

Document of
The World Bank
FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Report No:

IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION AND RESULTS REPORT

TF 016781

ON A

SMALL GRANT

IN THE AMOUNT OF USD0.56 MILLION

TO THE

Interstate Statistical Committee of the Commonwealth of Independent States
(CISSTAT Committee)

FOR

Development of Labor Statistics in the CIS Region Project (P150038)

Aug 15, 2019

Development Economics, Data Group
Europe And Central Asia Region

Regional Vice President: **Pinelopi Koujianou Goldberg**

Country Director: **Simeon Djankov**

Senior Global Practice Director: **Haishan Fu**

Practice Manager: **Nada Hamadeh**

Task Team Leader(s): **Olga Vadimovna Shabalina**

ICR Main Contributor: **Olga Vadimovna Shabalina**

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

2008 SNA	System of National Accounts 2008
CIS	Commonwealth of Independent States
CIS NSOs	National Statistical Offices of the CIS Member States
CISSTAT	Interstate Statistical Committee of the Commonwealth of Independent States
ECASTAT TF	Multi-Donor Trust Fund to Support Statistical Capacity Building in Eastern Europe and CIS Countries
ICLS	International Conference of Labor Statisticians
ILO	International Labor Organization
ISR	Implementation and Status Report
LFS	Labor Force Survey
Project	Project "Development of Labor Statistics in the CIS Region"
SDG	Sustainable Development Goals

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DATA SHEET	ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.
I. PROJECT CONTEXT AND DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVES.....	4
II. OUTCOME	9
III. KEY FACTORS THAT AFFECTED IMPLEMENTATION AND OUTCOME.....	15
IV. BANK PERFORMANCE, COMPLIANCE ISSUES, AND RISK TO DEVELOPMENT OUTCOME ..	16
V. LESSONS LEARNED AND RECOMMENDATIONS	17
ANNEX 1. RESULTS FRAMEWORK AND KEY OUTPUTS.....	18
ANNEX 2. PROJECT COST BY COMPONENT	26
ANNEX 3. RECIPIENT, CO-FINANCIER AND OTHER PARTNER/STAKEHOLDER COMMENTS.....	27
ANNEX 4. SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS (IF ANY)	29



DATA SHEET

BASIC INFORMATION

Product Information

Project ID P150038	Project Name Development of Labor Statistics in the CIS region
Country Europe and Central Asia	Financing Instrument Investment Project Financing
Original EA Category Not Required (C)	Revised EA Category

Organizations

Borrower Interstate Statistical Committee of the Commonwealth of Independent States (CISSTAT Committee)	Implementing Agency Interstate Statistical Committee of the Commonwealth of Independent States (CISSTAT Committee)
--	---

Project Development Objective (PDO)

Original PDO

The overall Project goal is to provide support to the CIS national statistical offices to strengthen their capacity in collection of regular labor statistical data on the basis of uniformed methodology; to enhance knowledge exchange at national and international levels and to upgrade CIS and ILO statistical databases on labor. Specific Project's objectives are: " modernisation of current labor statistics systems in the CIS countries through enhancing capacity of their national statistical services and other agencies-producers of labor data by increasing the use of modern data collection tools, international methodology, definitions, standards and classifications; " upgrading of currently conducted surveys such as household-based labor force surveys and/or enterprise-based surveys, population census; " development of methodology for implementation of labor force surveys on a regular basis, including data collection on labor migration and employment in informal sector of economy.



FINANCING

	Original Amount (US\$)	Revised Amount (US\$)	Actual Disbursed (US\$)
Donor Financing			
TF-16781	560,000	560,000	557,623
Total	560,000	560,000	557,623
Total Project Cost	560,000	560,000	557,623

KEY DATES

Approval	Effectiveness	Original Closing	Actual Closing
26-Feb-2014	15-Apr-2014	31-Mar-2017	31-Dec-2018

RESTRUCTURING AND/OR ADDITIONAL FINANCING

Date(s)	Amount Disbursed (US\$M)	Key Revisions
28-Mar-2017	0.46	Additional Financing Change in Loan Closing Date(s) Reallocation between Disbursement Categories

KEY RATINGS

Outcome	Bank Performance	M&E Quality
Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Substantial

RATINGS OF PROJECT PERFORMANCE IN ISRs

No.	Date ISR Archived	DO Rating	IP Rating	Actual Disbursements (US\$M)
01	16-Jan-2019	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	0.56



ADM STAFF

Role	At Approval	At ICR
Regional Vice President:	Kaushik Basu	Pinelopi Koujianou Goldberg
Country Director:	Ana L. Revenga	Simeon Djankov
Director:	Haishan Fu	Haishan Fu
Practice Manager:	Grant James Cameron	Nada Hamadeh
Task Team Leader(s):	Olga Vadimovna Shabalina	Olga Vadimovna Shabalina
ICR Contributing Author:		Olga Vadimovna Shabalina



I. PROJECT CONTEXT AND DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVES

Context

Regional Context

1. The creation of the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS) in the early 90s of the twentieth century and the transition from a centrally planned economy to the formation of an economy built on market laws and principles made it necessary to radically revise approaches to the statistical measurement of the processes occurring in the countries in almost all socio-economic spheres. The labor market in the CIS countries was and still is an important market economy segment which is being formed under different economic and demographic conditions. In some CIS countries, for example, the population is rapidly ageing and, consequently, labor supply is reducing, while other countries have headily growing young population that puts a strain on labor market. In 2012 economically active population estimate for the CIS countries was 139.5 million people, or about half of the total CIS population. The number of unemployed in accordance with the International Labor Organization (ILO) criteria was 7.8 million people in late 2012. The unemployment rate was a little more than 5%, or nearly half less than in EU countries and a third less than in OECD.

2. Over the years of independence, the differences in economic growth rates and demographic trends have increased, which has affected the national labor market capacity and, consequently, high internal labor migration, low labor costs and the resulting decent work deficit. In labor-surplus countries the pressure on the labor market is regulated to a considerable extent by labor migration to states where working population is declining and there is demand for labor. External migratory flows are taking place mostly within the CIS region. They account for more than 80% of the migration turnover. In 2005-2011, the official numbers of labor migrants from the CIS countries in host CIS countries increased by 2.5 times. This migration activity is favored by common history, territorial proximity, visa free border crossing regime, the Russian language remained a means of communication, and rather similar vocational education systems, the factors of long-term nature. Thus, it was expected that the existing migration interaction model would highly probably remain in the mid-term run.

The Interstate Statistical Committee of the Commonwealth of Independent States (CISSTAT)

3. The CISSTAT participation in the Project is determined by its special role in improving the statistical service of the CIS countries. According to the Statute of CISSTAT its main objective is coordinating the activities of national statistical services, promoting the organization of information exchange, analysis of socio-economic development of the states and elaborating common recommendations in the field of statistics. The principal activities of the CISSTAT include (i) promotion of state statistics reforming in the CIS countries in accordance with the socio-economic transformations and international standards of accounting and statistics; (ii) coordination of statistical activities and development of recommendations on the common statistical methodology; and (iii) multilateral exchange of statistical information and development of common information and statistical space of CIS countries.



4. Since 1992 the CISSTAT takes a lead in developing of coordinated statistical methodology based on corresponding international rules and standards. It is responsible for interaction with CIS national statistical offices (NSOs) in organization of staff training, seminars and other activities related to reforming of state statistics and interstate exchange of statistical information and its publication; international statistical cooperation jointly with the CIS NSOs, including participation in the work of international statistical organizations and also representing them during the international events.

Rational for Bank Support

5. Rational behind the Banks involvement builds upon its global expertise on statistical capacity building and experience in implementing similar projects. In addition, the Multi-Donor Trust Fund to Support Statistical Capacity Building in Eastern Europe and CIS Countries (ECASTAT) was established in 2012 to support statistical capacity building, and to improve statistical capacity in areas relevant to a larger set of countries. Its overall objectives are to address the capacity and financial constraints of the statistical systems of countries in Eastern Europe and the CIS region, and, thereby support development outcomes by strengthening the production of reliable and relevant data on a timely basis for evidence-based decision making at all levels of their governments. ECASTAT is organized as a two-window programmatic Trust Fund, comprising of: (i) regional projects that focus on the development of methodologies, including in Russian, and on technical assistance and training in specific thematic areas; and (ii) country-specific projects that support the implementation plan of the National Strategies for Development of Statistics (NSDS). The ECASTAT regional approach provides an opportunity to overcome many barriers to investment related to scale, resources, and capacity constraints of smaller countries. Focusing on a regional grouping of countries facing a similar set of issues, regional programs aim at facilitating learning and replication of approaches to increase statistical capacity in the region. This Project was prepared and implemented as part of the ECASTAT regional program.

6. Although ECASTAT was established as a multi-donor trust fund, to date only the Russian Federation has pledged funding in an amount of USD 15 million. ECASTAT works closely with UNECE and the CIS Statistical Committee (CISSTAT) to ensure coordinated efforts to improve statistics in the region.

Sectoral (statistics) Context

7. The labor statistics data bases in the CIS countries had been formed by using various types of statistical observations such as (i) statistical reporting and surveys of legal entities conducted with different periodicity on census and sample basis; (ii) sample population surveys – labor force surveys (LFS); and (iii) population censuses. To some extent the CIS NSOs have been also using administrative data collected through other ministries and agencies.

8. The key source of labor statistics was and still is the LFS not conducted on a regular basis in all CIS countries: Azerbaijan (2003), Armenia (2001), Belarus Republic (2012), Kazakhstan (2001), Kyrgyzstan (2002), Moldova (1999), Russia (1992), Tajikistan (twice – in 2004 and 2009), Turkmenistan (2011), Uzbekistan (2007) and Ukraine (1995). In all the CIS countries except for Uzbekistan, the LFS is being prepared and conducted by NSOs, in Uzbekistan – by the Ministry of Labor and Social Protection of Population. In several CIS countries the LFS was a relatively new survey and still developing tool. It was not always regarded as the main source of data on labor market, though its



importance has been increasing with an experience gained. In some countries, financial constraints prevented from the periodicity and coverage needed for the LFS.

9. At the project preparation to collect, analyze and disseminate up-to-date information on the labor market dynamics and trends, the CIS countries needed to acquire a solid national level of labor statistics based on modern data collection techniques, international concepts, definitions and classifications.

Support of international development organizations.

10. The development of labor statistics to meet the market economy requirements was launched in the CIS countries in 1992. At that time, the ILO provided extensive support to the CIS countries to reform their national systems of labor statistics, on the basis of bilateral cooperation and small thematic projects. In 2012, the ILO Department of Statistics developed a draft Strategy of the Labor Statistics Development in the CIS Region that was supported by CIS NSOs.

11. This Strategy proposals formed the basis for “The Development of Labor Statistics in the CIS Region” project (Project). Given that integrated regional labor market was under rapid development, and interaction among the CIS countries had intensified, there was a need to create a uniform monitoring of developments both in labor donor and recipient countries. Since the mechanism of regular and timely calculation of well-defined indicators in the CIS countries was not well established yet, such monitoring appeared to be quite complicated. There was a demand for introducing of modern data collection methods, strengthening the human capacity of the NSOs that would lead to a higher quality of information on labor market as one of the main indicators of the economic development. Accurate statistical information was essential for the development and implementation of an adequate labor market policy, monitoring and decision-making in this area during a transition period. The Project was shaped to address this challenge for a uniformed approach to all CIS countries to modernize and improve their national labor statistics through capacity building.

Links to National Strategies

12. At the time of Project preparation, the CIS countries have adopted the Strategy of Economic Development till 2020 and the Concept of the Coordinated Social and Demographic Policy of the CIS Member States. Their Governments, CIS Executive Committee and other CIS institutions increasingly needed integrated, primarily socio-demographic data by countries with a special emphasis on the labor market. In addition, a study of the CIS countries national Strategies for the Implementation of Employment Policies revealed that in many of them, the formulation of policies, their implementation and monitoring in order to achieve development goals are seriously constrained by weak and outdated databases. In this regard, exchange of high-quality information and targeted macroeconomic indicators as well as indicators on quality of life of population in the CIS countries has become critically important for monitoring and decision-making purposes.

Main Beneficiaries

13. The main beneficiaries of the project outcomes were the CIS NSOs, the government, the general public and international development partners.



- (a) NSOs: the NSO (both at central and regional levels) is the first beneficiary and stakeholder of this project, being the main producer of statistics in the countries. Related statistics units within selected Government ministries and agencies are the next beneficiaries of the project.
- (b) Policy makers and planners: policy and decision-makers in the public and private sectors rely on valid and consistent data and indicators to inform their policy decisions and monitor implementation progress. A key objective of the project was to improve the labor market data so that all interested stakeholders have more relevant data to inform their decisions.
- (c) Civil society and the public: the Project aimed to indirectly ensure that labor data are clear and available for use by different stakeholders, including academic institutions - for research, educational institutions, the Parliament and other oversight organizations, media organizations, civil society and the general public in order to hold their government accountable by having a better understanding of what has and has not been achieved.
- (d) Development partners: development partners not only help support the strengthening of the labor statistics, they are also key users of data for monitoring their programs, and for carrying out international reporting on realization of programs.

Theory of Change

14. The theory of change explains how completion of project activities produced outputs that in turn resulted in outcomes and helped achieving intended impact. In the long-term, the project supports the CIS NSOs in building the national labor statistics that is capable and has capacity to provide policy makers with timely data and advice for evidence-based decision-making, measure progress in achievement of goal set under their National Strategies and the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs).

15. The Project envisaged and accomplished the following key activities:

- development of methodological recommendations and their introduction into CIS NSOs operations, including methodology on (i) economic activity of population; (ii) employment in informal economy (in informal sector of economy and informal employment); (iii) labor migration issues within the framework - of LFS; and (iv) statistics of wages and labor cost;
- development of the system/set of statistical labor indicators and support of information exchange between the CIS countries;
- preparation and conducting the international meetings/workshops on labor statistics development issues;
- participation of specialists from CIS NSOs and CISSTAT in international conferences and other events on labor statistics;
- ensuring engagement of seasoned consultants for development of methodological recommendations; and
- translation of the Project related materials from English into Russian and from Russian into English.

16. As a result, introduction of the latest concepts, definitions and classifications in labor statistics to ensure development of consistent and comparable data sets led to broader use of international standards in methodology in the CIS countries. Introduction of new and improved statistical data sets, data collection, processing, verification, storage and disseminations methods improved labor data generation and strengthened statistical practices within the CIS NSOs. Thus, developing and improving the labor statistics methodology, introducing of modern data



collection methods, strengthening the human capacity of the NSOs that led to higher quality of labor market data. More accurate and comprehensive statistical information is becoming essential for the development and implementation of effective labor market policy, monitoring and decision-making in this area.

17. The theory of change for the Project builds on multiple assumptions which are essential to transform outputs into impact:

- a. strengthened methodological basis;
- b. continuous leadership of the CISSTAT;
- c. cooperation among the CIS NSOs;
- d. continuous capacity building through participation in the joint international events; and
- e. continuous investment in the statistical infrastructure. For the long-term sustainable impact, the CIS Governments need to develop further the results created by the project.

Project Development Objectives (PDOs)

18. The overall Project goal is to provide support to the CIS NSOs to strengthen their capacity in collection of regular labor statistical data on the basis of uniformed methodology; to enhance knowledge exchange at national and international levels and to upgrade CIS and ILO statistical databases on labor. Specific Project's objectives are:

- modernization of current labor statistics systems in the CIS countries through enhancing capacity of their national statistical services and other agencies-producers of labor data by increasing the use of modern data collection tools, international methodology, definitions, standards and classifications;
- upgrading of currently conducted surveys such as household-based labor force surveys and/or enterprise-based surveys, population census; and
- development of methodology for implementation of LFS on a regular basis, including data collection on labor migration and employment in informal sector of economy.

Key Expected Outcomes and Outcome Indicators

19. As stated in the Concept Note for the project the key expected outcomes are:

- (a) strengthened institutional capacity in the CIS countries and professional expertise of statisticians in statistical offices in data collection, analysis and dissemination of labor market statistics as an important information source for development, implementation and monitoring of labor policy and programs; and
- (b) enhanced technical capacity of national services responsible for collection of regular reliable information on labor market, including labor migration data, on the basis of modern methodology and advanced data collection practices and experiences.

20. Project interim indicators are:

- respective tools for introduction of advanced international standards in labor statistics in the CIS countries are developed by the creation of a methodological framework to organize the labor force surveys on a regular basis including the collection of data on labor migration and employment in the informal economy; and



- set of employment indicators needed for information exchange among CIS countries is developed and accessible.

Components

21. The Project components – and simultaneously the streams of work - were discussed and agreed with the CIS NSOs. It was decided that the most effective in terms of achieving the stated objectives would be the organization of work in the following areas: (a) preparation of methodological materials and recommendations; (b) translation of materials of international organizations into Russian language; (c) holding meetings of specialists of national statistical offices to discuss methodological materials and share national experiences; (d) participation in the international events on labor statistics issues.

II. OUTCOME

Assessment of Achievement of Each Objective/Outcome

22. The achievement of the PDO is aligned with progress towards the higher level of outcomes, which are supported through multiple outputs delivered under this project.

Enhancing technical capacity of national services responsible for collection of regular reliable information on labor market, including labor migration data, on the basis of modern methodology and advanced data collection practices and experiences.

23. This has been achieved through preparation of methodological documents on various aspects of labor statistics aimed at its development. Leading international experts were involved in the process of their preparation on a competitive basis. Upon proposal and agreement with the NSOs of the CIS countries, the following recommendations, comments, reviews and methodological reports were delivered:

- Recommendations for the use of methodological guidelines on the measurement of work, employment and under-utilization of labor in statistical practice, taking into account resolution of the 19th session of ICLS. Proposals were prepared for a list of statistical indicators on labor activity, employment and unemployment, under-utilization of labor, which can be obtained from the population census, sample surveys and current statistical records.
- Recommendations to improve the statistics of wages and labor costs. Taking into account international recommendations and standards proposals were prepared in order to revise the procedure for accounting of statistical indicators on wages and labor costs based on sample surveys of organizations and on maintaining current statistical accounting.
- Recommendations on measurement of time worked considering international practice. Recommendations on improving the statistical measurement of time worked were prepared considering international practice



based on international recommendations and standards.

- Review of international experience in the measurement of labor migration on the basis of sample surveys. The paper analyzes the world experience in measuring labor migration based on sample surveys and population censuses; existing differences in labor migration indicators and the methodology for their collection between the CIS countries and international standards and recommendations are analyzed; recommendations on the use of surveys and censuses as a tools for measuring labor migration in the CIS region are given; proposals on a set of questions on labor migration for sample surveys and censuses were prepared for possible use in the CIS countries, taking into account the specifics of donor countries and recipient countries of region.
- Development of innovative approaches for social and demographic sample surveys and population censuses: experience and challenges (Russian Federation as an example). The report summarizes the international experience of conducting censuses of population and sample socio-demographic surveys, taking into account modern technological solutions, and presents innovative approaches that Russia plans to use in the upcoming 2020 population census.
- Recommendations for the use of indicators of decent work in statistical practice of the CIS countries. Recommendations for the implementation of decent work indicators in the statistical practice of the Commonwealth countries were developed, ensuring comparability of data among the CIS countries themselves and with other countries of the world (economic and social aspects of decent work; employment opportunities; adequate earnings and productive work; decent working time; combination of labor, family and personal life; labor that should be abolished; stability and confidence in keeping work, equal opportunities and relationships at workplace, safe working conditions, social security, social dialogue, representation of employers and employees).
- Recommendations to improve the measurement of employment in the informal economy (in the informal sector and informal employment), taking into account decisions of the 19th session of ICLS. Recommendations on accounting of informal employment and employment in the informal sector during a selective LFS were developed. Layouts of publication tables were developed to present the results of surveys conducted to measure employment in the informal economy in the CIS countries.
- Developing tools for modular surveys within Labor Force Surveys (Labor Market) taking into account the ICLS 19th session resolution. Based on international standards and recommendations of the 19th ICLS, in the field of statistics on labor activity, employment and underutilization of labor, modular questionnaires were prepared, as well as instructions for interviewers on how to complete them in the following areas: volunteer work activities; production of goods and services for own consumption; underemployment; potential labor. The layouts of the publication tables were also developed to present the results of the LFS for additional modules.
- Recommendations for the national statistical offices of CIS countries based on the results of a sample pilot testing of additional questions and modules for measuring forms of work and underutilized labor in accordance with Resolution 1 of the 19th ICLS (with the Republic of Belarus as an example). Final report with an analysis of the results and recommendations for the national statistical offices of the CIS was prepared. It contains: a description of the pilot testing (objective, period, sample size with distribution across the territory



of the Republic of Belarus); the results of the Labor Force Survey on additional issues and modules, presented in the form of tables according to the developed Toolkit layouts; interviewers' and public perception of questionnaire questions; interviewers' perception of the developed guidance materials; list of questions requiring additional clarification for the interviewers; list of questions that caused refusals to answer; assessment of visibility and informativeness of the developed tables; specific recommendations to the specialists of national statistical offices on "embedding" additional questions and modules into the scheme of the current survey of the country's labor force.

- Comments on the draft Resolution of the 20th ICLS "On statistics of interrelations between forms of labor activity". Comments on the draft Resolution for the national statistical offices of the Commonwealth countries were prepared on the following terms: statistical units, type of authority, types of economic risk; International classification of status in employment ICSE -18; International classification of status in labor activity. The prepared materials will provide an opportunity for national statistical offices to use comments when conducting population censuses, LFS and other related statistical surveys.

Strengthened institutional capacity in the CIS countries and professional expertise of statisticians in statistical offices in data collection, analysis and dissemination of labor market statistics as an important information source for development, implementation and monitoring of labor policy and programs based on the data exchange in the region of the CIS countries

24. The main need for translated materials was expressed by the experts of the CIS NSOs regarding the resolutions of the 20th ICLS. This is due to the fact that the working languages of the ILO are English and French, all conference documents were presented in these languages, which significantly hampered the work of the CIS NSOs specialists in studying the adopted resolutions and their implementation in the statistical practice of countries. Even though the translation was non-official, it greatly facilitates the work of the CIS NSOs specialists with these documents. At the request of the national statistical offices the following documents were translated into Russian:

- Draft Resolution of the 20th ICLS on statistics of interrelations between forms of labor activity (labor relations);
- Resolution of the 20th ICLS on the methodology of the SDG Indicator 8.b.1o on youth employment;
- Resolution of the 20th ICLS on amending the resolution of the 18th ICLS on child labor statistics;
- Guidelines for the 20th ICLS on labor migration statistics; and
- Selected UNECE documents related to the methodological aspects of the upcoming census of the 2020 round and the technology for its implementation.

25. Project was hosting the thematic meetings with experts from the CIS NSOs and the participation of specialists from the CISSTAT and NSOs in the international events. Within the framework of the Project, five meetings were conducted in separate CIS countries with the participation of specialists from the CIS NSOs and international experts. Self-standing participation the CIS NSOs statisticians was organized for the 20th ICLS in Geneva as a Project closure event:

- Development of labor statistics in the CIS region: problems and prospects of information exchange (Republic of Belarus, Minsk, December 11-12, 2014);
- Problems of measuring the main indicators of the labor market and labor migration in population censuses and Labor Force Surveys (Kyrgyz Republic, Bishkek, 4-6 August 2015);



- Improvement of wages statistics and labor cost / statistical measurement of work time, taking into account international practice (Russian Federation, Moscow, 15-16 June 2016);
- Results of the implementation of the Project “Development of Labor Statistics in the CIS region” and further activities (Switzerland, Geneva, October 18-19, 2017). The meeting was held in cooperation with the Department of Statistics of the ILO.
- Measurement of migration and labor force in population censuses of the 2020 round in the CIS countries: the results of pilot censuses (Republic of Belarus, Minsk, 27-28 June 2018); and
- Organizational support (purchase of air tickets, payment for accommodation, and per diems) for the participation of specialists from the CIS NSOs in the 20th ICLS (October 10-19, 2018).

26. In total, 125 specialists from the national statistical offices of the CIS countries took part in these events. In addition to representatives of the CIS NSOs and the CIS-Stat, consultants who were directly involved in the preparation of methodological documents, as well as representatives of the ILO Department of Statistics and the expert community were accommodated to participate in the meeting and events, which significantly raised the quality level of discussions. Following the meetings, final reports were submitted containing the main results of the discussion, as well as separate instructions to the CISSTAT and recommendations to the national statistical offices of the CIS.

27. To strengthen and further develop CISTAT own capacity and ensure its leading role for the CIS countries, and in agreement with the CIS NSOs the CISSTAT specialists took part in 17 international events directly related to the Project's issues. These events were organized by the UNECE, the ILO, the Executive Committee of the CIS and other international organizations. The participation of the CISSTAT specialists in these events made it possible to inform the international statistical community about the work carried out in the CIS region aimed at improving labor statistics and to promote the experience and practice of the CIS countries among other countries of the world. Taking into consideration that the CISSTAT experts are the members of various Steering Committees and Working Groups related to labor statistics, in particular, on population censuses, migration, gender statistics, poverty measurement (UNECE), the development of labor migration standards (ILO) it became possible for them to directly participate in influencing the development directions of the relevant sectors, taking into account the interests of the CIS countries.

Overall Outcome Rating

Relevance of Objectives, Design and Implementation

28. The PDO is well-aligned with regional and national development plans for official statistics. The project was designed to support the implementation of Strategy of Economic Development till 2020 and the Concept of the Coordinated Social and Demographic Policy of the CIS Member Countries. Their Governments, CIS Executive Committee and other CIS institutions increasingly needed integrated, primarily socio-demographic data by countries with a special emphasis on the labor market. In addition, the national Strategies for the Implementation of



Employment Policies in CIS countries required significant upgrade of the quality and reliability of official labor statistics.

29. The project design consisting of three main stream of work and a rich set of activities was consistent with the PDO aligned with the CIS NSOs needs at a time of Project preparation and later. Activities supported under this project enabled the CIS NSOs to advance in production and dissemination of more reliable labor statistics adequate to international standards. They also helped in enhancing professional capacity, which is essential in moving forward. The Project design was informed and grouped on the engagement and technical support provided by the Bank and other development partners.

30. The Project implementation was relevant to the achievements of the PDO and well structured. Given the CISSTAT modest experience in implementing World Bank projects, an in-house project implementation set-up represented by the four-member Working Group did not only provide for effective project implementation, but also contributed to the CISSTAT internal capacity building in implementing recipient-executed projects.

31. All targets set by the Project have been met or overachieved with a supporting evidence provided in the last Implementation and Status Report ISR.

Justification of Overall Outcome rating - SATISFACTORY

32. The implementation of the Project “Development of the Labor Statistics in the CIS region” started right after the 19-th International Conference of the Labor Statisticians and was highly relevant as methodological recommendations developed and carried out within its framework open large-scale possibilities for CIS NSOs to improve statistical methodology in the light of decisions of this Conference.

33. Taking into account the limited budget of the project (560 thousand US dollars), it was necessary to create a Procurement Plan that would allow the most efficient use of the funds to achieve the objectives, while ensuring a proportional and balanced combination of the three components of the Project. In general, the redirection of funds and savings in certain areas allowed for additional, initially not envisaged work, both in terms of preparing methodological materials and translating individual documents into Russian and conducting meetings.

34. The Project has achieved listed outcome, while supporting significant the improvements of the labor statistics in the CIS region. While addressing the agreed and most pressing needs of the CIS NSOs it also catalyzed the ILO and governments interest and understanding of the importance of statistics. Project objectives and design remained substantially relevant, implementation was successful, including full disbursement of funds; project efficacy and efficiency were substantial. Based on the above, the project deserves a “satisfactory” overall outcome rating. This rating is the same as the one given in the last ISR completed on January 15, 2019.

Other Outcomes and Impacts

35. The Project intervention allowed to achieve smoother transformation of labor statistics. Improvements in the state of labor statistics in the CIS countries are supported by the international evidence, namely – ILO’s official view



on developing the methodology. The effectiveness of the work as per preparation of the methodology aimed at the introduction of the 19-th ICLS decisions into the CIS statistical practice as well as the importance of the pilot testing of the developed toolkit were highlighted in the General Report delivered by the ILO during the 20-th ICLS (International Labor Office, Geneva, ICLS/20/2018/1, cl.73).

36. The decision of the Belarus NSO (Belstat) to carry out the pilot testing of the toolkit developed for the certain modules of the Labor Force Survey was extremely important and initially unplanned. Belstat also bore the necessary additional costs and solved all organizational issues. Thus, the pilot testing in the framework of the LFS in the Republic of Belarus and the recommendations prepared for other CIS NSOs based upon its results together with its further discussions helped the statistical offices in its implementation in their countries. This was also an example of the strong ownership of the joint work for improving the labor statistics and its introduction into regular practice of the NSOs.

37. The conference to take stock of results and to assess implementation of Development of Labor Statistics in the CIS region project was organized by CISSTAT Committee in cooperation with the ILO Department of Statistics. Senior management and labor experts from the CIS NSOs (Azerbaijan, Armenia, Belarus, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyz Republic, Moldova, Russia, Tajikistan, Uzbekistan), representatives of the ILO Department of Statistics, the World Bank, the UNECE Statistical Division, the Statistics Department of the Eurasian Economic Commission, the CIS STATCOM participated in the conference and agreed that:

- The project was an important effort in improving labor statistics in CIS countries in accordance with modern international standards and criteria. The entire range of activities undertaken are contributing to strengthening the capacity of the national statistical offices of CIS countries and providing them with practical assistance in implementing the recommendations of the 19th ICLS.
- The subject areas for methodological improvements were proposed by the CIS NSOs. Terms of reference for the preparation of methodological materials were coordinated with them and approved by the senior management of CIS STATCOM. The selection of consultants was done on a competitive basis.
- The methodological materials were developed at a high professional level and can be directly applied into the statistical practices of CIS countries.
- An important feature of the project is the developing and testing of tools for measuring forms of work and labor underutilization. This work, done with active support from National Statistical Committee of the Republic of Belarus, was successful. It confirmed the validity of the developed tools for use in conducting labor force surveys in CIS countries. Based on the results of testing, recommendations were made for respective CIS NSOs.
- The agendas of regional meetings held under the project were relevant. Consultants invited to support the discussions of the prepared methodological materials helped NSOs specialists identify critical implementation aspects of the methodology suggested. This interaction, combined with the sharing of country experiences, made it possible to focus on finding practical solutions to pressing issues related to the development of labor statistics.
- CIS NSOs have made significant progress on the harmonization of labor statistics with modern international standards.

38. No negative unintended outcomes were observed.



III. KEY FACTORS THAT AFFECTED IMPLEMENTATION AND OUTCOME

Implementation Arrangements

39. To assist the CISSTAT in the project implementation contracts with a procurement consultant, a financial consultant and a translator were concluded for the entire duration of the Project. All of them had sufficient knowledge and experience in World Bank project implementation. Together with the CISSTAT Working group they played an instrumental role in coordinating the implementation of project activities.

40. To organize the payment of per diems Subsidiary Grants agreements were concluded with Statistical Committees of Armenia, Republic of Belarus, Kyrgyzstan, Moldova, Tajikistan, Uzbekistan, Ukraine and Committee on Statistics of the Ministry of National Economy of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The CISSTAT received a refuse from the NSOs of Azerbaijan and Turkmenistan to its proposal to conclude the Subgrant Agreement with them for the entire duration of the Project.

41. Since 2016, representatives of the State Statistics Service of Ukraine have ceased to participate in events planned under the Project. In 2018, financial resources that were not spent on the participation of employees of the NSO of Ukraine were used for the participation of employees of the rest of the NSOs of the CIS countries.

42. The cost of the Project was originally set at USD 490, 000 for the period of 2014-2017. On March 28, 2017, upon the CISSTAT request and after the ECASTAT Steering Committee approval an amendment to the Grant Agreement was signed with a purpose of (i) Closing Date extension to December 31, 2018 and (ii) additional financing that increased the grant funds up to USD 560,000 to develop some additional methodological papers, to translate the main resolutions of 20th ICLS into Russian and to ensure the participation of representatives of the CIS NSOs in the 20th ICLS (October 2018). This was the only Project restructuring during its implementation.

Disbursement

43. The project has disbursed USD 557,623 or 99.6% of grant funds.

Monitoring and Evaluation: Design, Implementation and Utilization

44. The Monitoring Indicators gave the ECASTAT and the Bank team a tool in monitoring and evaluating the project progress. This in turn impacted outcomes of the project by providing timely information on the progress and achievements needed for further actions from the implementing agency and the world bank team sides.

Safeguard and Fiduciary Compliance

45. The project focused on capacity building of the CIS NSOs and CISSTAT. The Project did not have



any direct environmental or social impacts. Nor there were any civil works. No safeguard issues emanated during the implementation. The environmental rating C given to the project at the appraisal stage remained the same throughout the project implementation.

46. The Project was on track from the very beginning. There were no outstanding audit reports. Both project financial management and procurement are satisfactory to the Bank. Performance of the CISSTAT has been satisfactory. The final audit opinion and management letter for the Project was submitted to the Bank on April 30, 2019.

47. The Procurement Post Review of the project rated the procurement process under the project as satisfactory. Procurement activities under the project were completed before the project closing date.

IV. BANK PERFORMANCE, COMPLIANCE ISSUES, AND RISK TO DEVELOPMENT OUTCOME

Bank Performance

48. The World Bank team involved in the project preparation and implementation process made for a good mix of prior experience in implementing similar projects, substantial country experience, good project management skills and strong leadership to support the project. The Bank team liaised closely with the client at preparation stage and actively monitored project implementation, which allowed to act proactively and highlight potential implementation risks and propose possible solutions. Though the TTL was based at HQ, the procurement support and financial management were provided by the team member from the Moscow office – together with regular missions this allowed for more frequent interactions with the client, reduced response time, allowed for better synergies with other parts of the Bank program and reduced language barrier.

Quality of Supervision

49. The quality of supervision was maintained at the adequate level throughout the project implementation. The number of team members involved in the supervision, including two TTL, local FM and procurement specialists, remained stable and allowed to perform supervision activities in a timely manner, provide prompt advice and assistance to ECASTAT in resolving urgent or pending issues. The CISSTAT benefitted from gaining experience in fiduciary issues and international principles of financial management and procurement guiding the project implementation.

Risks for sustainability

50. Sustainable financing. Sustainability of capacity building and statistical infrastructure investments is based on client ownership and a commitment of the government to mobilize financial support to the NSO. Through the results achieved under the Project, coordination among development partners and NSOs has improved and support to the budget—or, at least, specific activities in the future-- has increased.



51. Institutional stability. Wide Project coverage which involved the Governments and NSOs of eleven CIS countries is the major potential risk for sustainability of results. The economic trends and social conditions are different in the CIS countries, and there is always a lack of uniform approach to address the similar issues.

52. Capacity of public sector. High staff turnover triggered by low wages in the public sector in CIS countries, and in the CIS NSOs, undermine the sustainability of capacity building and effectiveness of workshops conducted. Prepared methodological recommendations and established standards mitigate the negative impact of high staff turnover.

V. LESSONS LEARNED AND RECOMMENDATIONS

53. Lessons learned could be summarized as follows: (i) to maximize involvement of client's team and potential beneficiaries from the very beginning of the project preparation; (ii) to broaden participation of data users in related project activities not limiting the audience to statisticians only.



ANNEX 1. RESULTS FRAMEWORK AND KEY OUTPUTS

A. RESULTS INDICATORS

A.1 PDO Indicators

Objective/Outcome: The overall Project goal is to provide support to the CIS national statistical offices to strengthen their capacity in collection of regular labor statistical data on the basis of uniformed methodolog

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Development of uniformed methodology for statistical services in CIS countries	Text	NO 26-Feb-2014	YES 31-Mar-2017	YES 31-Dec-2018	YES 31-Dec-2018

Comments (achievements against targets):

Consistent methodological recommendations and guidelines are developed for producing labor statistics in the CIS region. Supporting evidence: recommendations developed for (i) use of methodological guidelines on the measurement of work, employment and underutilization of labor in statistical practice, taking into account resolution of the 19th ICLS; (ii) statistics of wages and labor costs and on measurement of time worked considering international practice; (iii) translation into Russian and dissemination of Resolution on methodology of the SDG indicator 8.b.1 on youth employment; resolution to amend the 18th ICLS Resolution concerning statistics of child labor; Guidelines on statistics on international labor migration.



Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Use of modern data collection tools, international methodology, definitions, standards and classifications	Text	NO 26-Feb-2014	YES 31-Mar-2017	YES 31-Dec-2018	YES 31-Dec-2018

Comments (achievements against targets):

Modern data collection tools, international methodology, definitions, standards and classifications are developed, translated and disseminated among the CIS countries NSOs. Supporting evidence: (i) Developed tools for modular surveys within Labor Force Survey taking into account the ICLS 19th session resolution; (ii) report on Development of innovative approaches for social and demographic sample surveys and population censuses: experience and challenges (Russian Federation as an example); (iii) recommendations for the use of indicators of decent work in statistical practice of the CIS countries; (iv) recommendations for the national statistical offices of CIS countries based on the results of a sample pilot testing of additional questions and modules for measuring some types of work and underutilized labor in accordance with Resolution 1 of the 19th ICLS (with Republic of Belarus as an example).

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Data collection on labor migration and employment including informal economy (labor migration and employment methodology are improved)	Text	NO 26-Feb-2014	YES 31-Mar-2017	YES 31-Dec-2018	YES 31-Dec-2018

Comments (achievements against targets):



Improved labor migration and employment methodology are used by in the CIS region in accordance with international standards identified. Supporting evidence: (i) Generalization of international experience in the measurement of labor migration on the basis of sample surveys; (ii) recommendations to improve the measurement of employment in the informal economy (in the informal sector and informal employment), taking into account decisions of the 19th session of ICLS.

A.2 Intermediate Results Indicators

Component: Part 1: Provision of consultants' services to develop labor statistics and methodologies to meet international standards

Component: Part 2: Provision of consultants' services for data generation and introduction of international standards

Component: Part 3: Organization of stakeholder discussions and workshops to enhance knowledge and skills of statistical staff of the CIS Countries and disseminate new methodologies; including provision of sub-gr

Unlinked Indicators

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Development of methodological materials on various issues of labor statistics	Number	0.00 26-Feb-2014	8.00 31-Mar-2017	8.00 31-Dec-2018	8.00 31-Dec-2018

Comments (achievements against targets):



Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Organization of stakeholder discussions and workshops to enhance knowledge and skills of statistical staff in the CIS Countries	Number	0.00	6.00	5.00	6.00
		26-Feb-2014	31-Mar-2017	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2018
Number of CIS statisticians "enhanced"	Text	0	159	NOT LESS THAN 120	159
		26-Feb-2014	31-Mar-2017	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2018
Comments (achievements against targets):					

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Dissemination of the developed methodological materials and training programs on the website of CISSTAT Committee to advance CIS NSOs knowledge and strengthen practical experience	Text	NO	YES	YES	YES
		26-Feb-2014	31-Mar-2017	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2018
Comments (achievements against targets): http://www.cisstat.com/CIS_Labourstat/					

Indicator Name	Unit of	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised	Actual Achieved at
----------------	---------	----------	-----------------	------------------	--------------------



	Measure			Target	Completion
Strengthening capacity of the CISSTAT Committee to provide technical assistance in labor statistics	Text	0	65	NOT LESS THAN 55	65
		26-Feb-2014	31-Mar-2017	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2018
Comments (achievements against targets): Participation of the CISSTAT Committee experts in international conferences and workshops, discussions of the CIS countries NSOs					



B. ORGANIZATION OF THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PDO

Objective/Outcome 1	
Outcome Indicators	Enhancing technical capacity of national services responsible for collection of regular reliable information on labor market, including labor migration data, on the basis of modern methodology and advanced data collection practices and experiences.
Intermediate Results Indicators	Preparation of methodological documents on various aspects of labor statistics aimed at its development. Discussions of the materials and papers prepared with international experts and agreement on the recommendations provided by CISSTAT.
Key Outputs by Component (linked to the achievement of the Objective/Outcome 1)	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Recommendations for the use of methodological guidelines on the measurement of work, employment and under-utilization of labor in statistical practice.2. Recommendations to improve the statistics of wages and labor costs; Recommendations on measurement of time worked considering international practice.3. Review of international experience in the measurement of labor migration on the basis of sample surveys.4. Development of innovative approaches for social and demographic sample surveys and population censuses (Russian Federation as an example).5. Recommendations for the use of indicators of decent work in statistical practice of the CIS countries.6. Recommendations to improve the measurement of employment in the informal economy (in the informal sector and informal employment).7. Developed tools for modular surveys within Labor Force Surveys.



	<p>8. Recommendations for the national statistical offices of CIS countries based on the results of a sample pilot testing of additional questions and modules for measuring forms of work and underutilized labor.</p>
Objective/Outcome 2	
Outcome Indicators	<p>Strengthened institutional capacity in the CIS countries and professional expertise of statisticians in statistical offices in data collection, analysis and dissemination of labor market statistics as an important information source for development, implementation and monitoring of labor policy and programs based on the data exchange in the region of the CIS countries</p>
Intermediate Results Indicators	<p>Thematic meetings with statisticians from the CIS NSOs, participation of specialists from the CISSTAT and international experts. Participation of CIS NSOs and CISSTAT staff in the international events, including conferences, seminars and workshops.</p>
Key Outputs by Component (linked to the achievement of the Objective/Outcome 2)	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Development of labor statistics in the CIS region: problems and prospects of information exchange (Republic of Belarus, Minsk, December 11-12, 2014).2. Problems of measuring the main indicators of the labor market and labor migration in population censuses and Labor Force Surveys (Kyrgyz Republic, Bishkek, 4-6 August 2015).3. Improvement of wages statistics and labor cost / statistical measurement of work time, taking into account international practice (Russian Federation, Moscow, 15-16 June 2016).4. Results of the implementation of the Project “Development of Labor Statistics in the CIS region” and further activities (Switzerland, Geneva, October 18-19, 2017). The meeting was held in cooperation with the Department of Statistics of the ILO.



- | | |
|--|--|
| | <p>5. Measurement of migration and labor force in population censuses of the 2020 round in the CIS countries: the results of pilot censuses (Republic of Belarus, Minsk, 27-28 June 2018).</p> <p>6. Organizational support (purchase of air tickets, payment for accommodation, and per diems) for the participation of specialists from the CIS NSOs in the 20th ICLS (October 10-19, 2018).</p> |
|--|--|



ANNEX 2. PROJECT COST BY COMPONENT

Components	Amount at Approval (US\$M)	Actual at Project Closing (US\$M)	Percentage of Approval (US\$M)
Total	0.49	0.56	114



ANNEX 3. RECIPIENT, CO-FINANCIER AND OTHER PARTNER/STAKEHOLDER COMMENTS

Comments summarized by Project Task Team Leader Olga Shabalina based on her discussions with CISSTAT and several CIS NSOs colleagues during the Bank team missions:

1. To develop the survey tools, basic set of terms and definitions used in statistical practice to measure economic activity, employment and unemployment, the CIS countries have adopted international standards - ILO' recommendations on labor statistics (1985) and resolutions of International Conferences of Labor Statisticians on statistics of the economically active population, employment, unemployment and underemployment (1982), on statistics of employment in the informal sector (1993), on international classification of status in employment (1993), on measurement of underemployment and inadequate employment situations (1998), on interpretation of extended absence from work in employment and unemployment statistics (1998); and guidelines for a statistical definition of employment in the informal sector (2003).
2. The Project helped to significantly strengthen the statistical capacity of the CIS NSOs by means of development of methodological materials which were adapted to the existing particularities of the CIS countries (this was a mandatory condition of all the Terms of References for the development of the methodological papers and documents) based upon the modern recommendations and standards and broad discussions among the CIS NSOs which facilitated the strengthening of their capacity. This reflected in the relatively rapid pace of innovations adopted by the 19-th ICLS in LFS and the extension of the list of indicators of labor statistics which the CIS NSOs started to actively introduce into its statistical practice. This is especially significant taking into consideration that a number of indications with a certain level of disaggregation are included in the Global List of Indicators of the SDG monitoring.
3. In the opinion of CIS NSOs specialists, all the prepared methodological materials are very highly developed. Its direct implementation into the statistical practice of the countries will not need additional efforts. The majority of the methodological works carried out in accordance with the Project passed the procedure of consideration and discussion during the meetings of the CISSTAT Scientific Commission and/or the meeting of the CIS NSOs specialists.
4. All the CIS NSOs were involved in the work on the Project (except for the Ukrainian colleagues after 2016; their representatives took part in the preparation of the TORs on the methodological works, addressed the meetings with the presentations and reports, participated in the discussions. As the result of the Project's implementation the interpersonal connections between the CIS NSOs labor statisticians improved which will facilitates the exchange of the national experience further.
5. The decision of the NSO of the Belarus (Belstat) to carry out the pilot testing of the toolkit developed for the certain modules of the Labor Force Survey was very important. Belstat also bore necessary costs and solved all organizational issues. Thus, the pilot testing in the framework of the LFS in the Republic of Belarus and the recommendations prepared for the CIS NSOs based upon its results together with its further discussion helped the statistical offices in its implementation in their countries.



6. The work on the Project resulted in a revision of the CISSTAT questionnaires on the labor market taking into account new standards and definitions based upon which the statistical offices provide the national data about the CIS countries. Using this data set the CISSTAT enlarged the volume of information presented in its publications, made the appropriate adjustments in the indications of the Monitoring of the labor market which is carried out by the CISSTAT.

7. Using the prepared recommendations, a set of questions for measuring migration and the labor market during the population censuses of the 2020 round was formed and agreed upon with the CIS NSOs. The results of population censuses obtained upon a unified methodology and within the close terms of their conduct will provide all information users with comparable and relevant information on the state of the national labor markets of the CIS member States, as well as on the volumes and flows of migrants within the Commonwealth region.

8. All methodological documents developed and translated within the framework of the Project, meeting materials, as well as additional information related to labor statistics and the Project implementation, were posted on a specially created webpage of the CIS-Stat website.



ANNEX 4. SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS (IF ANY)

http://www.cisstat.com/CIS_Laborstat/