Implementation Status & Results
West Bank and Gaza
Municipal Development Program (P111741)

Operation Name: Municipal Development Program (P111741)  Project Stage: Implementation  Seq.No: 7  Status: ARCHIVED  Archive Date: 09-Jan-2014

Country: West Bank and Gaza  Approval FY: 2010
Product Line: Special Financing  Region: MIDDLE EAST AND NORTH AFRICA  Lending Instrument: Specific Investment Loan
Implementing Agency(ies):

Key Dates
Board Approval Date  17-Sep-2009  Original Closing Date  30-Apr-2013  Planned Mid Term Review Date  16-May-2011  Last Archived ISR Date  26-Dec-2012
Effectiveness Date  26-Jan-2010  Revised Closing Date  31-Aug-2013  Actual Mid Term Review Date  16-May-2011

Project Development Objectives
Project Development Objective (from Project Appraisal Document)
The objective of Phase I of the MDP is to improve municipal management practices for better transparency.

Has the Project Development Objective been changed since Board Approval of the Project?
☐ Yes  ☐ No

Component(s)
Component Name  Component Cost
Municipal Grants  7.60
Municipal Innovations  0.70
Capacity Building  0.60
MDP Management  1.10

Overall Ratings
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rating Area</th>
<th>Previous Rating</th>
<th>Current Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Progress towards achievement of PDO</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Implementation Progress (IP)</td>
<td>Moderately Satisfactory</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Implementation Status Overview
The project closing date was extended from April 2013 to August 2013 as per the request of the Palestinian Authority in order to accommodate a delayed start to several capacity building packages, and some anticipated delays in a few civil works packages. The project officially closed on August 31, 2013.
Project disbursements from the World Bank fund and MDTF totaled US$ 34.35 million, representing 91% of the total US$ 37.74 million. Disbursement is expected to reach 100% by
the end of the grace period on December 31, 2013. The project exceeded the targets for its two key performance indicators (KPIs) and has met its project development objective to improve municipal management practices for better transparency.

### Locations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>First Administrative Division</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Planned</th>
<th>Actual</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>WEST BANK &amp; GAZA</td>
<td>Gaza Strip</td>
<td>Gaza Strip</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WEST BANK &amp; GAZA</td>
<td>West Bank</td>
<td>West Bank</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Results

#### Project Development Objective Indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator Name</th>
<th>Core</th>
<th>Unit of Measure</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Current</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Municipalities that graduate up the performance category in which they are currently classified</td>
<td></td>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>96.00</td>
<td>30.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>01-Sep-2009</td>
<td>27-Sep-2013</td>
<td>31-Aug-2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Municipalities that apply at least two public disclosure methods (publicly available SDIPs, annual external audits, project related data, municipal budgets and performance rankings)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>68.00</td>
<td>60.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>01-Sep-2009</td>
<td>16-May-2013</td>
<td>31-Aug-2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

68% of municipalities disclosed information in at least two of three areas (a) financial data and municipal budgets, (b) municipal ranking, (c) projects and achievements

#### Intermediate Results Indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator Name</th>
<th>Core</th>
<th>Unit of Measure</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Current</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Investments financed that were identified in the municipal Strategic Development Plans</td>
<td></td>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>01-Sep-2009</td>
<td>16-May-2013</td>
<td>31-Aug-2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Il the municipalities that have SDIPs submitted sub-projects that are already identified in their SDIPs. (37 sub-projects) in the 1st cycle and (198) in the 2nd cycle.

| Investments financed that are operational |      | Percentage      | 0.00     | 97.00     | 80.00     |
| Date                                                                          |      |                 | 01-Sep-2009 | 16-May-2013 | 31-Aug-2013 |
| Comments                                                                      |      |                 |          |            |            |
Based on the technical audit & usability assessment which was conducted by individual consultants in West Bank and Gaza, the audit reports indicated that the functionality, usability, and sustainability of the selected sample of sub-projects (30) are acceptable and satisfactory.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Amalgamation Initiatives</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>01-Sep-2010</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>8.00</td>
<td>16-May-2013</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>6.00</td>
<td>31-Aug-2013</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(The World Bank is not financing this activity)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4 new municipalities have emerged from the Ministry of Local Government's amalgamation process</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Energy Efficiency</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>01-Sep-2009</td>
<td>One year after the installation of energy saving equipment's, a post process evaluation was conducted.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>16-May-2013</td>
<td>- The results for the measurement and verification in 2012 indicated a noticeable achievements regarding the energy savings in the 4 piloted municipalities inthe amount reached 1,523,235 KWH (165,479 Euro)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td>31-Aug-2013</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>One Stop Shops</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>01-Sep-2009</td>
<td>Work is underway in all 3 targeted municipalities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td>16-May-2013</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td>31-Aug-2013</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Municipal Performance Improvements</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5.00</td>
<td>01-Sep-2009</td>
<td>The municipal graduation by end of MDPI is described as follows:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>95.50</td>
<td>16-May-2013</td>
<td>Graduated E-C: 17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>25.00</td>
<td>31-Aug-2013</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Graduated E-B: 6  
Graduated D-C: 61  
Graduated D-B: 29  
Graduated C-B: 13  
No change 5: (3 in C, 2 in E)  
Two newly amalgamated – B  
Backward (E-F): 1(AI Oja)

### MDLF Satisfactory Performance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>01-Sep-2009</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16-May-2013</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-Aug-2013</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Operations and Maintenance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>01-Sep-2009</td>
<td>O &amp; M Planning is ad-hoc and not linked to budget</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16-May-2013</td>
<td>O &amp; M procedures are piloted in at least 5 Municipalities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-Aug-2013</td>
<td>The manual has been developed and is currently under Roll Out to 10 municipalities.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Direct project beneficiaries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>01-Sep-2009</td>
<td>2117160.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01-Dec-2012</td>
<td>4800000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-Aug-2013</td>
<td>This represents the estimated number of direct beneficiaries by the end of Cycle 1 implementation.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Female beneficiaries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>01-Sep-2009</td>
<td>49.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-Aug-2013</td>
<td>49.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Roads rehabilitated, Non-rural

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>01-Sep-2009</td>
<td>162.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16-May-2013</td>
<td>300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-Aug-2013</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Data on Financial Performance (as of 27-Nov-2013)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Financial Agreement(s) Key Dates</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P111741</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Disbursements (in Millions)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project</th>
<th>Ln/Cr/Tf</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Currency</th>
<th>Original</th>
<th>Revised</th>
<th>Cancelled</th>
<th>Disbursed</th>
<th>Undisbursed</th>
<th>% Disbursed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P127162</td>
<td>TF-11407</td>
<td>Closed</td>
<td>USD</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P111741</td>
<td>TF-12410</td>
<td>Closed</td>
<td>USD</td>
<td>12.21</td>
<td>12.21</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>12.21</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P111741</td>
<td>TF-95351</td>
<td>Closed</td>
<td>USD</td>
<td>10.00</td>
<td>10.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>10.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P111741</td>
<td>TF-96770</td>
<td>Closed</td>
<td>USD</td>
<td>13.48</td>
<td>13.48</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>13.48</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Disbursement Graph

![Disbursement Graph](image)

### Key Decisions Regarding Implementation

There are no key decisions for disclosure at this stage.

### Restructuring History

Level 2 CD Decision on 26-Apr-2013

### Related Projects

P127162-GZ-Municipal Development Program AF