Brazil Learning Initiative (SoD Hub) (P148845)

LATIN AMERICA AND CARIBBEAN | Brazil | Social Protection & Labor  Global Practice  |
Institutional Development Fund| FY 2014 |Seq No: 3 | ARCHIVED on 17-Aug-2017 | ISR29195 |
Implementing Agencies: IPEA - Instituto de Pesquisa Econômica Aplicada, International Policy Center for Inclusive Growth - IPC, Ministério do Desenvolvimento Social

Key Dates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Project Dates</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bank Approval Date:</td>
<td>05-Feb-2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned Mid Term Review Date:</td>
<td>01-Mar-2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Original Closing Date:</td>
<td>23-Dec-2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effectiveness Date:</td>
<td>03-Feb-2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Actual Mid-Term Review Date:</td>
<td>24-Feb-2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revised Closing Date:</td>
<td>23-Dec-2017</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Project Development Objectives

Project Development Objective (from IDF Proposal)
The development objective of the IDF grant is to stimulate innovation and dissemination of approaches to address key delivery challenges in the area of social policy (including productive inclusion and social assistance) across sub-national entities in Brazil and strengthen the Government capacity to fulfill its goals of promoting systematic learning and innovation in Brazil and effective knowledge sharing with other countries. This will be achieved by supporting the Government fulfilling the following goals of its newly established Brazil Learning Initiative for a World Without Poverty (one of the Science Delivery Hubs): (i) Systematically documenting the design, implementation and management instruments and arrangements of social policy in Brazil, including by subnational governments, through short notes, reports and multimedia material, with a focus on the Brasil Sem Miséria Plan, productive inclusion, social assistance, the food acquisition program and the cisterns program; (ii) Disseminating and facilitating access to information about social policy in Brazil through a dedicated webpage, document repository, newsletters, knowledge exchange activities, and online learning material; and (iii) Compiling and sharing international experience in the area of social policy and productive inclusion with the support of continuous improvement of policies and programs in Brazil.

Has the Project Development Objective been changed since Board Approval of the Project Objective?
No

Components

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Capturing &amp; consolidating knowledge on implementation of social assistance &amp; poverty reduction programs</td>
<td>$469000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More effective knowledge exchange within Brazil and between Brazil and other Countries</td>
<td>$131000.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall Ratings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Previous Rating</th>
<th>Current Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Progress towards achievement of PDO</td>
<td>● Satisfactory</td>
<td>● Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Implementation Progress (IP)</td>
<td>● Satisfactory</td>
<td>● Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Risk Rating</td>
<td>● Low</td>
<td>● Low</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The IDF Grant Agreement was signed on December 23, 2014 and became effective on February 3, 2015. The team worked with partners from the Brazilian government (MDS and IPEA) and UN agency (UNDP’s International Policy Centre for Inclusive Growth IPC-IG), to develop a detailed work plan. Below is a summary of the progress made to date:

Regarding the first objective of the WWP which is “Systematically documenting the design, implementation and management instruments and arrangements of social policy in Brazil,” the WWP has developed key materials focused on the Bolsa Familia program (BF), Cadastro Único and Brasil sem Miséria (BSM) strategy, as well as other knowledge materials on a number of specific issues including:

- **Short notes** on BF, Cadastro Único, BSM, Conditionalities of BF, Monitoring and Evaluation, amongst other topics. For each thematic Newsletter issued, the WWP team has produced Short notes in Portuguese, English and Spanish to explain the main issues and implementation features of the Brazil's social programs. All these materials were recently translated into French to reach out Francophone Africa.

- **Case studies on sub-national best practices.** States and municipalities play a critical role in the implementation of social programs, and are in some cases responsible for developing and implementing innovative poverty reduction programs that complement federal efforts. Case studies on sub-national best practices were developed together with the SoD WB and WWP teams. Currently, there are four case studies delivered in the form of reports and a video on local Brazilian productive inclusion experiences.

The WWP has also achieved important results regarding its second objective – disseminating and facilitating access to information about social policy in Brazil through a dedicated webpage, document repository, newsletters, knowledge exchange activities, and online learning material by using social media – by continuously improving its dissemination channels and actively participating in international events. The channels include:

- **Website:** The WWP website has established itself as a repository of knowledge products, doubling its readership each year. In 2016, WWP publications and presentations have registered 111,510 downloads, an 108% increase against the previous years, which had already registered a 114% boost when compared to 2014 (24,890 downloads), totaling around 200,000 downloads worldwide since March 2014. Considering the website audience alone (internal pages, not PDF publications), page views have increased steadily, indicating that readers are more interested in navigating through content: from 92,650 page views in 2015 to 112,680 in 2016 (22%). It is interesting to put these numbers side by side with other initiatives that publish social protection content, such as UNDP’s International Policy Centre for Inclusive Growth (IPC-IG). Although IPC-IG was launched in 2004, and has an accumulated database of a considerably larger number of monthly publications in more languages, the WWP’s website audience is catching up in terms of views. While IPC-IG registered 51,822 sessions (visits) in 2016, the WWP’s website registered 22,744. In addition, the Centre’s page views totaled 124,499, close to the 112,680 views totaled by the WWP’s website.

- **New Website:** Released in March 2017 – will likely boost the WWP audience reach given the latest improvements which include: the adoption of new categorizations for publications and videos, a revamped research tool, a more responsive format (adaptable to mobiles and tablets) and a more user-friendly interface. All these website improvements are likely to please researchers and technology oriented users. However, the greatest improvement, is not visible: the new website follows modern SEO (Search Engine Optimization) strategies, i.e., is correctly programmed to appear and be visible to online search engines, unlike the precedent website. All these improvements have already contributed to WWP's website reaching its record audience during its first month of release: 2,520 unique visitors in March 2017, a 61% increase compared to February, and 195% compared to March of previous year. This positive accomplishment is likely to become more evident in subsequent months.

- **Newsletters:** The WWP Newsletters has been issued on a quarterly basis since FY15, and the total subscribers as of February 2017 are 956. The majority have subscribed in Portuguese (626), followed by English (262) and then Spanish (68). The most significant item to determine levels of engagement is the open rate, which is essentially, how many people have opened or viewed the Newsletter. The average open rate of the eleven editions in all languages is 40%, indicating that the email message has a reading rate above the average of the market. According to MailChimp, one of the leading e-mail marketing suppliers in the world, e-mail engagement rates vary between 25% and 29% depending on the company size. Monthly subscribers’ growth rates can increase up to 5-10% when WWP participates in International events, like the MDS’ XI International Seminar (May 2016).

- **Webinars:** These are powerful tools to boost knowledge sharing with other nations, in particular with policy makers from Colombia, Mexico and Senegal who participated in virtual seminars during FY16-FY17 to address different Social Protection themes jointly with Brazilian practitioners. Four meetings have resulted in 835 people registered and 371 attendees during the same period. Webinars were carried out in English, Spanish and French, helping to successfully boost WWP's presence in other regions. The Senegal webinar, for instance, regarding food security, had 47% of participants from Sub-Saharan Africa, while the one with Colombia boosted the presence of Latin Americans (60%). It is important to note that the partnership with the knowledge sharing platform socialprotection.org has helped to increase webinars’ outreach and technical quality.

- **Multimedia content:** The WWP maintains a multi-language YouTube Channel since the second quarter of 2016, which has published 25 videos during FY16-FY17 in English, Portuguese, Spanish and French (subtitled). All videos descriptions and titles are also translated into the same four languages, so the channel is only viewed in the user’s original language configuration. Until March 2017, the channel registered around 3,000 views.
and 8,600 minutes of watching time. Average view duration was particularly high for Case Study videos: the rural technical assistance experience and grant from Bahia registered 4:08 minutes by user on average, an excellent mark for internet multimedia content. Another productive inclusion experience of Bahia, this time from Salvador, registered more than 1,000 views (March 2017). During FY16-FY17 the release of a new video on the WWP Quick Questions series took place, with Argentina exchanging knowledge with Brazil on Monitoring and Evaluation. It is important to note as well that WWP will produce an exclusive infographic on Brazil’s social protection system during 2017, based on the frequent demand of international delegations visiting the country.

- **Social media:** WWP has used partners’ social media since its beginning (Facebook and Twitter) to disseminate knowledge products and participate in awareness campaigns on commemorative dates, reaching around 2.2 thousand “likes” and 1.3 thousand “shares” on Facebook in the second semester of 2016, even when posts were published only once a week. A short video for the International Day for the Eradication of Poverty last October engaged 314 people, including Twitter and Facebook interactions.

There has been less emphasis on the WWP’s third objective of compiling and sharing international experience. To date, most of the WWP activities have focused on “exporting” knowledge and experience of Brazil’s successes to the international audience. The various mechanisms by which the WWP would help “import” international knowledge and experience from other countries to support learning in Brazil, or serve as a platform for broader exchange of international social protection experiences, has been less precise. Nonetheless, some activities were developed in addition to the ongoing activities. During FY16/FY17 two international knowledge exchange seminars on challenges for ending poverty and capacity building took place as described below:

1. **The International Seminar on Database and Information Systems Integration for Public Policy Improvement** (April 2016). This seminar brought together around 150 experts and representatives of Brazilian and international government teams to discuss the institutional, technological and contextual aspects of the sharing of expertise on databases and data systems between government sectors. The primary purpose of the seminar was to improve citizens’ access to public policies and the diagnosis of individual needs, enhancing procedures for better control and quality of public spending. The seminar, by invitation only, featured lectures by experts from five countries with successful experiences of integrating and using administrative records and information systems. The seminar provided knowledge on international experiences that enabled the area responsible for the Cadastro Único to finalize a proposal for the integration of databases of program users of the Cadastro Único. Currently, the Cadastro Único network of user programs awaits its formal constitution, with the publication of a Presidential Decree and the launch of a Portal that will allow its operation. The WWP intends to support the consolidation of this network with another workshop planned to be held in December 2017. As part of the interoperability of social protection systems, the workshop will allow for greater interaction between the different social database administrators in Brazil, continuing on a promising discussion agenda.

2. **The Pan-Amazon Seminar** (March 2017). This seminar aimed to debate regional experiences on the implementation of poverty reduction policies for the Amazon region and to bring forth an agenda of integrating sustainable development into social policies. The agenda included the participation of Guyana, Colombia, Ecuador and Peru. The event included field visits to Brazilian programs for social assistance services SUAS, the social registry Cadastro Único and PAA and Cisterns for rural productive inclusion. Previously, several preparatory technical discussions (VCs) with participants’ countries were organized to help determine the agenda of the event.

3. **Science of Delivery Learning course** (26-28 April 2017). The training course enabled government officials, in Brazil to participate of a training to document and share experiences on how implementers address delivery challenges by applying a set of common guidelines and language in creating SoD ‘cases’. The training was delivered through a blended learning program that combined a self-paced Massive Open Online Course (MOOC) and face-to-face workshop in Brasilia. It was carried out in partnership with the National School of Brazilian Government Administration (ENAP) and the Global Delivery Initiative (GDI) from the WBG.

### Risks

#### Systematic Operations Risk-rating Tool

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Risk Category</th>
<th>Rating at Approval</th>
<th>Previous Rating</th>
<th>Current Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Political and Governance</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macroeconomic</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sector Strategies and Policies</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Design of Project or Program</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category</td>
<td>Implementation Status</td>
<td>Sustainability</td>
<td>Fiduciary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Results**

**Indicators**

1. **Case studies and knowledge products produced and available on WWP website**
   - **Value**
     - Baseline: 0.00
     - Actual (Previous): 2.00
     - Actual (Current): 4.00
     - End Target: 4.00
   - **Date**
     - Baseline: 31-Dec-2014
     - Actual (Previous): 31-May-2016
     - Actual (Current): 01-Jun-2017
     - End Target: 01-Dec-2017

2. **Number of downloads or visualizations of publications from WWP site (average over previous three months)**
   - **Value**
     - Baseline: 2,623.00
     - Actual (Previous): 8,552.00
     - Actual (Current): 9,235.00
     - End Target: 7,000.00
   - **Date**
     - Baseline: 31-Dec-2014
     - Actual (Previous): 30-Apr-2016
     - Actual (Current): 01-Jun-2017
     - End Target: 01-Dec-2017

3. **Number of visits to WWP website (average over previous three months)**
   - **Value**
     - Baseline: 1,671.00
     - Actual (Previous): 1,300.00
     - Actual (Current): 2,278.00
     - End Target: 2,600.00
   - **Date**
     - Baseline: 31-Dec-2014
     - Actual (Previous): 30-Apr-2016
     - Actual (Current): 01-Jun-2017
     - End Target: 01-Dec-2017

4. **Short videos produced and available on WWP website**
   - **Baseline**
   - **Actual (Previous)**
   - **Actual (Current)**
   - **End Target**
Data on Financial Performance

Disbursements (by loan)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project</th>
<th>Loan/Credit/TF</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Currency</th>
<th>Original</th>
<th>Revised</th>
<th>Cancelled</th>
<th>Disbursed</th>
<th>Undisbursed</th>
<th>Disbursed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P148845</td>
<td>TF-16605</td>
<td>Effective</td>
<td>USD</td>
<td>0.60</td>
<td>0.60</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.52</td>
<td>0.08</td>
<td>86%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Key Dates (by loan)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project</th>
<th>Loan/Credit/TF</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Approval Date</th>
<th>Signing Date</th>
<th>Effectiveness Date</th>
<th>Orig. Closing Date</th>
<th>Rev. Closing Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Restructuring History

There has been no restructuring to date.

Related Project(s)

There are no related projects.