



1. Project Data:		Date Posted : 08/17/2000	
PROJ ID: P003969		Appraisal	Actual
Project Name: Primary School Teachers Project	Project Costs (US\$M)	54.10	n/a
Country: Indonesia	Loan/Credit (US\$M)	36.6	30.08
Sector(s): Primary Education	Cofinancing (US\$M)		
L/C Number: L3496			
	Board Approval (FY)		92
Partners involved :	Closing Date	12/31/1997	06/30/1999
Prepared by :	Reviewed by :	Group Manager :	Group:

2. Project Objectives and Components

a. Objectives

Overall objective (SAR) were to produce well-trained primary school teachers, through a new tertiary level teacher diploma course, in numbers appropriate to estimated needs and in appropriate locations .

Specific objectives (SAR) were to:

1. strengthen the capacity of managers and lecturers (pre-service and in-service to provide quality primary teacher education and build domestic capacity to train primary teacher educators .
2. improve primary teacher education (in-service and pre-service) curricula, teaching and assessment methods, and curricular materials;
3. develop formulas and information systems to determine the number of primary school teachers needed and track changes in teacher distribution, and create an incentive system to attract teaching candidates to teacher shortage areas;
4. undertake policy studies in primary teacher education and enhance capacity to conduct action research in primary education; and
5. strengthen management of primary teacher education programs at the central and campus levels, concentrating both on organizational management and instructional management .

b. Components

1: Developing Primary Teacher Educators by: (a) implementing a staff development program for 730 teacher educators and librarians and 1,600 teacher supervisors through various short-term and long-term, international and local training programs, with a view to exposing them to innovations; (b) developing practical training and core subject teaching content and skills, and through their participation, providing a career pathway for outstanding primary school teachers; and (c) training the project implementation units (Primary Training Institutes) in management of primary teacher education .

2: Strengthening Primary Teacher Education (Diploma) Programs by: (a) improving curricula; (b) developing effective teaching and assessment strategies; and (c) providing appropriate field-tested materials. The thrust of these activities was to prepare teachers to implement active student learning strategies (CBSA) as under in the CBSA curriculum supported under the Bank-assisted Primary Education Improvement Project (PEQIP) (Loan 3448, FY91).

3. Establishing a coordinated teacher supply and distribution system including: (a) the formulas for determining the numbers of schools needed for schools of various sizes; (b) introduction of the information system to track changes in teacher distribution; (c) targeted recruitment of teachers from teacher shortage areas; (d) scholarships for needy candidates from target areas; and (e) cooperative efforts between the Directorate-General of Higher Education and related agencies to secure appropriate teaching jobs for primary teacher training program graduates .

After mid-term review, the recruitment scheme was revised to ensure that: entry to the diploma program was restricted to honorary teachers (working teachers trained in old-style primary teacher programs who had not been selected into the civil service and were not on payroll); recruitment was done by teams from teacher institutes and local governments; recruits were selected from areas with the most severe shortages; the number of recruits was severely restricted based on estimated civil service vacancies; all recruits received bursaries, instead of 20%; and

were to be receive civil service appointments at their previous schools .

c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates

This was a hybrid new-old style ICR. Only the costs financed by the Bank were included in the ICR because the Government had not compiled project costs by component, procurement or category and counterpart fund contributions were not made available to the Bank . A balance of \$390.064 in the special account was still to be recovered when the ICR was sent to OED . The Region has since contacted the Borrower about these issues .

3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives:

1. The project's major success was in upgrading teacher education requirements from secondary to tertiary level (D2). The diploma curriculum was developed and officially released in 1995. The project provided better educated, trained and qualified teachers. It met planned training targets in quantitative terms, with all primary teacher institutes adopting the new programs.
2. The project also developed a masters-level curriculum for primary teacher educators and managers, thus providing more relevant training for primary teacher educators, most of whom had previously had secondary level experience only.
3. The teacher supply and distribution system was launched . After a 1996 revision designed to target recruitment into teacher training to underqualified, volunteer teachers (previously trained at secondary level), the project helped improve employment prospects of successful diploma graduates who were placed in their local area schools . The ICR states that this guaranteed that the teachers would be placed in areas where they were most needed . Of the first cohort, 80% were appointed with civil service status in the same year . Recruitment was carried out collaboratively by the teams; a central steering committee was appointed to coordinate management of teacher supply; the local government and teacher training; the Joint Secretariat raised issues of concern and facilitates decision -making.
4. Seven large research studies on key issues were managed by a lead teacher training college and contracted to others. Some were published in the Primary Education Research Journal produced by the same lead college . It also established a research quality control unit . However, quality achieved was variable, dissemination impact outside academia and policy impact was very limited .
In addition, 20 smaller policy studies and 178 action research studies by individuals and groups of staff were completed. The action research studies had positive impact on the staff who used them in their practice teaching though the impact was more apparent in teacher education institutions than in schools .
5. Allocation of budgets by colleges for the primary programs was delayed though all included the programs in their planning. After an official directive, five allocated budgets and four had managers appointed by project completion .

4. Significant Outcomes/Impacts:

- The project has significantly improved the capacity of pre -service primary teacher education institutions to conduct training at tertiary level---the norm for middle-income countries in the 21st. century. The project began the process of upgrading the professional status of primary teacher training ---a breakthrough for a professional field that has traditionally suffered from low status and resources in Indonesia .
- The ICR argues that the volunteer teachers are far more effective as recruits than centrally provided teachers because of their commitment, their training and their local roots .

5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):

- The completion mission noted that teacher educators rarely practiced their knowledge and skills in schools . The action research component, however, has gradually gained acceptance as a means of engaging them in translating theory into practical application for training purposes, and 178 were completed.
- The diploma trainee teachers had the benefit of only one supervised practice teaching in a real classroom during the final semester. The ICR comments that this defect should have been addressed earlier during supervision. Core subject teaching for underqualified teachers also needs to be expanded because of a shortfall in the training provided in these areas .
- The new recruitment scheme suffered from a late start, according to the borrower . The project design ignored the fact that there was an oversupply of 250,000 underqualified, volunteer teachers not accepted into regular civil service positions---though poor distribution mechanisms had led to severe local shortages . The revised component targeted these volunteer teachers, instead of trying to recruit additional teachers, and most volunteers who graduated were given civil service status . However, the current distribution of teachers and the impact of the targeting methods require review . The class-based teacher supply formula has not been revamped. This tends to over-estimate the need for new teachers and leads to inefficient teacher distribution . After the scholarships for volunteer teachers in D2 training dried up at project completion, the six provinces' responses" varied sharply." The ICR recommends a collaborative review of the scheme . Overall, the teacher management system still suffers from lack of cooperation from key Ministry of Education units and other agencies at central level . Cooperation with the PEQIP project was not achieved .

6. Ratings:	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
Outcome:	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Highly relevant to the sector strategy of

			improving teacher quality in primary education. Original teacher supply and distribution scheme irrelevant to cost and efficiency issues, though the revamped component improves the relevance rating and was effective in achieving development outcome. Effective in upgrading teacher training programs and developing staff and managers in teacher training colleges. Cooperative effort on operational plan is still needed to develop teacher distribution scheme and ensure cost-efficiency.
Institutional Dev .:	Modest	Modest	Substantial for the staff development and teacher education curriculum. Modest for practical application of training and for the teacher recruitment scheme, though with substantial success in some provinces.
Sustainability :	Likely	Unlikely	Technical sustainability and commitment are not at risk in tertiary education but risks that institutional ownership and domestic funds will not be adequate are high.
Bank Performance :	Satisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Bank merits a marginally unsatisfactory overall. Quality at entry rated unsatisfactory because of the failure to address well-known issues of teacher over-supply and lack of cooperation between key agencies (development outcomes rated satisfactory throughout). Supervision rated satisfactory on education aspects and revamping of defective component, but unsatisfactory on fiduciary responsibility and financial sustainability. The borrower notes weak support on project implementation matters by the country office.
Borrower Perf .:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Borrower merits marginally satisfactory rating overall. Performance rated fully satisfactory for teacher training performance and management of training institutions; satisfactory for the recruitment scheme from 1996; marginally unsatisfactory rating for uneven support from relevant government agencies on teacher distribution scheme; and unsatisfactory for not completing project accounts.
Quality of ICR :		Satisfactory	

NOTE: ICR rating values flagged with '*' don't comply with OP/BP 13.55, but are listed for completeness.

7. Lessons of Broad Applicability:

The ICR and Borrower's report include many detailed insights for continued development of the project. Of broad interest are the following:

- **ICR:** The volunteer teacher scheme taught that the period of voluntary teaching acts as a filtering mechanism and targets recruits to the training program who enter with commitment to teaching than previous candidates; the incentive (preferential recruitment to civil service status) was highly important in this case. The targeting mechanism also reportedly addressed equity issues by encouraging teachers from remote and deprived areas to enter the program and, most importantly, to go back to the areas where they were most needed and where they belonged and spoke the language and so were accepted by the community.
- In planning future action research projects, bottom-up participatory approaches should be adopted, so that classroom teachers and school principals are as fully involved in research design as the teacher educators. In

judging success, attention should be paid to the impact on practice within participating schools, as well as the quality of the written report. A forthcoming OED process review on the Bank's experience on participation supports the importance of these processes in improving the quality of Bank projects .

- **Borrower:** In a project aimed at building a critical mass of institutional resources to sustain primary teacher education and the continuous professional development of teachers , care is needed to ensure that: (a) inputs are viewed, planned and implemented in a coherent and systematic, and not a fragmented, manner; and (b) ownership, not merely acceptance, of the novel initiatives by project beneficiaries, is guaranteed at the outset . The Borrower comments that this is possibly the most difficult aspect to work on . This echoes the findings of the OED participation review that, among the biggest constraints are lack of institutional capacity by governments and stakeholders to develop ownership through participation .

8. Assessment Recommended? Yes No

Why? As a cluster with several other basic education and /or teacher education projects .

9. Comments on Quality of ICR:

Interview with the task manager indicates that the ICR is highly satisfactory in its technical data and analysis, including a special annex, but that it could have been improved by an analysis of the contextual factors that pertain to relevance and institutional cooperation . The TM agreed with the factors that influenced OED's ratings . The Borrower's report is exemplary in the richness of its comments, though it takes a less optimistic view of outcomes than the Bank's report.