West Bank and Gaza: Education-to-Work Transition (P129861)

Implementing Agencies:

Key Dates

**Key Project Dates**
- Bank Approval Date: 15-May-2012
- Effectiveness Date: 31-Jul-2012
- Planned Mid Term Review Date: 01-Jun-2015
- Actual Mid-Term Review Date: 17-Dec-2015
- Original Closing Date: 31-Jan-2018
- Revised Closing Date: 31-Jan-2018

Project Development Objectives

Project Development Objective (from Project Appraisal Document)

The Education to Work Transition Project seeks to improve education to work transition of young Palestinians attending participating tertiary education institutions (TEIs) by: (i) fostering partnerships between TEIs and employers in order to make TEIs’ study programs more relevant to the needs of the labor market; and (ii) enhancing the capacity of the MOEHE and TEIs to collect, analyze and disseminate data collected through the TEIs’ graduate tracking system to monitor the outcomes of TEIs’ study programs, and to inform education policy formulation and implementation.

Has the Project Development Objective been changed since Board Approval of the Project Objective?

No

Components

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Education to Work Transition Innovation Grant Facility</td>
<td>(Cost $5.00 M)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Higher Education Graduate Tracking System</td>
<td>(Cost $0.60 M)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project Management and Coordination</td>
<td>(Cost $0.90 M)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall Ratings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Previous Rating</th>
<th>Current Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Progress towards achievement of PDO</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Implementation Progress (IP)</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Risk Rating</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Implementation Status and Key Decisions

At Mid-Term Review stage, the Project has achieved considerable implementation progress, showing an overall commitment by the end of December 2015 of 93 percent of the grant value and 59 percent of already spent funds. More importantly, E2WTP is succeeding in facilitating the reform of many higher education programs, both in universities and colleges, and in Gaza and the West Bank. Feedback from employers, academics and students themselves is consistently positive and, overall, the impact of this project on the efficiency of the transition from education to work in Palestine appears to be strong. The key to this success clearly lies in taking full advantage of the potential of partnerships between universities and colleges with private sector companies, and the role the latter are playing in curriculum reform and in providing practical training and internship opportunities to students. 

In view of this progress, consistently rated as Satisfactory since the beginning of project implementation, it was therefore agreed with MoEHE to proceed with the request and then the preparation of Additional Financing to sustain project achievements and bring some of the successful efforts to an even wider national scale.
Risks

Systematic Operations Risk-rating Tool

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Risk Category</th>
<th>Rating at Approval</th>
<th>Previous Rating</th>
<th>Current Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Political and Governance</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>● High</td>
<td>● High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macroeconomic</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>● Moderate</td>
<td>● Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sector Strategies and Policies</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>● Moderate</td>
<td>● Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Design of Project or Program</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>● Moderate</td>
<td>● Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>● Moderate</td>
<td>● Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fiduciary</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>● Moderate</td>
<td>● Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment and Social</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>● Low</td>
<td>● Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stakeholders</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>● Moderate</td>
<td>● Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>● Moderate</td>
<td>● Moderate</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results

Project Development Objective Indicators

- Participating TEIs Graduate Unemployment Rate (Percentage, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>62.00</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>-10.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>30-Aug-2013</td>
<td>02-Apr-2015</td>
<td>17-Dec-2015</td>
<td>31-Aug-2017</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comments

Baselines have been established for both Cycle 1 and Cycle 2 TEIs. These are, respectively, 62 and 67 percent. Since the GTS is not still operational, the team cannot report on how this indicator has evolved. Yet, all TEIs in Cycle 1 were asked to follow up on their 2014 graduates' labor insertion rates, as one of the KPIs agreed upon for their projects, and the results presented heretofore are certainly very promising. That said, the way that data has been collected, plus the fact that this early batch of graduates has only been partially exposed to the project intervention, do not allow any claim with regard to progress on this indicator. Moreover, this MTR has concluded that, while there is increasing evidence on the direct impact of the project on graduate employment, the specific goal of reducing graduate unemployment in the West Bank and particularly in Gaza could be unrealistic under current circumstances. To be sure, for QIF Cycle 1 TEIs, 51 college graduates (of a total of 92) and 88 university graduates (of a total of 437) were already employed six months after graduation. These figures show an impressive improvement in terms of education to work transition in the country. However, considering the relentless increase of tertiary education students and, more importantly, the mounting constraints faced by private sector companies in both Gaza and the West Bank, it is simply not realistic to expect net reductions in the graduate unemployment rates. Thus, the MTR has agreed to proceed with a Level 2 restructuring of the project which will involve upgrading two of the intermediate indicators from Component 1 and 2 to PDO level; the description of these two intermediate indicators is fully aligned with the PDO description thus, the PDO would not
be affected by the proposed change. As for the current PDO indicator, the mission considers that it is important to keep track of the graduate unemployment reduction, so it is proposed to keep that indicator in the results framework, but as an intermediate one for Component 1.

### Overall Comments

**Intermediate Results Indicators**

#### Use of Graduate Tracking System Information (Number, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Value</strong></td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>2.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Date</strong></td>
<td>19-Apr-2012</td>
<td>02-Apr-2015</td>
<td>17-Dec-2015</td>
<td>31-Aug-2017</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comments**
NewSoft-NS has already completed the design phase of the GTS. A workshop took place on October 29 to introduce the system to all TEIs and to announce the commencement of the implementation phase. The GTS will certainly be operational before the closing date of the Project.

#### Use of Graduate Tracking Portal (Number, Custom Supplement)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Value</strong></td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>1000.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Work practice becomes available in participating TEIs (Number, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Value</strong></td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>5.00</td>
<td>5.00</td>
<td>3.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Date</strong></td>
<td>23-Feb-2012</td>
<td>02-Apr-2015</td>
<td>17-Dec-2015</td>
<td>31-Aug-2017</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comments**
8 projects under cycle 1 namely NNU-Food, ISC, IUG, PTCD, WUC, UCAS, PTUK and NNU-IT conducted the practical training. As for
Cycle 2, it is still in the early stages, but all 9 TEIs are planning to conduct practical trainings.

Joint Design of Study Programs between Participating TEIs and employers (Number, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>10.00</td>
<td>10.00</td>
<td>5.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>23-Feb-2012</td>
<td>02-Apr-2015</td>
<td>02-Apr-2015</td>
<td>31-Aug-2017</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comments
10 projects under cycle 1 and one project under cycle 2 already completed the development process, while 7 projects from Cycle 2 are in the process of developing their curriculum.

Overall Comments

Data on Financial Performance

Disbursements (by loan)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project</th>
<th>Loan/Credit/TF</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Currency</th>
<th>Original</th>
<th>Revised</th>
<th>Cancelled</th>
<th>Disbursed</th>
<th>Undisbursed</th>
<th>Disbursed</th>
<th>Disbursed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P129861</td>
<td>TF-12221</td>
<td>Effective</td>
<td>USD</td>
<td>6.50</td>
<td>6.50</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>3.87</td>
<td>2.63</td>
<td></td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Key Dates (by loan)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project</th>
<th>Loan/Credit/TF</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Approval Date</th>
<th>Signing Date</th>
<th>Effectiveness Date</th>
<th>Orig. Closing Date</th>
<th>Rev. Closing Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P129861</td>
<td>TF-12221</td>
<td>Effective</td>
<td>02-Jul-2012</td>
<td>02-Jul-2012</td>
<td>31-Jul-2012</td>
<td>31-Jan-2018</td>
<td>31-Jan-2018</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Cumulative Disbursements
Restructuring History

There has been no restructuring to date.

Related Project(s)

There are no related projects.