. 1985	Nov.-Dec. 1985
Negotiations	September 9, 1986	September 9, 1986
Board presentation	November 18, 1986	November 18, 1986
Signing	December 15, 1986	December 15, 1986
Effectiveness	May 11, 1987	May 11, 1987
Project completion	June 30, 1994	December 31, 1995
Loan closing	December 31, 1995	December 31, 1995

**Table 4: Loan/Credit Disbursements: Cumulative Estimated and Actual**  
(US\$ million)

	FY87	FY88	FY89	FY90	FY91	FY92	FY93	FY94	FY95	FY96
Appraisal estimate	.50	1.1	2.3	4.0	6.0	8.9	14.0	17.6	18.4	18.4
Actual	.45	.71	2.45	5.07	9.71	12.89	14.97	16.03	19.09	20.85
Actual as % of estimate	90	65	106	126	161	144	107	91	103	113
Date of final disbursement										April 30, 1996

**Table 5: Key Indicators for Project Implementation**

Objectives	Key Indicators	Results	Observations
<b>1. REDUCTION OF CONSTRUCTION UNIT COSTS AND IMPROVING ACCESS TO PRIMARY EDUCATION.</b>	A. Construction of 750 classrooms and furnishing of 18,750 <i>tables-bancs</i> 750 teachers' desks, 1,500 chairs and 750 armoires	A. 832 classrooms constructed and furnished 24,537 <i>tables-bancs</i> , 980 teachers' desks, 1,961 chairs and 980 armoires.	Following a reallocation of the IDA funds, 150 additional classrooms were constructed in 1995 including 82 experimental.
	B. Construction and equipping of 150 classrooms (2nd extension)	B. 150 classrooms constructed and equipped.	
	Rehabilitation of 3,000 classrooms	1,913 classrooms rehabilitated.	Original objective was reduced to 2,000 due to cost underestimation at appraisal.
	Replacement of classroom furniture in rehabilitated classrooms 18,000 <i>tables-bancs</i> 600 teachers' desks, 1,800 chairs and 300 armoires	17,134 <i>tables-bancs</i> , 533 desks, 1,800 chairs, 300 armoires replaced or repaired.	Objective achieved.
	Creation of a maintenance program	Maintenance manuals written and distributed in the schools.	Objective achieved; implementation will continue.
	Furnishing of maintenance tools	2,300 tool kits distributed to schools.	Objective achieved.
	Increase in total enrollment during the period 1986-87/1991-92 in primary education of approximately 34,000 students	Total enrollment in primary education increased from 251,400 students in 1984 to 445,500 in 1994, an increase of 77%.	Objective achieved. The enrollment ratio which declined from 27% in 1980 to 25% in 1984, increased to about 30% in 1994.
	Reduce inequalities: A. Increase in girls' education  B. Increase in education in rural zones	A. The proportion of girls in enrollment remained stable at 37.4% in 94-95 compared to 36% since the beginning of the project. B. Education in rural zones remains low: 20.2% in 1993.	With regard to reducing inequalities (geographic and gender), supplementary means are integrated in the follow-up project.
	Reduction in construction unit costs	Classrooms now cost 2,178,000 CFAF (1994) compared with 4,369,600 CFAF in 1984. With the devaluation, classrooms cost approx. 3,000,000 CFAF.	Objective largely achieved.

Table 5: Key Indicators for Project Implementation

(Continued)

Objectives	Key Indicators	Results	Observations
<b>2. REDUCING RECURRENT COSTS AND IMPROVING QUALITY OF PRIMARY EDUCATION</b>	Double-shift teaching in 40 urban classrooms	680 double-shift classes in 1995-96.	Objective largely achieved. Pedagogy by objective introduced, a change in the pedagogic approach.
	Investment budget (construction)	Each year the State allocates 600 million CFAF for the construction of 120 classes.	Initially the State should construct 150 classes per year, but because of the devaluation, it is limited to the construction of 120.
	Increase teacher/student ratio	From 36 students/teacher in 1984-85 to 40 students/teacher in 1994.	Because of the increased use of double-shift and multigrade teaching, the student/teacher ratio which declined from 41 in 1980 to 36 in 1989, increased.
	Reduction of 3.7% per year for scholarship expenses during the fiscal years 1987-91 without giving other grants to students for non-university services	In 1991, the budget allocated to higher education scholarships (2.37 billion CFAF) was consistent with the objectives. The slippage occurred following the National Conference in 1992/93, when the scholarship figure reached 4.855 billion CFAF.	A new policy for higher education scholarships is being implemented which aims at decreasing the amount to 3.5 billion CFAF by 1998-99.
	Reduction in the repeater average (14% in 1985)	Repetition rate of 3 to 16% in grades one to five.	Grade six: 42% due to lack of places in lower secondary.
	Increase in pass rate of <i>fin de cycle</i> exams	Between 1989 and 1994, the results of the CFEPD increased from 25 to 33.	Improvement in relation to 1985 (base year), level of 20%.
	<p>A limit of 14% on the number of <i>instituteurs</i> in the teaching corps</p> <p>In-service training and equipment distribution:</p> <p>A. 420 <i>moniteurs auxiliaires</i> to be trained</p> <p>B. 1,800 <i>moniteurs</i> and <i>instituteurs adjoints</i> to be trained</p> <p>C. 1,250 school directors to be trained</p> <p>D. Workshops for <i>écoles normales</i> personnel</p>	<p>The qualified teachers corps is filled.</p> <p>Personnel trained "in-service" and equipment distributed:</p> <p>A. 420 <i>moniteurs auxiliaires</i></p> <p>B. 1,757 <i>moniteurs</i> and <i>instituteurs adjoints</i></p> <p>C. 1,206 school directors</p> <p>D. Eight workshops took place for 465 personnel of the <i>écoles normales</i></p>	<p>The streamlining process is underway: henceforth, recruiting in the <i>écoles normales</i> are now made on the basis of 15% <i>instituteurs</i> and 85% <i>instituteurs adjoints</i>.</p> <p>In-service training and equipment distribution:</p> <p>A. Objective achieved.</p> <p>B. Objective achieved.</p> <p>C. Objective achieved.</p> <p>D. 298 <i>instituteurs</i> and pedagogic advisors trained.</p>

Table 5: Key Indicators for Project Implementation

(Continued)

Objectives	Key Indicators	Results	Observations
	<p>E. Furnishing of textbooks and teachers' guides: -Training for textbooks</p> <p>-Preparation of 44 textbooks in 5 subjects -Printing of approximately 1 million textbooks.</p> <p>Adaptation of primary education programs</p> <p>Distribution of 1 book per 2 students in primary in principal subj. matters</p>	<p>E. Furnished textbooks and teachers' guides.</p> <p>-Training for 53 authors (editors, illustrators, photographers) in Niger and abroad. -Production and distribution of 30 titles.</p> <p>-Production and purchase of 1,049,839 textbooks and teachers' guides.</p> <p>August -September 1987, Realization of programs (113 participants).</p> <p>In 1993-94 the book/student ratio was 0.48% and 0.5% in 1994-95.</p>	<p>Furnished textbooks and teachers' guides.</p> <p>National Textbook Committee now exists.</p> <p>Objective surpassed except with regard to French.</p> <p>Objective achieved.</p> <p>Objective achieved.</p>
<p><b>3. STRENGTHENING OF EDUCATION PLANNING</b></p>	<p>Strengthening of human resources and financial management:</p> <p>A. Improving the administrative and budgetary procedures B. Computerizing the MEN/ES/R C. Construction of 7 educational workshops D. Construction of 16 inspectorate offices including 8 new E. Furnishing of 8 vehicles to the new offices</p> <p>A. 42 man months of long-term specialists services B. 74 man months of short-term specialists services     Training program C. 48 man months of scholarships abroad in the areas of planning, education statistics and education mapping D. 69 man months of seminars on statistics and education mapping</p> <p>Creation of a Project Coordination Bureau</p> <p>Increase in the budget allocated to primary education</p>	<p>A. In the process of being realized. B. In the process of being realized. C. Five of 7 were constructed.</p> <p>E. Achieved.</p> <p>A. 48 man months of long-term specialists services. B. 4 man months of short-term specialists services.</p> <p>C. 33 man months of scholarships for training abroad.</p> <p>D. 89.5 man months of seminars organized.</p> <p>Realized.</p> <p>From 40% in 1986, the primary education share in the national education budget was 45% in 1994</p>	<p>D. Revision from 16 to 7 inspectorates.</p> <p>E. Objective achieved.</p> <p>D. Objective achieved.</p> <p>Objective achieved.</p> <p>Increase of 5 percentage points of budget allocated to primary education 1986-94.</p>



Table 6: Studies Included in Project

Study	Status	Impact of study
1. Comparison of performances of experimental and non-experimental schools.		
2. Development of an regional educational map to serve as a model for all of Niger.	Undertaken, first half of 1993	Two counterparts in the DEP were trained as well as representatives of the DEST and DEPD. However the low level of understanding of those responsible for continuing the activities may handicap the follow up.
3. Study of the textbook distribution policy in Niger.	Undertaken in	
4. How to increase education by encouraging the participation of local collectivities to construct, maintain, and promote the school.	May 1994.	A workshop should have taken place to share the results of the study, compare the conclusions with the various people responsible for education, collect suggestions and criticisms, and debate the conditions of corrective measures. Results remain within the DEP due to a lack of someone to carry out the workshop.

Table 7A: Project Costs

Item	Appraisal estimate (US\$M)		
	Local Costs	Foreign Costs	Total
<b>1. Reduction of Unit Recurrent costs and Quality Improvements</b>			
(a) Teacher Training	2.3	0.1	2.3
(b) Multi-grade and double-shift teaching	0.1	0.2	0.2
(c) Textbook development, adaptation, production	0.6	2.6	3.2
<b>2. Reduction of Unit Capital Costs and Improvement in Access</b>			
(a) Construction of 750 classrooms	3.1	1.8	4.9
(b) Rehabilitation of 3,000 classrooms	0.8	1.3	2.1
(c) Establishment of maintenance program	0.0	0.1	0.2
<b>3. Promotion of More Cost-Effective Use of Education Resources</b>			
(a) Strengthening of Resource Management	0.3	1.7	2.0
(b) Reinforcement of Planning	0.6	2.3	2.9
(c) Establishment of Implementation Capacity	0.3	1.3	1.5
Total Base Costs	8.0	11.2	19.2
Physical Contingencies	0.5	0.6	1.1
Price Contingencies	2.6	3.3	5.9
<b>Total</b>	<b>11.1</b>	<b>15.1</b>	<b>26.2</b>

Table 7B: Project Financing

Source	Appraisal estimate (US\$M)	Actual/latest estimate (US\$M)
IDA	18.4	20.8
The Kingdom of Norway	4.7	4.7
Federal Republic of Germany	1.7	1.7
Government	1.4	1.4
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>26.2</b>	<b>29.6</b>

**Table 8: Status of Legal Covenants**

Agreement	Section	Present status	Description of covenant	Comments
BOARD	3.03	C	Maintain PCU during execution of project with such responsibilities, powers, services, and facilities as are specified in Schedule 5 of the DCA.	No Comments.
	3.04 A	C	Not later than June 30 of each year furnish to IDA: (1) draft 3-year rolling investment budget allocated to education sector; (2) annual program for classroom construction under project; (3) draft annual recurrent budget for upcoming FY.	(ii) Programs annually discussed during SPN missions; (iii) the 1995 draft Budget was discussed during December 1994 mission.
	3.04B	CP	Reduce by at least 3.7 percentage points per year from FY88 until end of FY91 the amounts allocated for higher education nominal scholarship budget, and not grant other subsidies for non-academic services for students.	Condition met for FY88. However, from FY89 to FY90 scholarship budget increased from CFAF 2.1 billion to CFAF 2.4 billion from FY89 to FY91.
	3.05	CD	Recruit and promote teachers in a manner guaranteeing that percentage of <i>Instituteurs</i> teaching in primary schools does not exceed 14% of total teacher staff in primary school throughout the execution of the project.	Percentage of about 6% for school year 1988/89 and 19% for 1989/90. Recruitment into the 4-year <i>Instituteur</i> program stopped in October 1989. To continue to limit the percentage of <i>Instituteur</i> all TTCs recruit trainees since October 1994 on a basis of 15% <i>Instituteurs</i> and 85% <i>Instituteurs Adjoints</i> .
	3.06	CD	Review with IDA not later than June 30 of each year progress made in achieving objectives of project and of education sector set forth in section 3.40 and 3.50 and in Schedule 2 of DCA.	A review was conducted during June/July 1994 mission and in October 1995.
	3.07	CD	(A) Not later than September 30, 1987 prepare and furnish IDA for review and approval a program for experimental double-shift teaching to be implemented not later than the beginning of October 1988 school year; (B) Not later than September 30 of each year, review with IDA said program's ongoing results and take into consideration IDA's comments; (C) Not later than September 30, 1991 review with IDA final results.	The experiment, started in October 1988 with 50 classes, was expanded to 139 in 1989 and reduced to 129 in 1990 (40 urban classes were planned in SAR). Double-shift is introduced now in about 500 classes.
	3.08	C	Not later than December 31, 1987 establish and maintain at INDRAP a publication unit, a training service for authors of educational publications and evaluation service.	Coordination between these three has improved.
	3.09	C	Prior to carrying out any new projects for the extension of INDRAP's printing capacity, Borrower shall submit to IDA for comments and exchange of views on economic and financial study of such project.	No Comments.

**Table 8: Status of Legal Covenants**

**(Continued)**

Agreement	Section	Present status	Description of covenant	Comments
BOARD	3.10	C	(A) Prepare and furnish IDA for review school maintenance procedures and manuals to be put into effect not later than September 30, 1988; (B) Cause the inspectorate to provide adequate maintenance supervision thereafter.	(a) Printing of maintenance manual is completed. Maintenance kits are delivered. (b) Training of Inspectors will be completed this year.
	3.11	CP	Cause all staff having received training abroad financed under the project to remain in their assignments for a period of at least 3 years after completion of such training.	No Comments.
	4.01	C	(A) Maintain adequate records and accounts; (B) Have records and accounts including those of the Special Account audited by independent auditors acceptable to IDA and furnish IDA with certified copy of audit report not later than 6 months after end of each semester of each FY: for all expenditures with respect to withdrawal from SA were made on basis of SOEs, have records audited semi-annually.	No Comments.

**Covenant types:**

- 1 = Accounts/audits
- 2 = Financial performance/revenue generation from beneficiaries
- 3 = Flow and utilization of project funds
- 4 = Counterpart funding
- 5 = Management aspects of the project or executing agency
- 6 = Environmental covenants
- 7 = Involuntary resettlement
- 8 = Indigenous people
- 9 = Monitoring, review, and reporting
- 10 = Project implementation not covered by categories 1-9
- 11 = Sectoral or cross-sectoral budgetary or other resource allocation
- 12 = Sectoral or cross-sectoral policy/ regulatory/institutional action
- 13 = Other

**Present status:**

- C = covenant complied with
- CD = complied with after delay
- CP = complied with partially
- NC = not complied with

Table 9: Bank Resources: Staff Inputs

<b>STAGE OF PROJECT CYCLE</b>	<b>REVISED WEEKS</b>	<b>ACTUAL WEEKS</b>
Through appraisal	91.6	91.6
Appraisal -- Board	40.6	40.6
Board -- effectiveness	7.5	8.7
Supervision	51.8	115.4
Completion	14.6	3.1
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>206.1</b>	<b>259.4</b>

Table 10: Bank Resources: Missions

Stage of project cycle	MM/YY	Nnbr. of persons	Days in Field	Specialized staff skills represented*	Perform.		Types of problems***
					Impl. Status**	Rating Dev. obj.**	
Through appraisal:	2/83	1	5	E			
	5/83	3	12	E, GE (2)			
	7/83	1	3	E			
	10-11/83	2	11	E, GE			
	3/84	4	10	GE, A, TE, TX			
	9-10/84	2	9	GE, A			
	11-84	2	8	GE, E			
	2-3/85	5	12	GE, EP, A/C, TX/C (2)			
	7/85	2	6	GE, EP			
Appraisal through Board approval	11-12/85	4	18	GE, EP, A/C, E/C			
	4/86	3	11	EP, A, E/C			
Board approval through effectiveness	2/87	2	8	A, EP			
	4/87	2	3	EP, TE/C			
Supervision	7-8/87	1	4	EP	2	2	M,O
	12/87	6	12	EP, A, E/C (2) S/C, GE	2	2	M,O
	5-6/88	4	9	EP, GE(2), GE/C	2	2	M,O
	9/88	3	16	EP, TE, E/C	No 590	No 590	--
	1-2/89	5	13	EP, GE, TX/C, A/C, GE/C	2	2	M,O
	7/89	3	19	EP, TX/C, A/C	2	2	O
	12/90	3	13	EP, GE/C, GE, TX/C, A	--	2	O
	2/91	1	15	A/C	2	2	O
	11/91	1	6	GE, PO/M	2	2	O
	7/92	3	14	EP, DC, TT	2	2	O
	2/93	1	7	EP, PO/M	2	2	O
	6/93	2	10	EP, DC, PO/M	2	2	O
	7/93	1	6	GE, PO/M	2	2	O
	12/93	3	18	EP, DC, PO/M	2	2	O
	8/94	1	7	EP	S	S	O
	1/95	3	15	EP, PO/M, PA/M	S	S	O
Completion	12/95	3	15	EP (2), PA	S	S	

\*Key to Specialized Staff Skills: A=Architect; DC= Division Chief; E=Economist; EP=Education Planner; GE=General Educator; OO=Operations Officer; PA=Projects Assistant; PO=Program Officer; TE=Technical Educator; TT=Teacher Trainer; TX=Textbook Specialist; -/C=Consultant; -/M=Resident Mission Staff

\*\* Key to status as shown on Supervision Form 590 from 1 (highest) to 4 (lowest)

\*\*\* Key to problems as shown on Supervision Form 590: F=Financial; M=Managerial; O=Other; T= Technical

**APPENDIX A**  
**MISSION'S AIDE-MEMOIRE**





**NIGER**  
**PROJET DE DEVELOPPEMENT DE L'ENSEIGNEMENT PRIMAIRE**  
**(CR.1740-NIR)**  
**PROJET SECTORIEL D'ENSEIGNEMENT FONDAMENTAL/HYBRIDE**  
**(CR.2618-NIR)**

**MISSION DE SUPERVISION IDA**  
**Octobre 16 - 31, 1995**

**AIDE-MEMOIRE**

1. Une mission de l'IDA conduite par M. Makha Ndao ; composée de Mme Margaret Kilo (spécialiste en éducation) ; MM. Pierre Nignon (chargé de programmes) ; Ross Pfile (assistant de programmes) ; et Mme Oumou Hainaikoye (assistante de projets) a séjourné au Niger du 16 au 31 octobre 1995. A la suite du Séminaire de lancement du PROSEF, Mme Thu-Ha Nguyen, du département de déboursement, a bien voulu accepter d'animer une séance de travail et de formation le samedi 4 novembre 1995 sur les aspects de décaissements au profit de la Direction des Projets Education et des responsables des composantes du nouveau projet. Mme Nguyen procédera aussi à la revue échantillonnée des états certifiés de dépenses du projet.

2. La mission a eu des discussions très enrichissantes avec leurs Excellences M. Jules Ouguet, Ministre de l'Enseignement Supérieur de la Recherche et de la Technologie assurant aussi l'intérim du Ministre de l'Education Nationale ; M. Almoustapha Soumaila, Ministre des Finances et du Plan; et Mme Mindaoudou Aichatou, Ministre du Développement Social, de la Population et de la Promotion de la femme, ainsi qu'avec les bailleurs de fonds, les ONGs, l'Association des Parents d'élèves, les syndicats des enseignants. La mission remercie vivement les responsables des services techniques des différents ministères, pour la richesse de leur contribution. La mission a aussi visité des écoles à Niamey et elle s'est rendue compte de la qualité des initiatives en cours. Elle remercie le Gouvernement pour lui avoir permis d'assister au séminaire de lancement du Projet Sectoriel d'Enseignement Fondamental (PROSEF). Ce genre de rencontre très ouverte avec la participation des partenaires sociaux de l'éducation (parents d'élèves, syndicat des enseignants), des autorités locales, des ONG et des bailleurs de fonds est fortement saluée par la mission.

3. La mission avait pour objectif de superviser le projet de développement de l'enseignement primaire (PRODEP) et de prendre part au séminaire de lancement du Projet Sectoriel d'Enseignement Fondamental (PROSEF). Elle devait aussi identifier les secteurs possibles d'intervention dans le cadre d'un éventuel projet portant sur l'enseignement technique et de la formation professionnelle. Il s'agit là d'une première mission d'exploration qui sera approfondie au cours des missions ultérieures.

4. Le présent aide-mémoire résume les principaux points discutés lors de la mission et les conclusions qui en découlent. La **Partie A** de l'aide-mémoire est relative au **Projet de Développement de l'Enseignement Primaire** ; la **Partie B** concerne le **Projet Sectoriel d'Enseignement fondamental**, les conclusions sur l'Enseignement Technique et la Formation Professionnelle figurent dans la **Partie C**. Les aide-mémoire de la mission de supervision IDA du 25 juillet au 14 août 1995 conduite par M. Pierre Nignon et Mme Oumou Hainikoye sur le PRODEP et le PROSEF, (voir **Partie D**) et de la mission d'exploration sur l'Enseignement Technique et la Formation Professionnelle conduite par M. André Komenan du 18 au 22 septembre (voir **Partie E**) font partie intégrante des conclusions de cette mission et figurent en annexe du présent document.

#### **PARTIE A.**

#### **PROJET DE DEVELOPPEMENT ENSEIGNEMENT PRIMAIRE (Cr. 1740-NIR)**

5. Le **Projet de Développement de l'Enseignement Primaire (PRODEP)** sera clôturé le 31 décembre 1995. La mission a pu noter avec beaucoup de satisfaction les progrès importants réalisés dans l'exécution du programme d'activités soutenant la deuxième prorogation de la date de clôture du crédit. Les objectifs principaux du projet sont atteints. Des progrès notables ont été réalisés dans la distribution des manuels scolaires. La visite de terrain a permis de constater qu'un nombre grandissant d'élèves disposent de manuels et de fournitures scolaires. Ce qui constitue une amélioration notable par rapport à l'observation de la mission de 1994. La mission a noté avec beaucoup de satisfaction les progrès notables accomplis en matière de carte scolaire et les perspectives de réorganisation de la Direction des Etudes et de la Programmation du MEN. La coordination des composantes s'est beaucoup renforcée. Ces efforts de planification et de concertation doivent être poursuivis en particulier dans le domaine de l'informatisation des ministères d'éducation et de la construction de la dernière tranche de classes. L'exécution du programme d'informatisation des ministères chargés de l'éducation n'a pas encore donné les résultats escomptés et risque de constituer un échec si les directives données par les deux ministères ne sont pas appliquées et terminées avant fin novembre. La mission ne voit pas la pertinence de mettre à la disposition des composantes de nouveaux outils informatiques dans le cadre du PROSEF si aucun progrès significatif n'est réalisé dans l'application du plan de rattrapage convenu lors de la dernière mission IDA. **Des mesures hardies doivent être prises pour que les opérateurs puissent terminer les travaux de saisie avant fin novembre 1995 (au besoin remplacer ceux qui manifestent de la mauvaise volonté y compris les encadreurs qui n'assument pas leurs tâches convenablement). Les travaux de constructions de classes doivent démarrer au plus tard le 15 novembre 1995 si non il sera impossible de terminer ces classes et de les réceptionner avant le 31 décembre 1995.**

6. Les taux de décaissement des divers financements liés au projet à la date du 30 septembre 1995 se présentent comme suit : (i) **Crédit IDA : 91.9 %** sur un montant total de 15.300.000 DTS ; (ii) **Don Norvégien : 99.9 %** sur 35.000.000 NOK ; (iii) **Don**

KfW 100% sur 3.500.000 DM ; et (iv) Don Néerlandais un pour-cent (1%) sur 2.145.000 NLG.

**6.1 Sur la contre partie de l'Etat nigérien, il reste à régler la somme de 15.000.000 FCFA. Cette situation menace l'exécution des activités de la fin du projet et peut avoir des conséquences négatives sur le rythme de décaissement du Crédit IDA. Il est donc urgent que le Gouvernement prenne les dispositions pour la régularisation de cette situation avant fin novembre 1995.**

**6.2. Sur le Crédit IDA, il y'a des risques qu'au moins cinq pour-cent du montant total du crédit soit annulé si le processus d'acquisition des biens et services n'est pas accéléré au courant du mois de novembre. En outre le dernier programme de cent cinquante classes doit être terminé au plus tard le 31 décembre 1995, date de clôture du crédit. Toutes les dispositions nécessaires doivent être prises à cet effet. La mission a rappelé à la Direction des Projets Education que selon la pratique de l'IDA, les dépenses encourues (travaux terminés et réceptionnés, biens délivrés, services rendus) au plus tard le 31 décembre 1995 sont éligibles pour financement sous réserve que les demandes de retraits de fonds parviennent au siège de la Banque Mondiale à Washington au plus tard le 30 avril 1996.**

**6.3 Sur le Don néerlandais, le rythme de décaissement est très faible. La DPE et les composantes doivent accélérer la préparation des dossiers techniques et les soumettre à l'IDA avant fin novembre 1995.**

**7. La mission a discuté et arrêté avec les responsables des différentes composantes et la DPE des dispositions à prendre pour les dernières activités du projet y compris les aspects relatifs aux engagements et aux décaissements. La DPE prendra toutes les dispositions nécessaires pour terminer l'inventaire physique des biens acquis sur le PRODEP. La mission et le gouvernement se sont mis d'accord sur les modalités de préparation et le format du rapport d'achèvement du projet. Le gouvernement fera parvenir à l'IDA son rapport d'achèvement accompagné d'une synthèse de six pages maximum au plus tard le 30 janvier 1996. L'IDA transmettra au gouvernement pour commentaires un projet d'évaluation finale avant fin février 1996.**

## **PARTIE B.**

### **PROJET SECTORIEL ENSEIGNEMENT FONDAMENTAL (Cr. 2618-NIR)**

**8. Le séminaire de lancement du PROSEF a atteint ses objectifs de vulgarisation de l'information et de clarification du projet. Le programme d'actions actualisé y compris le budget de la première année du projet sera transmis à l'IDA au plus tard fin novembre 1995.**

9. La première tranche du volet décaissements rapides d'un montant de 10.000.000 \$EU a été entièrement déboursée. **La DPE fera parvenir à l'IDA avant fin décembre 1995 un dossier complet et détaillé sur l'état d'avancement des mesures de réformes pour la rentrée 1995/96.** Elle devra accélérer aussi le décaissement sur la partie investissement du projet.

10. La mission a eu à préciser que les éléments du projet relatifs à la cellule d'évaluation et à l'équipe nationale pédagogique mobile sont sous la responsabilité de l'ENS qui travaillera en étroite collaboration avec les structures concernées. Les requêtes de mise à disposition des ressources du projet destinées à la sous-composant formation continue des maîtres seront cosignées par la DEPD et l'ENS. La composition de ces équipes ainsi que celle de la cellule pour la scolarisation des filles sera transmise à l'IDA pour avis avant toute décision finale.

11. Le volet manuels scolaires devra s'exécuter conformément à la description du projet et tenir compte de l'intervention des autres partenaires pour éviter des duplications. Dans ce contexte l'INDRAP devra développer ses capacités en matière d'évaluation et de contrôle de qualité des manuscrits. Il va sans dire que dans cette perspective aucun agent de l'INDRAP ne pourra soumissionner aux appels d'offres qui seraient préparés par l'INDRAP. **La mission a insisté sur l'urgence à démarrer l'audit technique et organisationnel de l'INDRAP. Le dossier y afférent sera envoyé à l'IDA pour avis avant le 15 décembre 1995.**

12. La mission estime que compte tenu du volume de travail important en matière de construction de classes, le BIES qui est rattaché à la DPE doit bénéficier d'une marge de manoeuvre suffisante pour prendre les initiatives nécessaires et disposer des moyens adéquats permettant une mobilité et des prises de décisions rapides.

13. Il est important de développer une stratégie pour le choix d'un coordinateur qui sera sélectionné sur une base consensuelle par un comité de sélection pour conduire les travaux relatifs à la définition d'une stratégie de développement de l'enseignement supérieur.

### **PARTIE C.**

#### **ENSEIGNEMENT TECHNIQUE ET FORMATION PROFESSIONNELLE**

14. Les premières discussions sur l'Enseignement Technique et la Formation Professionnelle (ETFP) font apparaître : (i) une absence de cadre cohérent en matière de politique ETFP ; (ii) une dispersion des centres de décisions et d'appui ; (iii) une duplication des formations ; (iv) une faible efficacité externe ; (v) une inefficacité dans l'allocation interne des ressources ; (vi) une faible incitation au développement du secteur privé ; (vii) une prise en compte insuffisante du secteur informel ; et (viii) une rigidité institutionnelle.

15. La mission recommande de mettre en place un groupe de travail inter-ministériel auquel seront associés : le secteur privé formel et informel, et les partenaires sociaux ; ce groupe de travail serait chargé d'élaborer une stratégie sectorielle de développement de l'Enseignement Technique et de la Formation Professionnelle. Une première esquisse de cette stratégie pourrait être disponible fin janvier 1996.

Fait à Niamey, le 31 octobre 1995

Pour la mission IDA



Makha Ndao



**APPENDIX B**

**SUMMARY OF BORROWER'S CONTRIBUTION TO THE ICR**

(Complete document is available from AFISC)





**SUMMARY OF ICR OF THE  
PRIMARY EDUCATION DEVELOPMENT PROJECT  
(EDUCATION II / CREDIT 1740-NIR)  
*January 1996***

The Primary Education Development Project (PRODEP) for US\$26.2 million was the first IDA project executed by the Ministry of National Education. Signed on December 15, 1986, and effective on May 11, 1987, the Education II Project should have closed on June 30, 1994; it was extended a first time to December 31, 1994 and then a second time to December 31, 1995 in order to achieve certain project activities and ensure a transition with the new Basic Education Sector Project.

The Project was designed to support the Government's strategy under the framework of its structural adjustment program. The implementation of this strategy would lead to an education system which was more equal, more effective, and better adapted to the needs; in which priority would be given to primary education and in which secondary and higher education would develop according to the available resources and market conditions.

The objective of limiting recruitment of *instituteurs* and favoring *instituteurs adjoints*, was not attained until the end of the project--school year 1994-1995. While double-shift teaching encountered difficulties in the beginning, by June 30, 1995 there were 454 double-shift classrooms with 43,994 students. While the project was able to furnish students with 1,031,339 textbooks and teachers guides, the diffusion problem of books produced by INDRAP was not solved. As of December 31, 1995, 982 classrooms had been constructed and 1,913 had been rehabilitated allowing for a 5.25 percent increase in the number of students enrolled.

With regard to strengthening the MEN, the central directorates were equipped with furniture, air conditioners, vehicles, and computer equipment; strengthening planning activities included construction of locations for the BCP and BIES which have become the Education Projects Directorate. Finally, the project financed the computerization of the MEN.

Two problems remain following the closure of the PRODEP: the Nigerian counterpart funds have not been paid to the Project since 1993; and the reimbursement of the advance given to GIE Albassa for cement for construction of 150 classrooms.

On the whole, the results obtained allow the project to be ranked a success. The few weaknesses encountered during project implementation have led to a knowledgeable and competent staff which will facilitate the implementation of the follow-up project.



**SYNTHESE DU RAPPORT D'ACHEVEMENT DU PROJET DE DEVELOPPEMENT  
DE L'ENSEIGNEMENT PRIMAIRE  
(PROJET EDUCATION II / CREDIT IDA 1740 NIR)  
*Janvier 1996***

## **Introduction**

D'un montant de 26,2 million de dollars, le Projet de Développement de l'Enseignement Primaire (PRODEP) ou Projet Education II est le premier projet IDA exécuté par le Ministère de l'Education Nationale. Signé le 15 décembre 1986 et mis en vigueur le 11 mai 1987 le Projet Education II devrait être initialement clos le 30 juin 1994; il a été prorogé une première fois au 31 décembre 1994, puis une seconde fois au 31 décembre 1995.

Le Projet a été conçu pour appuyer la stratégie formulée par le Gouvernement dans le cadre de son programme d'ajustement structurel. La mise en oeuvre de cette stratégie devrait déboucher sur un système éducatif plus équitable, plus efficace et mieux adapté aux besoins, où la priorité sera accordée à l'enseignement primaire et où l'enseignement secondaire et supérieur se développeront en fonction des ressources disponibles et des conditions de marché. A cette fin, le PRODEP prévoit:

- a) de réduire les coûts unitaires de fonctionnement et d'améliorer la qualité de l'enseignement;
- b) de réduire les coûts unitaires des constructions et d'élargir l'accès à l'enseignement primaire;
- c) d'encourager l'utilisation plus rationnelle des ressources pédagogiques.

Il faut noter que le PRODEP a été prorogé au 31 décembre 1995 aux fins d'achever convenablement certaines activités projet et d'assurer la jonction avec le nouveau projet qu'est le Projet Sectoriel de l'Enseignement Fondamental (PROSEF). Entre autres activités à achever, on peut mentionner:

- (i) l'informatisation du Ministère de l'Education Nationale, de l'Enseignement Supérieur et de la Recherche, aujourd'hui scindé en deux ministères;
- (ii) l'amélioration de l'accès à l'enseignement primaire en augmentant le nombre de classes à construire;
- (iii) le renforcement des inspections de l'enseignement du Premier Degré y compris les aspects de génie civil et de formation;
- (iv) la campagne d'information Education et Communication (IEC).

## **I) De la Réduction des coûts unitaires de Fonctionnement et de l'Amélioration de la qualité et de l'adaptation au milieu des programmes d'enseignement primaire**

### **1.1 Recrutement des enseignants et la formation continue**

L'objectif visé par le PRODEP qui consistait à limiter le recrutement des instituteurs tout en favorisant celui des instituteurs adjoints n'a pu être atteint que vers la fin du projet. En effet, c'est à partir de la rentrée scolaire 1994-1995 que le recrutement d'élèves-maîtres dans les Ecoles Normales, a pu s'effectuer par voie de concours sur la base de 15% d'instituteurs et 85% d'instituteurs adjoints.

Toutefois, la formation en cours d'emploi, organisée par le biais des stages de recyclages, ateliers et séminaires a touché plusieurs milliers d'enseignants et encadreurs des Ecoles Normales. C'est ainsi que l'amélioration de la qualification du personnel enseignant s'est traduite par le passage du pourcentage d'instituteurs et instituteurs adjoints de 84% du total des enseignants en 1984-1985 à 92% en 1991-1992.

### 1.2 L'Enseignement du double flux

L'enseignement du double flux qui a connu à ses débuts la réticence des partenaires de l'école est aujourd'hui accepté par ces derniers, ce qui a permis sa généralisation à partir de la rentrée scolaire 1994-1995. C'est ainsi qu'à la date du 30 juin 1995, le nombre de classes à double flux s'élevait à 454 et le nombre d'élèves fréquentant ces classes à 43.994. Au total 2.190 enseignants ont participé à 17 séminaires et ateliers sur le double flux.

Il faut souligner que le séminaire de lancement du Projet Sectoriel de l'Enseignement Fondamental tenu à Niamey du 26 au 28 octobre 1995, et qui a regroupé tous les représentants des partenaires de l'Ecole nigérienne, a recommandé la généralisation du double flux sur tout le cycle du premier degré, c'est à dire du CI au CM.

### 1.3 L'élaboration et l'adaptation des manuels scolaires et des livres du maître

Le projet a permis d'acquérir et de mettre à la disposition des élèves et enseignants 1.031.339 cahiers, manuels et guides, 28.000 tableaux de langage et 10.000 guides de prélecture. Hormis en mathématiques où le ratio livre-élève est supérieur à 1, toutes les autres disciplines enregistrent un ratio inférieur à 1 livre pour deux élèves. Il faut par ailleurs noter que le problème de la diffusion sur le marché des manuels produits par l'Institut National de Documentation et de Recherche et d'Animation Pédagogiques n'a toujours pas trouvé de solution. Cette situation est née du fait que le Ministère de l'Education nationale n'a pas la maîtrise de la politique des prix. Quant au problème relatif à la distribution et aux copyrights et films il a trouvé un début de solution.

## **II) De la Réduction des coûts unitaires de construction et de l'Elargissement de l'accès à l'Enseignement Primaire**

Initialement, il était prévu la construction de 750 salles de classe et la remise en état de 3.000 salles de classe existantes. A la date du 31 décembre 1995, date de clôture du projet, ce dernier a pu réaliser la construction de 982 classes et la réhabilitation de 1.913 classes existantes. Il a en outre doté chacune des nouvelles classes de 25 tables-bancs, 1 armoire, un bureau du maître, et deux chaises. Les classes rénovées ont également vu leur mobilier remplacé. Il faut souligner que ces réalisations ont permis, malgré un taux de scolarisation qui demeure faible, d'élargir l'accès à l'enseignement primaire. C'est ainsi que le nombre d'élèves du premier degré est passé de 293.511 élèves en 1986-87 à 377.502 élèves en 1991-92, soit une augmentation de 83.991 du nombre inscrit (5,16%). Pour l'année scolaire 1994-95 ces effectifs sont de 417.925 élèves, soit une augmentation de 124.414 du nombre d'inscrits (5,25%). Ce résultat est largement supérieur à l'objectif initial du projet qui est du reste d'augmenter le nombre d'élèves de 34.000. Il faut par ailleurs noter que les 150 classes construites en novembre-décembre 1995 ont permis d'accueillir près de 7.500 élèves à la rentrée 1995-1996.

Les succès enregistrés par le Projet dans le domaine des constructions de classes n'ont toutefois pas permis de réduire les disparités d'accès à l'enseignement primaire (disparités entre zones rurales/zones urbaines d'une part et garçons/filles d'autre part).

Par rapport au coût unitaire de construction, le Projet a réussi à le réduire de moitié, le coût de construction d'une classe étant passé de 4.370.000 F CFA en 1984 à 2.178.000 F CFA en 1994. Ce coût est remonté à environ 3.000.000 F CFA après la dévaluation du franc CFA.

Enfin, il faut relever que le Projet n'a pas pu mettre en place un système communautaire d'entretien des classes, de même qu'il n'a pas pu mettre en place un système permettant un inventaire aisé de ses classes et de leur mobilier.

### **III) De la Promotion de l'utilisation rationnelle des ressources affectées au Secteur éducatif**

#### **3.1 Renforcement des Moyens du MEN**

Dans le cadre du renforcement des ressources du MEN, les directions centrales ont été dotées de mobilier, de matériel de reprographie, de climatiseurs, de véhicules et de matériel informatique. Le personnel a également bénéficié de diverses formations dont entre autres, le Management des ressources humaines, la Passation des marchés, la Carte scolaire, la Planification de l'Education, la Gestion des Projets, la Production du matériel didactique, l'Edition, l'Utilisation efficiente de l'outil informatique, etc...

#### **3.2 Renforcement des capacités de planification et de contrôle**

Par rapport au renforcement de la planification, des locaux ont été construits pour abriter le BCP et le BIES devenus aujourd'hui la Direction des Projets Education. Le personnel de ces deux structures de même que celui de la DEP ont bénéficié de voyages d'étude et de formation dans les domaines de la Planification de l'Education, des constructions et de la Gestion des Projets. Enfin, le Projet a financé le recrutement de consultants aux fins d'appuyer le Ministère dans le domaine de la planification de la carte scolaire et des constructions scolaires. Quant au renforcement des inspections, onze (11) inspections et 5 ateliers ont été construits. Sur les 11 inspections, sept (7) ont été équipées. Les inspections ont été dotées de 24 véhicules tout terrain, de 8 Peugeot 504 bâchées, d'une pirogue à moteur et de 34 machines à écrire.

Il faut par ailleurs noter que le Bureau de Coordination du Projet a bénéficié de l'assistance d'un administrateur gestionnaire pendant 7 ans, de 5 véhicules dont 3 tout terrain. Vers la fin du Projet, du matériel informatique et audiovisuel ainsi que trois véhicules supplémentaires dont deux tout terrain affectés au BIES ont été acquis pour renforcer les moyens d'action de la Direction des Projets Education.

Enfin le Projet a financé l'informatisation du Ministère de l'Education, de l'Enseignement Supérieur et de la Recherche qui constituent aujourd'hui deux Ministères distincts. Ce financement a permis de doter les deux Ministères et les Directions Régionales de l'Education de 23 micro-ordinateurs, 23 imprimantes et accessoires, de mobilier pour la salle informatique, de splits et de climatiseurs. La formation de 34 opérateurs des deux Ministères et des 8 départements du pays a été également prise en charge par le Projet.

Le Service informatique du MEN/ESR avait pour tâche de saisir toutes les données statistiques afférentes (i) au personnel du Ministère, (ii) aux effectifs des étudiants et aux bourses et (iii) au patrimoine du Ministère. A la date du 25 décembre 1995 le Service informatique a codifié et saisi toutes les fiches du Personnel que la Direction des Affaires Administratives et du Personnel (DAAP) lui a transmises soit 9.933 fiches. Il reste encore au niveau de la DAAP environ 9.000 fiches.

La Direction des Projets Education se propose de remettre à chaque Direction la part de micro qui lui revient aux fins d'impliquer pleinement les différents responsables. En effet, il faut le souligner, malgré les moyens importants déployés pour doter la Ministère d'un système informatique les résultats sont en déca des attentes.

#### **IV) De l'Exécution du projet par catégorie**

Le Crédit IDA 1740 NIR a été réalloué deux fois et le Don Norvégien une fois. Quant au Don Allemand de la KFW, il a été entièrement consommé. Il en est de même du Don Norvégien pour lequel le reliquat de l'avance au compte spécial est à justifier. Hormis les catégories 1A et 8 du Crédit IDA 1740, toutes les autres catégories ont été consommées à plus de 80%.

#### **V) Du Personnel du Projet**

Structure principale de coordination des activités des composantes, le BCP a connu un changement relatif au niveau du personnel. Suite au décès du Directeur, M. Saadou Galadima, un nouveau directeur a été nommé. Ce dernier sera remplacé par un Directeur des Projets Education. L'administrateur-Gestionnaire expatrié sera remplacé par le Comptable. Malheureusement, ce dernier pour des raisons de santé demandera à être déchargé de ses fonctions en novembre 1995. Son intérim sera assuré par le Responsable des passations de marché cumulativement avec ses fonctions.

Il faut également noter que sur les trois chauffeurs dont disposait le Projet Education II, un seul a été retenu pendant la deuxième prorogation du Projet. Trois agents du Ministère de l'Education Nationale détachés au Projet ont été remis à la disposition dudit ministère à la date du 29 décembre 1995.

#### **VI) Des Problèmes pendants du PRODEP**

Deux problèmes demeurent en suspend à la clôture du PRODEP. Il s'agit (i) de la cotrepartie nigérienne qui n'a pas été versée au Projet depuis 1993 et (ii) du remboursement de l'avance de démarrage (29.575.740 FCFA) consentie au GIE Albassa adjudicataire du marché relatif au ciment des 150 classes à construire.

Pour ce qui est du premier point le montant qui doit être versé au Projet s'élève à 15.000.000. Cette somme aurait permis au Projet de s'intéresser les fournisseurs auxquels il doit les 10% de la contrepartie. Malheureusement, toutes les démarches entreprises par le Projet sont demeurées vaines.

Quant au dernier point, il a été retenu que le Trésor National rembourse le Projet (CF Lettre No. 001767 du 23 novembre 1995 du Crédit du Niger au Trésorier Général), ce qui n'a toujours pas été effectif malgré les multiples interventions des autorités du MEN.

#### **Conclusion**

Au regard des objectifs assignés au Projet de Développement de l'Enseignement Primaire et des résultats obtenus, l'on peut affirmer que dans l'ensemble le Projet a été un succès. Les quelques d'faillances enregistrées lors de l'exécution de ce projet on permis de prendre les dispositions idoines qui à n'en point douter faciliteront le bon déroulement du Projet Sectoriel de l'Enseignement Fondamental (PROSEF).



IMAGING

Report No: 15748  
Type: ICR